

Law and History Review

Law and History Review

Editor

Christopher Tomlins
American Bar Foundation

Book Review Editor

William J. Novak
University of Chicago

Managing Editor

Diane Clay
American Bar Foundation

Law and History Review (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6903. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

© 1998 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

Law and History Review

Volume 16, Number 3

Fall 1998

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editorial Board

- David Abraham
University of Miami
- William P. Alford
Harvard University
- Mary Frances Berry
University of Pennsylvania
- Thomas Brennan
U.S. Naval Academy
- Martin Chanock
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Elaine Clark
*University of Michigan,
Dearborn*
- Martha F. Davis
*NOW Legal Defense,
New York*
- Thomas J. Davis
Arizona State University
- Cornelia Dayton
University of Connecticut
- Laura Engelstein
Princeton University
- Jean-Marie Fecteau
*Université du Québec
à Montréal*
- Christian G. Fritz
University of New Mexico
- Judy Fudge
York University, Toronto
- Paul Hyams
Cornell University
- Nancy Isenberg
University of Northern Iowa
- Bruce Kercher
Macquarie University, NSW
- Diane Kirkby
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Michael Klarman
University of Virginia
- David Konig
*Washington University,
St. Louis*
- Mindie Lazarus-Black
*University of Illinois at
Chicago*
- Kenneth F. Ledford
*Case Western Reserve
University*
- Brian P. Levack
University of Texas at Austin
- Janette Neeson
York University, Toronto
- Kent Newmyer
University of Connecticut
- James P. Oakes
Northwestern University
- John V. Orth
University of North Carolina
- Steven Pincus
University of Chicago
- W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
Columbia*
- Nicole Hahn Rafter
Northeastern University
- Gerry R. Rubin
*University of Kent,
Canterbury*
- Lucy E. Salyer
*University of
New Hampshire*
- John Henry Schlegel
SUNY, Buffalo
- Stephen A. Siegel
De Paul University
- Rayman L. Solomon
Northwestern University
- Robin Chapman Stacey
University of Washington
- Robert J. Steinfeld
SUNY, Buffalo
- Emily Z. Tabuteau
Michigan State University
- Victor M. Uribe
*Florida International
University*
- Barbara Y. Welke
University of Oregon
- James Q. Whitman
Yale University
- Stephen C. Yeazell
*University of California,
Los Angeles*

Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscripts and all general editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611 (tel 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579; e-m <clt@abfn.org>). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to William J. Novak, Department of History, University of Chicago, 1126 East 59th Street, Chicago, IL 60637 (tel 773 702 7938; fax 773 702 7550; e-m <nov9@midway.uchicago.edu>). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page <www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html>. Please use word processing wherever possible. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

Contents

Law and History Review Vol. 16, No. 3, Fall 1998
www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html

In This Issue vi

Articles

One Hundred Years of Rectitude: Medical Witnesses at
the Old Bailey, 1717–1817
Stephan Landsman 445

A. V. Dicey, Lord Watson, and the Law of the
Canadian Constitution in the Late Nineteenth Century
David Schneiderman 495

Forum: The Founders and the States

Motives at Philadelphia, 1787: Gordon Wood's
Neo-Beardian Thesis Reexamined
Shlomo Slonim 527

Comment

“Motives at Philadelphia”: A Comment on Slonim
Gordon S. Wood 553

Response

Rejoinder to Gordon Wood
Shlomo Slonim 563

Notes and Commentary

Gun Laws in Early America: The Regulation of
Firearms Ownership, 1607–1794
Michael A. Bellesiles 567

Book Reviews

*The Conflict of Law and Justice in the Icelandic
Sagas*—William Pencak
reviewed by Robin Chapman Stacey 591

*The Formation of the English Common Law: Law and Society in
England from the Norman Conquest to Magna Carta*—John Hudson
reviewed by James A. Brundage 593

<i>The Earliest English Law Reports: Volumes I and II—</i> Paul Brand, editor reviewed by Daniel Klerman	595
<i>Marriage, Family, and Law in Medieval Europe: Collected Studies—</i> Michael M. Sheehan reviewed by Thomas Kuehn	596
<i>Adultery and Divorce in Calvin's Geneva—</i> Robert M. Kingdon reviewed by Cornelia Hughes Dayton	599
<i>Reordering Marriage and Society in Reformation Germany—</i> Joel F. Harrington reviewed by Christopher R. Friedrichs	601
<i>From General Estate to Special Interest: German Lawyers, 1878–1933—</i> Kenneth F. Ledford reviewed by Peter C. Caldwell	603
<i>Venality: The Sale of Offices in Eighteenth-Century France—</i> William Doyle reviewed by Thomas Brennan	605
<i>Reforming the Russian Legal System—</i> Gordon B. Smith reviewed by Peter B. Maggs	607
<i>Fate of a Free People—</i> Henry Reynolds reviewed by Michael Roe	608
<i>Judging the State: Courts and Constitutional Politics in Pakistan—</i> Paula R. Newberg reviewed by Robin Jeffrey	610
<i>Essays in the History of Canadian Law. Vol. 5, Crime and Criminal Justice—</i> Jim Phillips, Tina Loo, and Susan Lewthwaite, editors reviewed by A. M. Givertz	612
<i>Law and Providence in Joseph Bellamy's New England: Origins of the New Divinity in Revolutionary America—</i> Mark Valeri reviewed by Katherine A. Hermes	615
<i>The Great Chief Justice: John Marshall and the Rule of Law—</i> Charles F. Hobson, and <i>The Chief Justiceship of John Marshall, 1801–1835—</i> Herbert A. Johnson reviewed by Forrest McDonald	617
<i>Indian Depredation Claims, 1796–1920—</i> Larry C. Skogen reviewed by Brad Asher	620

<i>Water, Land, and Law in the West: The Limits of Public Policy, 1850–1920</i> —Donald J. Pisani	
reviewed by Kathleen A. Brosnan	622
<i>Property and Persuasion: Essays on the History, Theory, and Rhetoric of Ownership</i> —Carol M. Rose	
reviewed by Neal Milner	624
<i>I've Got the Light of Freedom: The Organizing Tradition and the Mississippi Freedom Struggle</i> —Charles M. Payne	
reviewed by Mary L. Dudziak	626
<i>Forced Justice: School Desegregation and the Law</i> —David J. Armor, and <i>Race Relations Litigation in an Age of Complexity</i> —Stephen L. Wasby	
reviewed by Davison M. Douglas	628
<i>Against the Death Penalty: The Relentless Dissents of Justices Brennan and Marshall</i> —Michael Mello, and <i>Against Capital Punishment: The Anti-Death Penalty Movement in America, 1972–1994</i> —Herbert H. Haines	
reviewed by Francis A. Allen	631
The H-Law Resource Page	635