

Law and History Review

Volume 26, Number 1 · Spring 2008

<https://doi.org/10.1017/S073824800003527> Published online by Cambridge University Press

American Society for Legal History

The American Society for Legal History is a nonprofit membership organization dedicated to fostering scholarship, teaching, and study concerning the law and institutions of all legal systems, both Anglo-American and international. Founded in 1956, the Society sponsors the journal and *Studies in Legal History*, a series of book-length monographs available to ASLH members at substantial prepublication discounts. In addition, the Society holds an annual meeting to promote scholarship and interaction among teachers, practitioners, and students interested in legal history, and publishes a semiannual newsletter reporting developments in the field. For further information concerning the Society, please write: William P. LaPiana, New York Law School, 57 Worth St., New York, New York 10013.

To become a member of the Society, please complete and mail the application to University of Illinois Press, 1325 S. Oak St., Champaign, IL 61820.

Membership Application

Please check appropriate membership below:

	U.S. Member	Non-U.S. Member
Regular Member, with an annual income		
_____ below \$50,000	\$ 60.00	\$ 70.00
_____ \$50,000 – \$74,999	\$ 70.00	\$ 80.00
_____ \$75,000 – \$99,999	\$ 80.00	\$ 90.00
_____ \$100,000 – \$124,999	\$ 90.00	\$ 100.00
_____ \$125,000 – \$149,999	\$ 100.00	\$ 110.00
_____ \$150,000 and above	\$ 125.00	\$ 135.00
_____ Student Member	\$ 20.00	\$ 30.00
_____ Emeritus	\$ 20.00	\$ 20.00
_____ Life Member	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00
_____ Sponsor	\$ 250.00	\$ 260.00
_____ Institution	\$ 100.00	\$ 110.00

Please remit amount due in U.S. dollars drawn on a U.S. bank, payable to: **University of Illinois Press.**

Total Amt: \$ _____ Visa/MC: _____

Acct. Name: _____ Exp. Date: _____

Signed: _____

Name: _____

Institution: _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Phone (Home): _____ (Office): _____

Fax: _____ E-mail: _____

Law and History Review

Volume 26, Number 1

Spring 2008

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editor

David S. Tanenhaus
*University of Nevada,
 Las Vegas*
 Department of History
 4505 Maryland Parkway
 Las Vegas, NV 89154-5020
 702.895.3549
 FAX: 702.895.1782
 E-Mail: david.tanenhaus@
 unlv.edu

**Associate Editor
(Book Reviews, Americas)**

Alfred L. Brophy
University of Alabama
 101 Bryant Drive East,
 Box 870382
 Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0382
 205.348.0841
 FAX: 205.348.5829
 E-Mail: abrophy@law.ua.edu

**Associate Editor
(Book Reviews, Non-Americans)**

Amalia D. Kessler
Stanford Law School
 559 Nathan Abbott Way
 Stanford, CA 94305-8610
 650.725.5800
 FAX: 650.725.0253
 E-Mail: akessler@law.stanford.
 edu

Editorial Board

Edward J. Balleisen
Duke University
 David A. Bell
Johns Hopkins University
 Girish Bhat
SUNY, Cortland
 Mary Sarah Bilder
Boston College
 Bettina Bradbury
York University, Toronto
 Peter C. Caldwell
Rice University
 Andrew Wender Cohen
Syracuse University
 Jane Dailey
Johns Hopkins University
 Elizabeth R. Dale
University of Florida
 Adrienne Dale Davis
University of North Carolina
 Thomas J. Davis
Arizona State University
 Christine A. Desan
Harvard University
 Charles R. Donahue
Harvard University
 Markus Dirk Dubber
SUNY, Buffalo
 Mary L. Dudziak
*University of Southern
 California*
 Laura F. Edwards
Duke University
 Daniel R. Ernst
Georgetown University
 William E. Forbath
University of Texas, Austin

Thomas P. Gallanis
University of Minnesota
 Sarah Barringer Gordon
University of Pennsylvania
 Ariela J. Gross
*University of Southern
 California*
 Sally E. Hadden
Florida State University
 Daniel J. Hulsebosch
New York University
 Nancy Isenberg
University of Tulsa
 Bruce Kercher
Macquarie University
 Diane Kirkby
La Trobe University
 Daniel M. Klerman
*University of Southern
 California*
 Mindie Lazarus-Black
*University of Illinois,
 Chicago*
 Kenneth F. Ledford
*Case Western Reserve
 University*
 Sanford V. Levinson
University of Texas, Austin
 Thomas B. McAfee
*University of Nevada,
 Las Vegas*
 M. C. Mirow
*Florida International
 University*
 Mae M. Ngai
University of Chicago
 William J. Novak
University of Chicago

