

the careful selection of films in this book, the cinema usually shows us bodies which are unreal, ageless and tireless. *Alien Sex* is right therefore to concern itself with such a strange body of cinema, where the distorted bodies are in fact more real than the bodies of mainstream cinema.

EUAN MARLEY OP

DISCUSSIONS AND ARGUMENTS ON VARIOUS SUBJECTS by John Henry Newman, introduction and notes by Gerard Tracey and James Tolhurst, *Gracewing, Leominster & University of Notre Dame Press, Notre Dame IN, 2004, Pp. xlix + 490, £25.00 hbk.*

Discussions and Arguments on Various Subjects, originally published in 1872, is the seventh volume to be released in *The Works of Cardinal Newman: Birmingham Oratory Millennium Edition*. Works by Newman previously re-published in this series include titles such as *The Arians of the Fourth Century* and the *Church of the Fathers*. Unlike these two particular works, *Discussions and Arguments* is a collection of essays developed by Newman over a period of approximately thirty years (March 1836 through June 1866). I would argue that one could read this volume as a whole or in parts. As a whole, the essays provide insight into how components of Newman's thought developed over the course of an important period of his life. In parts, these essays offer insights into Newman's thinking on topics ranging from biblical exegesis to political philosophy. Regardless of how one chooses to read this text, *Discussions and Arguments* provides an indispensable view into the thought of one of the Church's most significant theological voices.

As a result of the efforts of Gerard Tracey and James Tolhurst, this edition of Newman's *Discussions and Arguments on Various Subjects* comes with an introduction and notes. Earlier versions published by Longmans Green and B. M. Pickering lack such resources. Gerard Tracey died suddenly while working on the notes; however, James Tolhurst, the editor of this series of Newman's works, completed the notes and then added the introduction. As significant Newman scholars, Tracey and Tolhurst's efforts come together to offer invaluable insights into the significance of this collection of Newman's work. For example, in the notes the symbolic nature of many of Newman's references is afforded greater clarity. Meanwhile the primary purpose of the introduction is to offer an understanding of the unique context out of which each one of these essays emerged. However, one potential weakness of the introduction is that it fails to include any assessment of the significance of *Discussions and Arguments* as a whole. As a result, at least one important theme – such as clerical identity – that runs through this volume of Newman's work goes under-evaluated.

Read as a whole, many of the essays in this collection offer insights into Newman's understanding of clerical identity and how it relates to his larger view of ecclesiology. For example, in 'How to Accomplish It', Newman, as an Anglican, writes that 'By that time we may have buried our temporal guardians: their memories we shall always revere and bless; but the successors of the Apostles will still have their work—if the world last so long—a work (may be) of greater peril and hardship, but of more honour than now' (p. 24). In 'An Internal Argument for Christianity' Newman, now a Roman Catholic, argues that 'Faith is not simply trust in His legislation, as the writer says; it is definitely trust in His word, whether that word be about heavenly things or earthly; whether it is spoken by his own mouth, or through his ministers' (p. 395). Over the course of time spanning the development of these two essays, Newman becomes convinced that the true bearer of apostolic succession is Rome, not Canterbury. While this theme does not dominate the essays

in this collection, Newman never strays too far from this concern regardless of the dominant issue with which he was seeking to develop in a particular essay.

Read in parts, the dominant issues present in these essays range from eschatology to political theory. For example, *Discussions and Arguments* not only includes Newman's assessment of the relationship shared by utilitarian thought in relation to the establishment of a reading room or library but also an assessment of the connections shared by the British Constitution and the presence of British troops in Crimea. Such efforts by Newman demonstrate the dexterity of his intellectual skill. Newman was a theologian with deep and abiding interests in the Church. However, Newman's understanding of theology as the Church's language afforded him the ability to apply this language to a range of tasks and circumstances.

Regardless of how one chooses to read John Henry Newman's *Discussions and Arguments on Various Subjects*, this text proves to be invaluable in terms of understanding the breadth and the depth of Newman's theological skill. As a whole or in parts, these essays, along with the introduction and the notes, provide a significant introduction to Newman's thought that not only Newman scholars but perhaps also theologians in general will want to consider.

TODD C. REAM

TURNING TOWARDS THE LORD: ORIENTATION IN LITURGICAL PRAYER by Uwe Michael Lang, *Ignatius Press, San Francisco, 2004, Pp. 160, £8.50 pbk.*
THE ORGANIC DEVELOPMENT OF THE LITURGY by Alcuin Reid OSB, *Saint Michael's Abbey Press, 2004, Pp. 336, £20.95 hbk.*

Uwe Michael Lang is a young German patristic scholar of enormous promise who, from a Lutheran background, was received into the Catholic Church while at Oxford and is now a priest of the London Oratory. In this book he adds his voice – a considerable one in terms of not only Teutonic erudition but also feeling for the Liturgy – to the increasing number of those who seek a reconsideration of the hasty introduction, in the later 1960s, of Eucharistic celebration 'towards the people', *versus populum*. Theologically speaking, the Eucharistic Oblation is not offered by the priest to the people. It is offered by the people, through and with the priest, to the Father by the mediation of Christ, our Great High Priest, in the Holy Spirit. Which spatial arrangement makes this theological doctrine more visible – celebration *versus populum* or celebration *versus apsidem*, where celebrant and assembly face together in the same direction? One might well reply that to have asked this question is already to have answered it, and nothing more remains to be said.

Lang, however, shows that much more can be said, and in the first instance about the history of liturgical orientation in the ancient Church, to which often ill-informed reference was made in the almost over-night revolution of chipping, hacking and joinery. A critical analysis of copious patristic materials shows that *sacred direction* – specifically, to the East – was the most important spatial consideration in early Christian prayer. Its significance was primarily eschatological (the East was the direction of the Christ of the Parousia, cf. especially Mt 24:27 and 30) and, naturally, it applied to all the faithful, including their ministers. Now, where the archaeological evidence is concerned, it must be noted that the great majority of ancient churches have an oriental apse. Granted that the altar was the most honoured object in such buildings, the only safe inference is, accordingly, that the celebrant stood at the people's side, facing East, for the Anaphora. In the minority of buildings (notably at Rome and in North Africa) that have, by contrast, an oriented *entrance*, the position is less clear. Lang, however, argues persuasively – if with a degree of tentativeness – that the celebrant in such a case prayed facing the doors (and thus the people) but