

As a whole, Tijsseling has offered a helpful and intriguing volume on Celsus's critiques of the Gospels and Jesus. Its fundamental contribution is not so much in solving the relationship between the text used by Celsus and the later *Toledot Yeshu* (I think that problem remains unresolved), but in highlighting the nature of early Jewish polemics against Christianity and how that illumines the relationship between Jews and Christians in the second century. Particularly useful in this regard is the appendix, which highlights 177 testimonials of Celsus, including the Greek text (with text-critical notes) and an English translation. Scholars of second-century Christianity will benefit from simply reading through these testimonials, conveniently gathered into one volume.


Michael J. Kruger  
Reformed Theological Seminary  
Charlotte, NC  
doi:10.1017/S0009640723001919

***Tolerance, Intolerance, and Recognition in Early Christianity and Early Judaism.*** Edited by **Outi Lehtipuu** and **Michael Labahn**. *Early Christianity and the Roman World 2*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2021. 314 pp. € 136,00 hardcover.

This collection of essays has its origin in the discussions of the Early Christianity research group held at the annual meeting of the European Association of Biblical Studies (EABS), hosted in Córdoba in 2015. The editors further credit as an important influence the research conducted at the Centre of Excellence on Reason and Religious Recognition supported by the Faculty of Theology at the University of Helsinki from 2014 until 2019. The volume under consideration here brings together ten essays along with an introduction by the editors and a compelling epilogue by Amy Jill Levine.

Three sections structure the essays in this volume: (1) Conditions of Tolerance; (2) Jewish-Christian Relations between Tolerance and Intolerance; and (3) Tolerance and Questions of Persecution, Gender, and Ecology. The essays of section 1 examine the contexts of tolerance in the Dead Sea Scrolls, the New Testament, and early Christian communities using interpretive lenses such as ethnicity, theological constructions of the “other,” and the management of intercommunal conflict, respectively. In section 2, the authors highlight the varying nature of Jewish–Christian relations under the Roman empire. Topics of interest here range widely, encompassing Paul’s attitudes toward Jews and Gentiles; interpretations by patristic figures (Gregory of Nazianzus, John Chrysostom, and Augustine) of the Maccabean martyrs; Cyril of Alexandria’s covert use of Philo to hide his intellectual debt to an influential Jewish thinker; and, finally, the interplay of Jewish and Christian discourses in Origen and the rabbinic text *Leviticus Rabbah* on the idea of miraculous birth. Section 3 features essays that bring the volume’s overall themes of tolerance and recognition into dialogue with issues of religious persecution, gender, and ecology. The essays on gender and ecology in this last section, as well as Amy Jill Levine’s epilogue, helpfully underscore the relevance of ancient debates on tolerance and recognition to the contemporary world.

This superb volume will be of interest not only to those wishing to learn how tolerance and recognition can be understood and analyzed in ancient contexts, but also to those who seek to use the evidence of the ancient world to think and speak about similar concerns in the present day.

Jeffrey Cross   
 University of Minnesota  
 doi:10.1017/S0009640723001889

***The Crucified Book: Sacred Writings in the Age of Valentinus.*** By Anne Starr Kreps. *Divinations: Rereading Late Ancient Religion.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2022. viii + 186 pp. \$65 hardcover; \$65 eBook.

This is one special book. That is the claim, at least, of the *Gospel of Truth*, the centerpiece of Anne Starr Kreps's insightful volume about Valentinian scriptural practices. According to the *Gospel of Truth*, the crucified Jesus clothed himself with a book, fulfilling his identity as the embodiment of "knowledge and completion," as evidenced in his "reading out the contents of the heart." *The Crucified Book* argues that the *Gospel* here centralizes scriptural authority within the "living documents" of Jesus and his followers, thus positing a more orally-centered and fluid model of revelatory authority (2). *The Crucified Book* establishes that this Valentinian approach to scripture, though perhaps divergent from other early Christian models, was not so strange amidst the broader textual practices of the ancient Mediterranean.

Chapter 1, "The Joyful Gospel," examines the *Gospel of Truth*'s "self-presentation as a revelatory text" (12), arguing that, despite the *Gospel*'s reputation as a scriptural "outlier," it "follows the main currents of the Roman and Jewish book culture of the time" (18). This is evident, Kreps argues, in the book's alignment with Roman modes of book publication, which often featured many editions and layers of editing, as well as Jewish models of continuous revelation (e.g., in the works of Philo of Alexandria or *Genesis Rabbah*) (30, 35). Chapter 2, "The Valentinian Gospel as Scriptural Practice," explores how the conflation of books and bodies functioned as a "scriptural practice" in second-century Valentinian milieus. Building on the work of David Brakke, Kreps argues that a Valentinian model of "interior sacred textuality"—that is, that the human body itself, through Jesus and select followers, could be a vehicle for continuous divine revelation—"informed a coherent scriptural practice" (43). This practice, in turn, fits well with comparable textual practices of the ancient Mediterranean (e.g., in 4 Ezra) (50).

Chapter 3, "The *Gospel of Truth* According to the Christian Heresiographers," contrasts the relative textual fluidity of Valentinian scriptural models with those of their opponents, early Christian "proto-orthodox" heresiologists. Irenaeus, Tertullian, and Epiphanius figure prominently here, supporting Kreps's case that the heresiologists' criticism of Valentinian scriptural practices "was not just an effort to silence certain texts, but a sign of deep disagreement on how such texts operate" (69). Chapter 4, "Rabbis Who Published and Perished," explores how ancient Jewish notions of a "dual Torah" (i.e., written and oral) provide a close analogue to Valentinian notions