

VOLUME 28

NUMBER 3

JULY 2019

CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Langone Medical Center, New York*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Denise Dudzinski, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*  
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Christine Mitchell, *Center for Bioethics, Harvard Medical School*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburgh & West Virginia University*

**The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World**

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.

<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-quarterly-of-healthcare-ethics/cambridge-bioethics-education-working-groups>

CLINICAL NEUROETHICS ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*  
[kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com)

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Yves Agid, *Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Épineière, France*  
Jennifer Chandler, *University of Ottawa, Canada*  
Markus Christen, *University of Zurich, Switzerland*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*  
Grant Gillett, *University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Stephen Hauser, *University of California, San Francisco*  
Judy Illes, *The University of British Columbia, Canada*  
Philipp Kellmeyer, *University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*  
Catherine Madison, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Christine Mitchell, *Harvard Medical School*  
Erik Parens, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
John R. Shook, *University at Buffalo*  
Alan Yee, *California Pacific Medical Center*

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat  
<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 28, Number 3, July 2019

## CONTENTS

Contributors 385

### *Special Section: Open Forum*

From the Editors: The Challenge of Tribalism:  
Is It Time for a Truce? 389

### *Symposium: New Challenges to Clinical Communication in Serious Illness*

GUEST EDITORS: JASON N. BATTEN AND DAVID C. MAGNUS

Introduction: Through the Lens of Linguistic Theory  
JASON N. BATTEN AND DAVID C. MAGNUS 392

Treatability Statements in Serious Illness: The Gap Between  
What Is Said and What Is Heard  
JASON N. BATTEN, BONNIE O. WONG, WILLIAM F. HANKS,  
AND DAVID C. MAGNUS 394

Commentary: Whither Physician Talk and Medicine's Tools?  
SHARON R. KAUFMAN 405

Commentary: "When I Use a Word," with Respect for  
Lewis Carroll  
JOANNE LYNN 410

Commentary: Dangerous Disconnections  
KEVIN P. WEINFURT 413

Commentary: Communication: The Most Important  
"Procedure" in Healthcare and Bioethics  
PETER G. BRINDLEY 415

Commentary: Treating Ambiguity in the Clinical Context:  
Is What You Hear the Doctor Say What the Doctor Means?  
VICKI XAFIS AND DOMINIC WILKINSON 422

Response to Commentaries: When "Everyday Language"  
Contributes to Miscommunication in Serious Illness  
JASON N. BATTEN, BONNIE O. WONG, AND DAVID C. MAGNUS 433

### *Articles*

Precision QALYs, Precisely Unjust  
LEONARD M. FLECK 439

Self-Inflicted Gunshot Wound as a Consideration in the Patient  
Selection Process for Facial Transplantation  
MICHELLE W. MCQUINN, LAURA L. KIMBERLY, BRENDAN PARENT,  
J. RODRIGO DIAZ-SISO, ARTHUR L. CAPLAN, AILEEN G. BLITZ,  
AND EDUARDO D. RODRIGUEZ 450

*Contents continued*

*Contents continued*

Commentary: A Second Chance at Life  
ALEXANDRE G. LELLOUCH AND LAURENT A. LANTIERI 463

Marketing the Research Missions of Academic Medical  
Centers: Why Messages Blurring Lines Between Clinical  
Care and Research Are Bad for Both Business and Ethics  
MARK YARBOROUGH, TIMOTHY HOUK, SARAH TINKER PERRAULT,  
Yael Schenker, and Richard R. Sharp 468

Fetal Repair of Open Neural Tube Defects: Ethical, Legal, and  
Social Issues  
Julia A.E. Radic, Judy Illes, and Patrick J. McDonald 476

Why Is an Egg Donor a Genetic Parent, But Not a Mitochondrial  
Donor?  
Monika Piotrowska 488

*In Vitro* Gametogenesis and the Creation of ‘Designer Babies’  
Seppe Segers, Guido Pennings, Wybo Dondorp,  
Guido de Wert, and Heidi Mertes 499

Urban Bioethics: A Call for the Prestige  
Nia Johnson and Lance Wahler 509

*Departments and Columns*

*Responses and Dialogue*

Dignity, Body Parts, and the *Actio Iniuriarum*: A Novel  
Solution to a Common (Law) Problem?: A Reply to  
Charles Foster’s “Dignity and the Ownership and Use  
of Body Parts” (CQ 23(4))  
Jonathan Brown 522

Human Dignity: Be Philosophical and European, But Not  
Scottish: A Response to the Article by Jonathan Brown  
Charles Foster 534

*Bioethics Education*

Empowering Graduate Students to Address Ethics in  
Research Environments  
Elisabeth Hildt, Kelly Laas, Christine Miller,  
Stephanie Taylor, and Eric M. Brey 542

*The Foundation of Research Ethics*

Research Ethics and Justice: The Case of Finland  
Tuija Takala and Matti Häyry 551

Addendum 577

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [kushnertk@gmail.com](mailto:kushnertk@gmail.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, 2532 N. 4th Street, #442 Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Books for review on neuroethics should be sent to Thomasine Kushner, 1001 Bridgeway #A1, Sausalito, CA 94965.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 28 (2019) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$670/£417; online only: \$532/£331; print only: \$665/£415. Individual rates, print only: \$139/£84. Single part: \$191/£119. Students and retirees: \$115/£72. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$96/£57. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2019. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).