

Kjerulfi in Norway in 1870. He published an account of this discovery in 1871, naming the characteristic Trilobite *Paradoxides Kjerulfi*,¹ and figuring it. The identity of this species with the previously named *Paradoxides Wahlenbergi* of Dr. Torell was distinctly acknowledged by Linnarsson in the year 1876.² Thus, while it must be admitted that Linnarsson's specific title of *Paradoxides (Olenellus) Kjerulfi* must be retained as that of the first Trilobite figured and described from the *Olenellus Zone* in Europe; yet the actual credit of the original detection of this *Olenellus* zone belongs unquestionably to Dr. Nathorst, who made known its stratigraphical position in Sweden at least two years before Linnarsson detected and described the species of the *Olenellus* zone from Norway.

CHAS. LAPWORTH.

A WOODEN DINOSAUR.³

SIR,—Frequent protests have been entered against the hastiness with which new species or even genera are founded upon fragmentary materials. But all previous blunders in this line are thrown into the shade by the recent restoration of a new genus of Dinosaurs, *Achenosaurus*, from two fragments which, on microscopical examination, prove to be nothing but masses of silicified wood. The contributions to this subject, quoted below, not being easily procurable, we think the readers of this Journal may be interested by the following analysis.

In two notes published in Belgium, Abbé G. Smets describes a fossil obtained by him from the sands of Aix-la-Chapelle, in a quarry at Moresnet, Belgium, between Verviers and Aix-la-Chapelle, sands in which, according to the most competent local authorities, no vertebrate remains have as yet come to light. This fossil has been described as a portion of the right dentary bone, "to which joins another fragment, very probably of the coronoid," of a new Dinosaur of the family Hadrosauridæ. The author declared he had tested the bony nature of this fossil by means of the lens and the microscope, without, however, making any sections; while some incrustations were identified by him as teeth. A plate, so rudely executed as to be utterly worthless, accompanies his second paper, which concludes with an attempt at a restoration of this marvellous Dinosaur, which is supposed to have been biped, to have attained a length of 4 to 5 metres, to have been provided with a spatulate mandible, to have fed on succulent plants, while its hide was probably furnished with an armour of dermal spines.

M. Dollo having obtained leave to examine and make micro-

¹ Linnarsson, Öfvers. af Kongl. Vetens. Akad. Förhand. 1871, p. 784.

² *Ibid.*, Brachiopoda of Swedish Paradoxides beds. Bihang. Kong. Swensk. Vet. Akad. Handlingar. 1876, p. 5.

³ G. SMETS. Un Reptile nouveau des Sables d'Aix-la-Chapelle. Muséon (Louvain), vi. 1887, pp. 133, *et seq.*

G. SMETS. *Achenosaurus multidentis*, Reptile fossile des Sables d'Aix-la-Chapelle (Mémoire présenté au congrès des savants catholiques à Paris et lu dans la séance du 9 avril, 1888). Hasselt, 1888, 8vo. 23 pp., 1 pl.

L. DOLLO. *Achenosaurus multidentis*, Bull. Soc. Belge Géol. ii. 1888, p. 300.

G. SMETS. Un mot de réponse à M. L. Dollo. Hasselt, 1889, 8vo. 13 pp.

scopical sections of the fragments, has come to the conclusion that they are merely masses of fossil wood, a view in which he is supported by a well-known botanist, Dr. M. Hovelacque.

This demolishing of the new Dinosaur has brought upon M. Dollo a would-be crushing retort from its founder. The tone of the reply is, however, not of a kind to raise its author in the opinion of the scientific, or, indeed, for that matter, of any other world. He seems indeed to have followed the Old Bailey maxim, that when you have no case, the only thing left is to abuse the plaintiff and all connected with him. We were, however, especially concerned to find our own names dragged into this unseemly controversy, on the ground that we have seen reason to differ in certain respects from M. Dollo's views as to the serial position or specific distinction of some of the Wealden Reptiles of Belgium. To make such differences of opinion the grounds of a deliberate impeachment of M. Dollo's capacity as a palæontologist is, on the face of it, too absurd for serious notice. We believe, indeed, that scarcely any two palæontologists can be found who will agree with one another in all respects as to the affinity of a totally extinct type of animal; and when the type specimens are in the fragmentary condition in which some of the allied English forms were found, there is no wonder that M. Dollo failed to recognize their identity or kinship with the Belgian examples. In one instance, indeed, one of the undersigned has since agreed with M. Dollo in regarding the Belgian Crocodile *Bernissartia* as generically distinct from the English *Hylæochampsa*.

We are well assured, in conclusion, that no words of ours are needed to express the high estimation in which M. Dollo's palæontological work is held, not only in this country, but wherever the science is cultivated; and we look forward with keen hope to the appearance of fully illustrated monographs from his hand, which will worthily proclaim to the world the priceless treasures preserved in the Brussels Museum.

G. A. BOULENGER,

BRITISH MUSEUM, 20 *March*, 1889.

R. LYDEKKER.

MISCELLANEOUS.

HUMAN RELICS AND BONES OF MASTODON FOUND IN ASSOCIATION.—Mr. J. M. Clarke reports to Dr. James Hall, State-Geologist, Albany, N.Y., that in the village of Attica, Wyoming Co., N.Y., some bones of Mastodon (or possibly Elephant) and of Elk (?), together with charcoal, have been found at a depth of about six feet, in a natural sink-hole or bog-hole in the shale of that place; and that some ancient pottery and charcoal were found in a neighbouring bog-hole, about 40 feet distant, and at a depth of a foot lower than in the other pit. The two holes or pits were once connected by a small watercourse. The hole with the bones and charcoal was at top about 30 feet, and that with the pottery and charcoal about 75 feet in diameter. Both narrowed downwards, and contained "black muck and mucky clay"; one is under the street and the other in a pasture.

T. R. J.