

BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary

Volume 34 | Issue 4 | August 2011 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 34 (2011) for *institutions* is US \$1136.00 for print and online, US \$957.00 for online only, and US \$1024.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £645.00 for print and online, UK £546.00 for online only, and UK £590.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$323.00 for print and online and US \$295.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £190.00 for print and online and UK £173.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$121.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £76.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$99.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £60.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$218.00 (UK £108.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 34:4 August 2011

Jones, M. & Love, B. C. Bayesian Fundamentalism or Enlightenment? On the explanatory status and theoretical contributions of Bayesian models of cognition		169
Open Peer Commentary		
Al-Shawaf, L. & Buss, D. Evolutionary psychology and Bayesian modeling	188	
Anderson, B. L. The myth of computational level theory and the vacuity of rational analysis	189	
Baetu, I., Barberia, I., Murphy, R. A. & Baker, A. G. Maybe this old dinosaur isn't extinct: What does Bayesian modeling add to associationism?	190	
Barsalou, L. W. Integrating Bayesian analysis and mechanistic theories in grounded cognition	191	
Borsboom, D., Wagenmakers, E.-J. & Romeijn, J.-W. Mechanistic curiosity will not kill the Bayesian cat	192	
Bowers, J. S. & Davis, C. J. More varieties of Bayesian theories, but no enlightenment	193	
Chater, N., Goodman, N., Griffiths, T. L., Kemp, C., Oaksford, M. & Tenenbaum, J. B. The imaginary fundamentalists: The unshocking truth about Bayesian cognitive science	194	
Danks, D. & Eberhardt, F. Keeping Bayesian models rational: The need for an account of algorithmic rationality	197	
Edelman, S. & Shahbazi, R. Survival in a world of probable objects: A fundamental reason for Bayesian enlightenment	197	
Fernbach, P. M. & Sloman, S. A. Don't throw out the Bayes with the bathwater	198	
Glymour, C. Osiander's psychology	199	
Gopnik, A. Probabilistic models as theories of children's minds	200	
Hayes, B. K. & Newell, B. R. The uncertain status of Bayesian accounts of reasoning	201	
Heit, E. & Erickson, S. In praise of secular Bayesianism	202	
Herschbach, M. & Bechtel, W. Relating Bayes to cognitive mechanisms		202
Holyoak, K. J. & Lu, H. What the Bayesian framework has contributed to understanding cognition: Causal learning as a case study		203
Jenkins, G. W., Samuelson, L. K. & Spencer, J. P. Come down from the clouds: Grounding Bayesian insights in developmental and behavioral processes		204
Lee, M. D. In praise of Ecumenical Bayes		206
Markman, A. B. & Otto, A. R. Cognitive systems optimize energy rather than information		207
Navarro, D. J. & Perfors, A. F. Enlightenment grows from fundamentals		207
Norris, D. The illusion of mechanism: Mechanistic fundamentalism or enlightenment?		208
Pietraszweski, D. & Wertz, A. E. Reverse engineering the structure of cognitive mechanisms		209
Rehder, B. Taking the rationality out of probabilistic models		210
Rogers, T. T. & Seidenberg, M. S. Distinguishing literal from metaphorical applications of Bayesian approaches		211
Sewell, D. K., Little, D. R. & Lewandowsky, S. Bayesian computation and mechanism: Theoretical pluralism drives scientific emergence		212
Speekenbrink, M. & Shanks, D. R. Is everyone Bayes? On the testable implications of Bayesian Fundamentalism		213
Uhlmann, E. L. Post hoc rationalism in science		214
Authors' Response		215
Jones, M. & Love, B. C. Pinning down the theoretical commitments of Bayesian cognitive models		