

Parsing out differences between multiple miraculous image-objects by turning to the terms of these debates (e.g., *res*, *res sacramenti*, *signum*) would have helped clarify the ways that medieval and early modern people understood these images in relation to one another. Moreover, the relationship between relics and miraculous images would have also benefited from more discussion; they are only briefly noted in the introduction, in which Balzamo writes that figural representations (that are considered to be miraculous) actually overtake relics in terms of importance at the end of the Middle Ages (33).

In sum, *L'image miraculeuse* is an excellent volume for anyone working on this broad topic and specifically for scholars and teachers who are looking for a well-organized and synthetic account of the history of miraculous images in European Christianity. For those teaching at Francophone universities, I could easily imagine multiple essays in this volume being appropriate for both undergraduate and graduate students, specifically Balzamo's introduction and those case studies I have cited above. Although it cannot stand alone as a new definitive history on this topic given its focus on particular media and places, it productively contributes to our ongoing understanding of the history of miraculous images, the ways we might sensitively approach their study today, and what they might have in common across a historically expansive period of time.

Nancy Thebaut
Skidmore College

doi:10.1017/S0009640723001932

***The Late Medieval Cistercian Monastery of Fountains Abbey, Yorkshire: Monastic Administration, Economy, and Archival Memory.* By Michael Spence. Medieval Monastic Studies 5. Turnhout: Brepols, 2020. 208 pp. € 75.00 cloth.**

Michael Spence's study of the late medieval Cistercian abbey of Fountains will be of interest to scholars studying medieval monasticism, the late medieval English economy, and medieval archival practices. Spence's book analyzes the archival memory of Fountains abbey. Specifically, he studies the memories that the monks preserved in their cartularies, inventories, and charters and the ways these texts reflect the monks' recopying and reorganization of their economic and legal documents. Spence performs what he calls a "forensic analysis" of these materials, using them to reconstruct other documents that are now missing. His study considers the relationship between documentary production and the political, economic, and demographic crises of the long fifteenth century.

Spence notes that the history of Fountains Abbey during its first 150 years has been thoroughly explored, as have the last fifty years before the Dissolution of the Monasteries. Spence instead focuses on what he, following John Van Engen, calls the long fifteenth century. In fact, the fourteenth century is pivotal for Spence's analysis, as this was the period in which the monastery transitioned from a grange-based economy to one based on tenancies and rents. Fountains in the fifteenth century continued to face demographic challenges, but it also faced new political ones. Not only economic

transformations, but also the papal schism and the wars between the Yorks and Lancasters influenced the monastery's relations with its patrons, provoked disputes over its abbots, and encouraged its production of documents. Central to Spence's study is the abbot John Greenwell (1442–1471) who assumed his position after a long period of instability in which monks fought over the office of abbot and the followers of the Percy family at times occupied the abbey and its properties. In fact, Greenwell still had to negotiate between the Yorks and the Lancasters; Spence notes that the Yorkist Nevilles assaulted the abbey in 1443, and that Greenwell had to hide his Lancastrian sympathies in an oath to Edward IV in 1461, an oath that Henry VI annulled ten years later. It is in this context of late fourteenth- and fifteenth-century political and economic crises that the monks of Fountains produced many of their extant documents, especially the majority of their cartularies and other business records.

After providing a chronological overview, Spence organizes his book topically. Drawing on the scholarship of Patrick Geary and Constance Bouchard, he emphasizes that the monks did not assemble their cartularies and related documents in a passive fashion but instead selected and organized the contents according to political and economic concerns. He focuses especially on the fifteenth-century "President Book," which he argues served as an aide-memoire for Abbot Greenwell. Appearing to be a compendium of nine independently produced sections (explained in Appendix I), this composite codex contains a set of indices to extant and no longer extant cartularies, a catalogue and chronicle of abbots, and detailed lists of acquisitions and revenues in two districts of the monastery's property. Spence uses this codex to demonstrate Greenwell's documentary practices. First, he shows that Greenwell's cross-referencing techniques linked each index to a discrete document; he later argues that these referencing tools parallel the practices of theologically trained scholars educated in exegetical studies. Second, he shows that Greenwell carefully reshaped the history of the abbey and his list of abbots to gloss over the early fifteenth-century disputes in the abbey. He also shows how one fascicule's careful reworking of the landholdings and rents due from one particular sheep-rearing estate reclassified the financial commitments due to the abbey as well as reconstructing the genealogies of the benefactors.

