

SETS OF CONVERGENCE FOR SERIES  
DEFINED BY ITERATION<sup>1</sup>

George Brauer

(received July 28, 1965)

Let  $f(x)$  be a real-valued function defined on an interval  $I_a: [0, a]$ . For each point  $x$  in  $I_a$  we form the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n$ , where  $u_0 = x$  and  $u_{n+1} = f(u_n)$  for  $n \geq 0$ . If the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n$  converges,  $x$  will be called a point of convergence; if this series diverges,  $x$  will be called a point of divergence. In this note several properties of sets of convergence<sup>2</sup> will be obtained. We shall always assume that:

- (1)  $f$  is continuous on  $I_a$ ,
- (2)  $f(0) = 0$ ,  $0 \leq f(x) < x$  for  $0 < x \leq a$ .

Fort and Schuster [1] showed that if  $f$  satisfies (1) and (2) as well as the following additional conditions on an interval  $I_b$ :

- (3)  $f$  is differentiable in  $I_b$ ,
- (4) there exists a positive constant  $c$  such that  $f'(x) \geq c$  in  $I_b$ ,
- (5) if  $0 < x_1 < x_2 < b$ ,  $f(x_1)/x_1 \geq f(x_2)/x_2 > 0$ ,

---

<sup>1</sup> This research was supported by NSFG 24295.

<sup>2</sup> The set of convergence is the set of points of convergence.

then, for each point  $x = u_0$  in  $I_b$ , the series  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} u_n$  converges

or diverges according as the integral  $\int_0^b \frac{y}{y - f(y)} dy$  converges or diverges.

THEOREM 1. If the function  $f$  satisfies conditions (1) and (2) in the interval  $I_a$  and there exists a number  $b$ ,  $0 < b \leq a$ , such that  $f$  is nondecreasing in  $I_b$ , then the set of convergence for  $f$  is either the entire interval  $I_a$  or it is a closed set containing  $0$  as an isolated point. Furthermore each closed set in  $I_a$  which contains  $0$  as an isolated point is the set of convergence for a function satisfying (1) and (2) in  $I_a$  as well as (3), (4), and (5) in some interval  $I_b$ .

Proof: If  $b$  is a point of convergence and  $0 \leq y \leq b$ , then, since  $f$  is nondecreasing in  $I_b$ ,  $f^{(n)}(y) \leq f^{(n)}(b)$  for all  $n$ ; consequently  $y$  is a point of convergence. (We shall use the symbol  $f^{(n)}$  to denote the  $n^{\text{th}}$  iterate of  $f$ .) In this case all points of  $I_b$  are points of convergence. If  $b$  is a point of divergence and  $0 \leq y \leq b$ , then, since  $\{f^{(n)}(y)\}$  is a null sequence, there exists a number  $k$  such that  $f^{(k)}(b) \leq y$ . Again, since  $f$  is nondecreasing in  $I_b$ ,  $f^{(n+k)}(b) \leq f^{(n)}(y)$  for all  $n$ ; hence  $y$  is a point of divergence. Thus, if  $b$  is a point of divergence, all points of the interval  $(0, b]$  are points of divergence.

Now let  $x$  be an arbitrary point in  $I_a$ . The sequence  $\{f^{(n)}(x)\}$  is monotone nonincreasing in  $n$ , and it tends to zero for each  $x$ . By a well-known theorem of Dini, the sequence  $\{f^{(n)}(x)\}$  tends uniformly to zero on  $I_a$ . Thus, there exists a natural number  $N$ , independent of  $x$ , such that if  $n > N$  then each point  $f^{(n)}(x)$  lies in  $I_b$ . If  $b$  is a

point of convergence, then  $f^{(N)}(x)$  is a point of convergence for each  $x$  in  $I_a$ ; certainly the point  $x$  is likewise a point of convergence. If  $b$  is a point of divergence, then the only point of convergence in  $I_b$  is  $0$ ; the point  $x$  is a point of convergence if and only if it lies in one of the sets

$$F_n = \{x: f^{(n)}(x) = 0\}.$$

Since  $f$  is continuous, each set  $F_n$  is closed. The set of convergence is the union of the sets  $F_n$  ( $n=0, 1, \dots, N$ ), and therefore it is closed. Since  $f$  does not vanish in  $(0, b]$ ,  $0$  is an isolated point of convergence.

This concludes the proof of the first part of the theorem. We note that if (3), (4), and (5) hold in  $I_b$ , then, if

$\int_0^b \frac{y}{y - f(y)} dy$  converges, the set of convergence is  $I_a$ , while

if this integral diverges, the set of convergence is a closed set containing  $0$  as an isolated point.

