

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

ILIJAS FARAH    AKIHIRO KANAMORI    PHOKION KOLAITIS  
MANUEL LERMAN    PENELOPE MADDY    KATRIN TENT

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

STEVE AWODEY    JOHN BALDWIN    LEV BEKLEMISHEV  
MIRNA DŽAMONJA    DAVID EVANS    ERICH GRÄDEL  
DENIS HIRSCHFELDT    ROGER MADDUX    LUKE ONG  
GRIGORI MINTS    VOLKER PECKHAUS    SŁAWOMIR SOLECKI

VOLUME 12 · NUMBER 4 · DECEMBER 2006  
ISSN 1079-8986

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS

---

*Copyright ©2006 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

Gödel's Program revisited, Part I: the turn to phenomenology, by KAI HAUSER . . . . .	529
---	-----

### COMMUNICATIONS

Internal consistency and the inner model hypothesis, by SY-DAVID FRIEDMAN . . . . .	591
---	-----

### REVIEWS

M. Tiles, <i>The philosophy of set theory, an historical introduction to Cantor's paradise</i> . Reviewed by M. Randall Holmes . . . . .	601
P. Cholak (editor), <i>The Notre Dame Lectures</i> . Reviewed by Roman Kossak . . . . .	605
W. Tait, <i>The provenance of pure reason: essays in the philosophy of mathematics and its history</i> . Reviewed by Jeremy Avigad . . . . .	608
L. Crosilla and P. Schuster (editors), <i>From sets and types to topology and analysis—towards practicable foundations for constructive mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Jaap van Oosten . . . . .	611
2005–06 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Antonio Convention Center, San Antonio, Texas, January 14–15, 2006 . . . . .	
Members of the Association . . . . .	613
Association for Symbolic Logic . . . . .	625
Notices . . . . .	682
Notices . . . . .	687

---

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN 1079-8986) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604-0001, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Poughkeepsie NY and at additional mailing offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC; the 2006 annual subscription price for the two journals is US\$515. Online subscription is available from Project Euclid; visit <http://projecteuclid.org/bs1>. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic*, c/o American Mathematical Society, 201 Charles Street, Providence, RI 02904-2294, USA. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, Charles Steinhorn (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN and the JOURNAL are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in all aspects of symbolic logic. The BULLETIN encourages submission of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

*Articles* should be of broad interest and accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may be purely expository, survey, or historical articles, or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

*Communications* should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final versions.

*Continued on inside back cover*

THE  
BULLETIN  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

ILIJAS FARAH    AKIHIRO KANAMORI    PHOKION KOLAITIS  
MANUEL LERMAN    PENELOPE MADDY    KATRIN TENT

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

STEVE AWODEY    JOHN BALDWIN    LEV BEKLEMISHEV  
MIRNA DŽAMONJA    DAVID EVANS    ERICH GRÄDEL  
DENIS HIRSCHFELDT    ROGER MADDUX    LUKE ONG  
GRIGORI MINTS    VOLKER PECKHAUS    SŁAWOMIR SOLECKI

VOLUME 12  
2006

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

---

The four numbers of Volume 12 are copyrighted ©2006 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the BULLETIN by photostat, photoprint, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission, to be obtained from the Secretary of the Association, Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.

This BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U. S. Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME 12

### ARTICLES

BALCAR, BOHUSLAV and JECH, THOMAS. Weak distributivity, a problem of von Neumann and the mystery of measurability . . . . .	241
CALVERT, WESLEY and KNIGHT, JULIA F. Classification from a computable viewpoint . . . . .	191
CORCORAN, JOHN. Schemata: the concept of schema in the history of logic . . . . .	219
DE MOL, LIESBETH. Closing the circle: an analysis of Emil Post's early work . . . . .	267
DOWNNEY, ROD, HIRSCHFELDT, DENIS R., NIES, ANDRÉ, and TERWIJN, SEBASTIAAN A. Calibrating randomness . . . . .	411
HAUSER, KAI. Gödel's Program revisited, Part I: the turn to phenomenology . . . . .	529
JANÉ, IGNACIO. What is Tarski's <i>common</i> concept of consequence? . . . . .	1
KEISLER, H. JEROME. Nonstandard arithmetic and reverse mathematics . . . . .	100
LINSKY, BERNARD and ZALTA, EDWARD N. What is neologicism? . . . . .	60
MILLER, JOSEPH S. and NIES, ANDRÉ. Randomness and computability: open questions . . . . .	390
NORMANN, DAG. Computing with functionals—computability theory or computer science? . . . . .	43
SHORE, RICHARD A. Degree structures: local and global investigations . . . . .	369
WEIERMANN, ANDREAS. Classifying the provably total functions of PA . . . . .	177