The book's final chapter pulls together the insights from the early chapters to offer a forensic approach to the cartularies from Fountains. Recognizing that the "President Book" indexes a no longer extant cartulary, Spence ties the rewriting of the abbey's cartularies to changing economic practices and the varied ways the monks used their documents. Both cartulary 1 and the now missing cartulary were navigational tools that inventoried the monks' archive of charters, but their differences reflect the fourteenth-century move from a grange economy to one based on rents and tenancies. Other cartularies were made for the supervision of manor courts (Cartulary 2) and for display to enhance the abbey's prestige (Cartulary 3); still other cartularies served again as inventories to replace missing volumes of the cartulary Spence hypothesizes. Spence concludes that the archival memory and redaction processes at Fountains demonstrates the choir monks' professional attention to their record keeping and their concern for their temporal well-being, despite the vicissitudes of the long fifteenth century.

Spence ends his monograph with six appendices that introduce in detail the manuscripts he analyzes in his chapters. Readers might want to start with these appendices, as they present essential information to which the text in the chapters only alludes. The

book still shows signs of the dissertation it once was, especially in the descriptions of hypotheses and interpretations that Spence presents and then dismisses. Nonetheless, this volume provides a valuable analysis of the ways monks shaped their archives to respond to economic, legal, and political situations. Spence's application of forensic methods to these documents offers an important model for the study of other monastic archives.

Martha G. Newman
The University of Texas at Austin
doi:10.1017/S0009640723001658

Arabic Christianity between the Ottoman Levant and Eastern Europe. Edited by Ioana Feodorov, Bernard Heyberger, and Samuel Noble. Arabic Christianity: Texts and Studies. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2021. xviii + 375 pp. \$134.00 hardcover.

Arabic Christianity between the Ottoman Levant and Eastern Europe is the third volume in the series “Arabic Christianity: Texts and Studies,” published by Brill. This area of study was launched in the journal *al-Machriq* (1898) by the formidable Jesuit scholar, Louis Cheikho of St. Joseph University in Beirut (d. 1927), and it has been gaining momentum in scholarship ever since. As the condition of Christians becomes more and more precarious in the Middle East, the study of their history, theology, and cultural legacy becomes urgent. This book is a welcome contribution in a field where there is much-needed scholarship.

The book originated in a conference of which thirteen papers are included. It is in three parts, with an epilogue in which Ioana Feodorov describes the exhibit of Melkite icons in Beirut, Lebanon, in 1969. She gives a detailed history of that groundbreaking exhibit, describing the role her father, Virgil Cândea, played in its inception. The exhibit was so original that many similar exhibits have been organized in the past half-century—as the article by Charbel Nassif shows (in the chapter preceding Feodorov's, in Part 3). Nassif describes the subsequent exhibits in Syria, Lebanon, The Netherlands, France, Switzerland, and Germany, adding a list of the names of local painters in the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries, the names of the few foreign painters, and a survey of the modern historians who have studied the icons (317–325). As Nassif sadly concludes, however, many of the icons were stolen or destroyed during wars in Lebanon and Syria.

The articles in the book cover a vast geographical range, from Eastern Europe to the Ottoman Levant, and therefore the chapters differ widely in their subject matter. Part 1 opens with an article by Bernard Heyberger, in which he describes the relationship between the Roman Catholic Church and the Orthodox Christians, emphasizing the role that the church played in the connections between the two communities. The article is followed by Constantin A. Panchenko's study of the role of the Wallachian monks of the Monastery of St. Catherine in populating St. Saba in Palestine in the sixteenth century, and the Slavic support to the “monastic brethren in Palestine” (43).