

# Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation  
Volume 20, Number 1, Winter 1995

The University of Chicago Press

---

# Law & Social Inquiry

---

Journal of the American Bar Foundation

Published by The University of Chicago Press

---

<i>Editors</i>	<b>Elizabeth Mertz</b> <b>Peter Siegelman</b> <b>Christopher L. Tomlins</b>
<i>Review Editor</i>	<b>Howard S. Erlanger</b>
<i>Associate Editors</i>	<b>Carol A. Heimer</b> <b>Karyl A. Kinsey</b>
<i>Managing Editor</i>	<b>John Atkinson</b>
<i>Editorial Coordinator</i>	<b>Rozanne Caldwell</b>

---

## **Editorial Board**

---

Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles  
Ian Ayres, Professor of Law, Stanford University  
Donald Black, Professor of Sociology, University of Virginia  
Erhard Blankenburg, Professor of Sociology of Law, Free University of Amsterdam  
John Braithwaite, Professor of Law and Sociology, The Australian National University  
Jane F. Collier, Professor of Anthropology, Stanford University  
Phoebe C. Ellsworth, Professor of Law and Psychology, University of Michigan  
Eliot L. Freidson, Professor of Sociology, New York University  
Lawrence M. Friedman, Professor of Law, Stanford University  
Hazel Genn, Professor of Law, Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London  
Carol J. Greenhouse, Professor of Anthropology, Indiana University  
Valerie P. Hans, Professor of Criminal Justice, University of Delaware  
Earl Johnson, Jr., Associate Justice, California State Court of Appeal  
Doreen McBarnet, Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Wolfson College, Oxford  
Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles  
Laura Nader, Professor of Anthropology, University of California-Berkeley  
Judith Resnik, Professor of Law, University of Southern California  
Daniel Rubinfeld, Professor of Economics, University of California-Berkeley  
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Professor of Sociology, Brown University  
Martin M. Shapiro, Professor of Law, University of California-Berkeley  
Susan S. Silbey, Professor of Sociology, Wellesley College  
David Sugarman, School of Law, Lancaster University  
David M. Trubek, Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin  
Barbara Yngvesson, Professor of Anthropology, Hampshire College  
Michael Zander, Professor of Law, Department of Law, London School of Economics

---

---

# Law & Social Inquiry

---

Volume 20, Number 1, Winter 1995

---

## **SYMPOSIUM: Law and Lustration: Righting the Wrongs of the Past**

---

*Editor's Introduction*

**The Problems of Lustration: Prosecution of Wrongdoers by  
Democratic Successor Regimes** 1  
Peter Siegelman

**State Crimes of Previous Regimes: Knowledge, Accountability, and  
the Policing of the Past** 7  
Stanley Cohen

**Justice after Transition: On the Choices Successor Elites Make in  
Dealing with the Past** 51  
Luc Huyse

**Truth as Justice: Investigatory Commissions in Latin America** 79  
Margaret Popkin and Naomi Roht-Arriaza

**Lustration and Truth Claims: Unfinished Revolutions in Central  
Europe** 117  
Maria Łoś

**Retribution or Truth-Telling in South Africa? Legacies of the  
Transitional Phase** 163  
Lynn Berat and Yossi Shain

**Reflections on the Trial of Vichy Collaborator Paul Touvier for  
Crimes against Humanity in France** 191  
Leila Sadat Wexler

**The Purge of Lawyers after the Breakdown of the East German  
Communist Regime** 223  
Erhard Blankenburg

**Lustration as a Problem of the Social Basis of Constitutionalism** 245  
Arthur L. Stinchcombe

---

## **REVIEW ESSAYS**

---

**Policing, Punishment, and the Individual: Criminal Justice in China** 277  
Harold Tanner

*Review Response*

**One Story, Two Readings: A Response to Harold Tanner** 305  
Michael Dutton

*Review Rejoinder*

**The Empirical Limitation of Theoretical Insight** 317  
Harold Tanner

---

**BOOK NOTES** 325

---

## Publication Policy

The American Bar Foundation is an independent research institute committed to socio-legal research. Consistent with its mandate to create and disseminate knowledge about law, the legal profession, and legal institutions, *Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation* invites the submission of articles that make original contributions to understanding of socio-legal processes. *Law and Social Inquiry* publishes both empirical and theoretical studies from a variety of disciplinary perspectives. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions are those of the authors alone.

**Manuscript Evaluation:** *Law and Social Inquiry* is a refereed journal. Manuscripts that the Editors deem appropriate for the journal are evaluated by two or more reviewers with expertise in the relevant subject matter and methodology. Manuscripts produced by ABF research fellows are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

**Submission of Manuscripts:** Manuscripts submitted to *Law and Social Inquiry* should be typed double-spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. The review process is anonymous; all identifying information should appear only on a separate cover sheet and not in the body of the manuscript.

*Law and Social Inquiry* does not accept multiply submitted articles. The Editors endeavor to make decisions promptly, usually about two months after submission.

**Editing of Manuscripts:** All manuscripts accepted for publication are edited for style by professional copyeditors in consultation with the author. Copyeditors do not check citations. Authors see edited manuscripts and/or proofs.

