



# THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

VOLUME 24 • NUMBER 1 • JANUARY 2025



**Editor:** Brian M. Ingrassia, West Texas A&M University  
**Book Review Editor:** Daniel Platt, University of Illinois Springfield  
**Editorial Assistant:** Gabe Martinez, West Texas A&M University  
**Founding Editor, 2000–2003:** Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University  
**Editor, 2004–2014:** Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University  
**Editors, 2013–2018:** Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago  
 Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois Chicago  
**Editors, 2017–2020:** Boyd Cothran, York University  
 C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa, George Mason University  
**Editors, 2020–2022:** Boyd Cothran, York University  
 Rosanne Currarino, Queen's University  
**Editor, 2022–2024:** Rosanne Currarino, Queen's University

### Editorial Board

|  |  |
|--|--|
| Robert David Bland<br>University of Tennessee, Knoxville | Julia Guarnieri<br>Cambridge University              |
| Gregg Cantrell<br>Texas Christian University             | Katie M. Hemphill<br>University of Arizona           |
| Constance Chen<br>Loyola Marymount University            | Logan S. Istre<br>Louisiana State University         |
| Michael Patrick Cullinane<br>Dickinson State University  | Andrew Offenburger<br>Miami University               |
| Lawrence Culver<br>Utah State University                 | Jeanne Petit<br>Hope College                         |
| Sara Egge<br>Centre College                              | Karen Phoenix<br>Washington State University         |
| Douglas Flowe<br>Washington University in St. Louis      | John Troutman<br>National Museum of American History |
| Lawrence B. Glickman<br>Cornell University               | Andrea L. Turpin<br>Baylor University                |

Chris McKeen, *ex officio*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *America: History and Life*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Scopus*, and in the Thompson Reuters *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, and *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, [www.jstor.org](http://www.jstor.org), with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact [hamlinka@miamioh.edu](mailto:hamlinka@miamioh.edu) or go to <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 24, 2025, are \$296.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £194.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$182.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £115.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$50.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$50.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is £20/\$25 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$400.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: [psc@periodicals.com](mailto:psc@periodicals.com)

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* accepts manuscript submissions through the Scholar One Manuscripts system at <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jgape>. Please note that we do not accept submissions via postal mail. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained at <https://www.shgape.org/journal/>.

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2025. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com), email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested.

The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era  
Volume 24 • Number 1 • January 2025

CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| EDITOR'S NOTE  | 1   |
| SHGAPE DISTINGUISHED HISTORIAN ADDRESS   |     |
| LAURA F. EDWARDS, Women's Property and the Downward Spiral into Fraud:<br>Questioning the Persistent Narrative of Progress in Women's Legal Status             | 3   |
| ARTICLES   |     |
| AVA PURKISS, A Paradox of Pleasure: Black Joy during "the Nadir," 1875–1905  | 21  |
| HANNAH ALMS, "The Old Order Changeth": A Favorite Servant Contest and the Debate<br>about Domestic Work in Washington, D.C.                                    | 38  |
| RONNY REGEV, On Patrons and Shoppers: Representations of Consumer Culture in the<br>Black Press from 1890 to 1920  | 55  |
| HISTORIOGRAPHICAL ESSAY  |     |
| LOGAN S. ISTRE, The Enigma of San Francisco: Henry George and the Historians   | 73  |
| BOOK REVIEWS   |     |
| KATHRYN HUGHES, <i>Catland: Louis Wain and the Great Cat Mania</i><br>(Andrea L. Smalley)  | 93  |
| GIULIANA PERRONE, <i>Nothing More than Freedom: The Failure of Abolition in<br/>American Law</i><br>(Jonathan Lande)   | 95  |
| AYELET BRINN, <i>A Revolution in Type: Gender and the Making of the American<br/>Yiddish Press</i><br>(Ronnie Grinberg)  | 97  |
| SHANNON M. RISK, <i>The Life and Times of Elizabeth Upham Yates: A Crusader for<br/>Women's Suffrage, Temperance, and Missionary Work</i><br>(Paula K. Hinton) | 99  |
| KAREN COOK BELL, ED., <i>Southern Black Women and Their Struggle for Freedom during<br/>the Civil War and Reconstruction</i><br>(Shennette Garrett-Scott)      | 102 |

**On the cover:** African American women seated on steps of building at Atlanta University, Georgia, circa 1899. Photograph from album compiled by W. E. B. Du Bois for display at the Exposition Universelle in Paris, 1900. Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division, Washington, D.C. (Digital ID: ppmsca 08778 //hdl.loc.gov/loc.pnp/ppmsca.08778)

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| DANIEL ROBERT, <i>Courteous Capitalism: Public Relations and the Monopoly Problem 1900–1930</i><br>(Peter Labuza)                         | 105 |
| RACHEL MORGAN, <i>Sins of the Shovel: Looting, Murder, and the Evolution of American Archaeology</i><br>(Lukas B. Rieppel)                | 107 |
| MARK A. LAUSE, <i>Counterfeiting Labor's Voice: William A. A. Carsey and the Shaping of American Reform Politics</i><br>(Patrick Grigsby) | 109 |
| WILLIAM E. NELSON, <i>Two Forms of Conservatism: Judicial Reasoning in New York Courts, 1860–1920</i><br>(Logan Everett Sawyer)           | 111 |
| ELIZABETH GARNER MASARIK, <i>The Sentimental State: How Women-Led Reform Built the American Welfare State</i><br>(Abby Trollinger)        | 113 |