James C. Oldham
Georgetown University
 Ruth Paley
*History of Parliament,
 Wedgwood House, London*
 Pablo Piccato
Columbia University
 W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
 Columbia*
 Gerry R. Rubin
*University of Kent,
 Canterbury*
 Lucy E. Salyer
University of New Hampshire
 Reva B. Siegel
Yale University
 Robin Chapman Stacey
University of Washington
 Robert J. Steinfeld
SUNY, Buffalo
 Emily Z. Tabuteau
Michigan State University
 Eric M. Tucker
York University, Toronto
 Michael Vorenberg
Brown University
 Barbara Y. Welke
University of Minnesota
 James Q. Whitman
Yale University
 Martin J. Wiener
Rice University
 Michael Willrich
Brandeis University
 John Fabian Witt
Columbia University

Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 26, No. 1, Spring 2008

Full text available at www.historycooperative.org/home/html
LHR home page at www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html

In This Issue vii

Articles

The Federal *Posse Comitatus* Doctrine: Slavery, Compulsion,
and Statecraft in Mid-Nineteenth-Century America
Gautham Rao 1

Shareholder and Director Liability for Unpaid Workers' Wages
in Canada: From Condition of Granting Limited Liability to
Exceptional Remedy
Eric Tucker 57

Forum: Consciousness and Culpability on Trial

The Mind of a Moral Agent: Scottish Common Sense and the
Problem of Responsibility in Nineteenth-Century American Law
Susanna L. Blumenthal 99

Comment

The Metaphysics of Mind and the Practical Science of the Law
Sarah A. Seo and John Fabian Witt 161

Scottish Common Sense and Nineteenth-Century American Law:
A Critical Appraisal
John Mikhail 167

Response

Metaphysics, Moral Sense, and the Pragmatism of the Law
Susanna L. Blumenthal 177

Book Reviews

The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Law—
Michael Gagarin and David Cohen, editors
reviewed by Nicole LeFrancois 187

<i>Crime and Punishment in Islamic Law: Theory and Practice from the Sixteenth to the Twenty-First Century</i> —Rudolph Peters reviewed by Christopher Melchert	188
<i>On Common Laws</i> —H. Patrick Glenn reviewed by Emily Kadens	190
<i>The Theory and Practice of Revolt in Medieval England</i> — Claire Valente reviewed by Robert C. Stacey	191
<i>The Rise and Fall of the English Ecclesiastical Courts, 1500–1860</i> —R. B. Outhwaite reviewed by Stephen Waddams	193
<i>Law and Authority in Early Modern England: Essays Presented to Thomas Garden Barnes</i> —Buchanan Sharp and Mark Charles Fissel, editors reviewed by Howard Nenner	195
<i>Crime and Law in England, 1750–1840: Remaking Justice from the Margins</i> —Peter King reviewed by Thomas P. Gallanis	197
<i>The Bar and the Old Bailey, 1750–1850</i> —Allyson N. May reviewed by Wendie Ellen Schneider	198
<i>John Wilkes: The Scandalous Father of Civil Liberty</i> — Arthur H. Cash reviewed by Timothy Milford	200
<i>A Jurisprudence of Power: Victorian Empire and the Rule of Law</i> — R. W. Kostal reviewed by Michael Ashley Stein	201
<i>Reconstructing the Commercial Republic: Constitutional Design after Madison</i> —Stephen L. Elkin reviewed by Alison L. LaCroix	203
<i>M’Culloch v. Maryland: Securing a Nation</i> —Mark R. Killenbeck reviewed by Gerard N. Magliocca	205
<i>American Taxation, American Slavery</i> —Robin L. Einhorn reviewed by Ajay K. Mehrotra	206
<i>The Rescue of Joshua Glover: A Fugitive Slave, the Constitution, and the Coming of the Civil War</i> —H. Robert Baker reviewed by Albert J. von Frank	208

<i>Slave Agriculture and Financial Markets in Antebellum America: The Bank of the United States in Mississippi, 1831–1852—</i> Richard Holcombe Kilbourne, Jr. reviewed by Jenny Wahl	210
<i>Justice Curtis in the Civil War Era: At the Crossroads of American Constitutionalism—</i> Stuart Streichler reviewed by George Van Cleve	211
<i>The Limits of Sovereignty: Property Confiscation in the Union and the Confederacy during the Civil War—</i> Daniel W. Hamilton reviewed by Stephen A. Siegel	213
<i>Democracy Reborn: The Fourteenth Amendment and the Fight for Equal Rights in Post–Civil War America—</i> Garrett Epps reviewed by Alexander Tsesis	215
<i>The Abortion Rights Controversy in America: A Legal Reader—</i> N. E. H. Hull, William James Hoffer, and Peter Charles Hoffer, editors reviewed by Felice Batlan	216
<i>Noble Purposes: Nine Champions of the Rule of Law—</i> Norman Gross, editor reviewed by Paul D. Carrington	218
<i>The American State Constitutional Tradition—</i> John J. Dinan reviewed by Robert F. Williams	219
<i>Calculating Promises: The Emergence of Modern American Contract Doctrine—</i> Roy Kreitner reviewed by A. W. Brian Simpson	221
<i>Governing Through Crime: How the War on Crime Transformed American Democracy and Created a Culture of Fear—</i> Jonathan Simon reviewed by Christopher Waldrep	222
<i>Mobsters, Unions, and Feds: The Mafia and the American Labor Movement—</i> James B. Jacobs reviewed by Joseph Slater	224