**Off-Prints to Authors:** Without charge, we provide authors with 25 off-prints of their articles, essays, or exchanges (but not symposia) that appear in *Law and Social Inquiry*. Additional off-prints may be ordered at the author's expense. Authors receive 1 copy of the issue in which their contributions appear.

**Republication Rights:** The Foundation normally permits authors to republish their manuscripts in books or use their manuscripts after publication, but *Law and Social Inquiry* has the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The journal retains the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

**Copying Beyond Fair Use:** The code on the first page of a contribution in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the contribution may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for classroom use without charge, copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to the Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

**Comments and Responses:** Comments on or responses to articles or review essays in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

---

Send article manuscripts to:

**The Editors**

*Law and Social Inquiry*  
American Bar Foundation  
750 N. Lake Shore Drive  
Chicago, IL 60611  
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding  
review essays to:

**Howard S. Erlanger**  
Review Editor  
*Law and Social Inquiry*  
Institute for Legal Studies  
Law School  
University of Wisconsin  
Madison, WI 53706  
(608) 263-7405

---

**Annual U.S. subscription rates:**

	1 yr.	2 yr.	3 yr.
Individuals	\$36	\$66.25	\$91.80
Academic	\$29	\$53.35	\$73.95
Institutions	\$59	\$108.55	\$150.45

**Outside U.S. please add** a postage charge of \$6.00 per year to the U.S. rates. **Canadians please add** 7% GST tax to above rates as follows: One-year rates: Individuals \$2.52; Academic \$2.03; Institutions \$4.13. Two-year rates: Individuals \$4.63; Academic \$3.73; Institutions \$7.59. Three-year rates: Individuals \$6.42; Academic \$5.17; Institutions \$10.53.

**Single copies:** \$14.75 for institutions, \$9.00 for individuals. Checks should be made payable to *Law & Social Inquiry*, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, Illinois 60637. (Fax: 312-753-0811.) Volumes 1-12 available from Fred B. Rothman & Company, 10368 West Centennial Road, Littleton, Colorado 80127. (303) 979-5657

Volumes available in microfilm from University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

© 1994 American Bar Foundation. All rights reserved.

*Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation* (ISSN: 0897-6546) is published quarterly—winter, spring, summer, and fall—by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 South Woodlawn Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Second-class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and at additional mailing office.

**POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to: *Law and Social Inquiry*, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

# Acknowledgments to Reviewers

The Editors wish to thank the following reviewers whose careful evaluations and helpful recommendations have greatly assisted us in selecting manuscripts for Volume 19 of *Law and Social Inquiry*. We are grateful for their willingness to provide their expertise in furthering our efforts to ensure the publication of high-quality contributions to sociolegal scholarship.

Richard L. Abel	James Gibson	Michelle Oberman
Lori B. Andrews	Carol J. Greenhouse	Maryjane Osa
James Atleson	Joseph Gusfield	Linda C.A. Przybyszewski
Constance B. Backhouse	V. Lee Hamilton	Robert L. Rabin
Shelly Bannister	Donna T. Harsch	Sean Redding
Eugene Bardach	Keith Hawkins	Leonard Rubinowitz
Craig Becker	John P. Heinz	Linda Rubinowitz
Stephen Houran Behnke	Lynne Henderson	Frank Safford
Nachman Ben-Yehuda	Jeffrey Herbst	Austin Sarat
John Braithwaite	Marco Jacquemet	Maud Schaafsma
William P. Bridges	Wilmot James	Stuart A. Scheingold
Alison Brysk	Sanford H. Kadish	Kim Lane Scheppele
Jonathan D. Casper	Robert A. Kagan	Debra Schleef
Ross E. Cheit	Laura Kalman	Elizabeth Schneider
Daniel Chirot	Lucien Karpik	John Scholz
John Coatsworth	Ira Katznelson	Ellen Kaye Scott
Ronald Cohen	Jan Kavan	Philip Siegelman
Stan Cohen	Herbert Kritzer	Jonathan S. Simon
Jane Collier	Robin T. Lakoff	Carol Smart
John L. Comaroff	William LaPiana	Rayman L. Solomon
John M. Conley	Judith N. Levi	Eve Spangler
Rosemary Coombe	Noga Levine	Steven Spitzer
Kathleen Daley	E. Allan Lind	Dorothy Stetson
Yves Dezalay	Stewart Macaulay	Robert Stevens
Shari S. Diamond	Melissa A. Macauley	David Sugarman
Giuseppe Di Palma	Charles Maier	Ruti G. Teitel
John J. Donohue	Inga Markovits	Austin Turk
Robert M. Emerson	Gregory Matoesian	Tom Tyler
Charles R. Epp	Sarah C. Maza	Thomas S. Ulen
Elizabeth Faue	Lisa J. McIntyre	Charles van Onselen
William L.F. Felstiner	Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow	David E. Van Zandt
Kathleen Ferraro	Sally Merry	Neil Vidmar
Lawrence M. Friedman	Laura Nader	David Vogel
William Gamson	Robert L. Nelson	Douglas Wholey
Bryant G. Garth	William J. Novak	Stephen C. Yeazell
	William O'Barr	