Now let  $F$  denote a closed set which contains  $0$  as an isolated point. We construct a function  $f$  which satisfies (1) and (2) on an interval  $I_a$ , as well as (3), (4), and (5) on an interval  $I_b$  with  $0 < b \leq a$ . We take  $b \leq 1/2$  and such that the interval  $I_b$  contains no point of  $F$  except  $0$ . We define  $f$  as follows:

$$f(x) = \frac{(x-x)^2 d(b, F)}{d(b, F) + 1} \quad 0 \leq x \leq b,$$

$$f(x) = \frac{(b-b)^2 d(x, F)}{d(x, F) + 1} \quad b \leq x \leq a,$$

where  $d(x, F)$  denotes the distance of the point  $x$  from the set

$F$ . We note that the integral  $\int_0^b \frac{y}{y - f(y)} dy$  diverges. The

set  $F$  is the set of convergence for  $f$ .

THEOREM 2. The set of convergence for a function  $f$  is a set of type  $F_\sigma$ .

Proof. The point  $x$  is a point of divergence if and only if, for each positive integer  $j$  there exists a number  $n$  such that

$$(6) \quad \sum_{i=0}^n f^{(i)}(x) > j.$$

Let  $G_{j,n}$  denote the set of points which satisfy (6). Each set  $G_{j,n}$  is open. The set of divergence is the set  $\bigcap_j \bigcup_n G_{j,n}$ , and this set is of type  $G_\delta$ . Therefore, the set of convergence is of type  $F_\sigma$ .

THEOREM 3. If  $f$  satisfies (1) and (2), and its set of divergence is nonempty, then for each  $x \neq 0$ , the interval  $(f(x), x)$  contains points of divergence. If, for each positive  $\delta$ , the interval  $(0, \delta)$  contains points of convergence, then the interval  $(f(x), x)$  contains points of convergence.

Proof. We prove only the second part of the theorem; the first part is proved similarly. Again let  $u_0 = x$  and  $u_{n+1} = f(u_n)$  for  $n \geq 0$ . It follows from (1) and (2) that  $\{u_n\}$  is a null sequence. There is a point of convergence  $z$  arbitrarily close to 0. For some positive integer  $r$ ,  $z$  must lie in the interval  $(u_{r+1}, u_r)$ . Since  $f^{(r)}(u_0) = u_r$  and  $f^{(r)}(u_1) = u_{r+1}$ , there is a point  $w$  in the interval  $(u_1, u_0)$  such that  $f^{(r)}(w) = z$ ;  $w$  is a point of convergence.

THEOREM 4. Suppose that  $f$  satisfies (1) and (2) and that the interval  $(0, \delta)$  contains points of convergence for each positive  $\delta$ . If  $x$  is a point of divergence and  $y$  is a point of convergence, then the interval between  $x$  and  $y$  contains both points of convergence and points of divergence.

Proof. Without loss in generality we may take  $y < x$ .

Again we let  $u_0 = x$ ,  $u_{k+1} = f(u_k)$  for  $k \geq 0$ ,  $v_0 = y$ ,  $v_{k+1} = f(v_k)$  for  $k \geq 0$ . Since  $y$  is a point of convergence it is impossible that  $v_k > u_{k+1}$  for all values of  $k$ , for then

we would have  $\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} v_k > \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} u_k = \infty$ , and  $y$  would be a point

of divergence. Hence there exists a positive integer  $k$  such that  $v_k < u_{k+1} < u_k$ . By the intermediate value theorem there is a point  $w$ ,  $v_0 < w < u_0$ , such that  $f^{(k)}(w) = u_{k+1}$ ; clearly  $w$  is a point of divergence. By Theorem 3 the interval  $(u_{k+1}, u_k)$  contains a point of convergence  $z'$ ; since  $v_k < u_{k+1}$ ,  $v_k < z' < u_k$ . Again by the intermediate value theorem there is a point  $z$  such that  $v_0 < z < u_0$  and  $f^{(k)}(z) = z'$ ;  $z$  is a point of convergence.

We conclude with the following problem.

If  $f$  satisfies the conditions (1) and (2), and  $m_\delta$  denotes the Lebesgue measure of the intersection of the set of divergence with the interval  $[0, \delta]$ , is it true that  $\lim_{\delta \rightarrow 0} m_\delta / \delta = 0$  if and only if  $\int_0^a \frac{x}{x - f(x)} dx < \infty$ ?

#### REFERENCE

1. M. K. Fort, Jr., and Seymour Schuster, Convergence of series whose terms are defined recursively, Amer. Math. Monthly, 71 (1964), 994-998.

University of Minnesota