### COMMUNICATIONS

FRIEDMAN, SY-DAVID. Internal consistency and the inner model hypothesis . . . . .	591
---	-----

### REVIEWS

I. Farah, <i>Analytic quotients</i> . Reviewed by D. H. Fremlin . . . . .	126
K. R. Apt, <i>Principles of constraint programming</i> . Reviewed by Hubie Chen . . . . .	128
G. Priest, J. C. Beall, and B. Armour-Garb (editors), <i>The law of non-contradiction: New philosophical essays</i> . Reviewed by Francis Jeffry Pelletier . . . . .	131
H.-C. Schmidt am Busch and K. F. Wehmeier (editors), <i>Heinrich Scholz. Logiker, Philosoph, Theologe</i> . Reviewed by Matthias Wille . . . . .	135
V. F. Hendricks, <i>Logical lyrics: From philosophy to poetics</i> . Reviewed by Amirouche Moktefi . . . . .	137
V. Peckhaus (editor), <i>Oskar Becker und die Philosophie der Mathematik</i> . Reviewed by Risto Vilkkio . . . . .	137
M. van Lambalgen and F. Hamm, <i>The proper treatment of events</i> . Reviewed by Marcus Kracht . . . . .	139
R. Wolf, <i>A tour through mathematical logic</i> . Reviewed by Michael Stob . . . . .	141
J. Nolt, <i>Logics</i> . Reviewed by Richard L. Epstein . . . . .	290
B. Hale and C. Wright, <i>The reason's proper study: Essays toward a neo-Fregean philosophy of mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Gabriel Uzquiano . . . . .	291

G. Priest, <i>An introduction to non-classical logic</i> . Reviewed by Petr Hájek . . . . .	294
F. Kamareddine, T. Laan, and R. Nederpelt, <i>A modern perspective on type theory—From its origins until today</i> . Reviewed by Marc Bezem . . . . .	296
T. Ehrhard, J.-Y. Girard, P. Ruet, and P. Scott, <i>Linear logic in computer science</i> . Reviewed by Andrzej S. Murawski . . . . .	297
I. Neeman, <i>The determinacy of long games</i> . Reviewed by Andrés Eduardo Caicedo . . . . .	299
D. J. Pym and E. Ritter <i>Reductive logic and proof-search—Proof theory, semantics, and control</i> . Reviewed by Didier Galmiche . . . . .	302
M. Mitzenmacher and E. Upfal, <i>Probability and computing: Randomized algorithms and probabilistic analysis</i> . Reviewed by Mary Cryan . . . . .	304
E. Schechter, <i>Classical and nonclassical logic: an introduction to the mathematics of propositions</i> . Reviewed by Roger D. Maddux . . . . .	308
M. Hallett and U. Majer (editors), <i>David Hilbert's lectures on the foundations of geometry 1891–1902</i> . Reviewed by Jan von Plato . . . . .	492
M. Dietzfelbinger, <i>Primality testing in polynomial time</i> . Reviewed by Charles Rackoff . . . . .	494
D. Macbeth, <i>Frege's logic</i> . Reviewed by Norma B. Goethe . . . . .	496
A. Bundy, D. Basin, D. Hutter and A. Ireland, <i>Rippling: meta-level guidance for mathematical reasoning</i> . Reviewed by Joe Hurd . . . . .	498
D. Makinson, <i>Bridges from classical to nonmonotonic logic</i> . Reviewed by Hykel Hosni . . . . .	499
M. Tiles, <i>The philosophy of set theory, an historical introduction to Cantor's paradise</i> . Reviewed by M. Randall Holmes . . . . .	601
P. Cholak (editor), <i>The Notre Dame Lectures</i> . Reviewed by Roman Kossak . . . . .	605
W. Tait, <i>The provenance of pure reason: essays in the philosophy of mathematics and its history</i> . Reviewed by Jeremy Avigad . . . . .	608
L. Crosilla and P. Schuster (editors), <i>From sets and types to topology and analysis—towards practicable foundations for constructive mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Jaap van Oosten . . . . .	611

#### MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

2005 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Stanford University, Stanford, CA, March 19–22, 2005 . . . . .	143
2005 Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Logic Colloquium '05, Athens, Greece, July 28–August 3, 2005 . . . . .	310
2005–06 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, The Hilton New York Hotel, New York, NY, December 27–29, 2005 . . . . .	503
2005–06 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Antonio Convention Center, San Antonio, Texas, January 14–15, 2006 . . . . .	613

#### MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

2005 Annual Conference of the Australasian Association for Logic, Perth, Australia, September 24–25, 2005 . . . . .	517
Notices . . . . .	168, 362, 524, 687
Association for Symbolic Logic . . . . .	682
Members of the Association . . . . .	625