

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

מרכז מינרבה לזכויות האדם

The Minerva Center for Human Rights

مركز مينربا لحقوق الانسان

Faculty of Law, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem



Volume 44

Numbers 1-2

2011

## SYMPOSIUM: HUMAN DIGNITY AND THE CRIMINAL LAW

- Introduction *Miriam Gur-Arye & Thomas Weigend*
- A Concept of Dignity *Meir Dan-Cohen*
- The Constitutional Status of Human Dignity  
in Germany and Israel *Ariel L. Bendor & Michael Sachs*
- Constitutional Review of Criminal Prohibitions  
Affecting Human Dignity and Liberty:  
German and Israeli Perspectives *Miriam Gur-Arye & Thomas Weigend*
- The Primacy of Liberty and Proportionality, Not Human Dignity,  
When Subjecting Criminal Law to Constitutional Control *Kent Roach*
- Human Dignity and the Principle  
of Culpability *Mordechai Kremnitzer & Tatjana Hörnle*
- Human Dignity as a Protected  
Interest in Criminal Law *Tatjana Hörnle & Mordechai Kremnitzer*
- Humiliation, Degradation, and Moral Capacity:  
A Response to Hörnle and Kremnitzer *John Kleinig*
- Human Dignity in the Criminal Process:  
The Example of Truth-Finding *Winfried Hassemer*
- Human Dignity in Criminal Procedure:  
A Comparative Overview of Israeli and German Law *Thomas Weigend & Khalid Ghanayim*
- The Protection of Human Dignity in Interrogations:  
May Interrogative Torture Ever Be Tolerated?  
Reflections in Light of Recent German and Israeli Experiences  
*Miriam Gur-Arye & Florian Jessberger*
- Human Dignity and Victims' Rights in the  
German and Israeli Criminal Process *Anat Horovitz & Thomas Weigend*
- Victimhood, Dignity, and the Criminal Justice System:  
A Comment *Leslie Sebba*

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

Volume 44

Numbers 1-2

2011

## SYMPOSIUM: HUMAN DIGNITY AND THE CRIMINAL LAW

Introduction	
<i>Miriam Gur-Arye and Thomas Weigend</i> .....	4
A Concept of Dignity	
<i>Meir Dan-Cohen</i> .....	9
The Constitutional Status of Human Dignity in Germany and Israel	
<i>Ariel L. Bendor and Michael Sachs</i> .....	25
Constitutional Review of Criminal Prohibitions Affecting Human Dignity and Liberty: German and Israeli Perspectives	
<i>Miriam Gur-Arye and Thomas Weigend</i> .....	63
The Primacy of Liberty and Proportionality, Not Human Dignity, When Subjecting Criminal Law to Constitutional Control	
<i>Kent Roach</i> .....	91
Human Dignity and the Principle of Culpability	
<i>Mordechai Kremnitzer and Tatjana Hörnle</i> .....	115
Human Dignity as a Protected Interest in Criminal Law	
<i>Tatjana Hörnle and Mordechai Kremnitzer</i> .....	143
Humiliation, Degradation, and Moral Capacity: A Response to Hörnle and Kremnitzer	
<i>John Kleinig</i> .....	169
Human Dignity in the Criminal Process: The Example of Truth-Finding	
<i>Winfried Hassemer</i> .....	185
Human Dignity in Criminal Procedure: A Comparative Overview of Israeli and German Law	
<i>Thomas Weigend and Khalid Ghanayim</i> .....	199
The Protection of Human Dignity in Interrogations: May Interrogative Torture Ever Be Tolerated? Reflections in Light of Recent German and Israeli Experiences	
<i>Miriam Gur-Arye and Florian Jessberger</i> .....	229
Human Dignity and Victims' Rights in the German and Israeli Criminal Process	
<i>Anat Horovitz and Thomas Weigend</i> .....	263
Victimhood, Dignity, and the Criminal Justice System: A Comment	
<i>Leslie Sebba</i> .....	301

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

Volume 44

Numbers 1-2

2011

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

SIR NIGEL RODLEY      YUVAL SHANY  
*Editors-in-Chief*

MIRIAM GUR-ARYE      THOMAS WEIGEND  
*Guest Editors*

DANNY EVRON  
*Executive Editor*

YAËL RONEN  
*Academic Editor*

DANIEL STEPHENS  
*Production Editor*

## STUDENT EDITORS

HAIM ABRAHAM  
MORAN ALRIAMI  
JOSH HERSCH

LITAL CASPER  
GALIT HELLER

Yael NAGGAN  
RIMONE RABINOVITCH  
ASAF LUBIN

## INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

- PROF. AHARON BARAK (*Former President of the Israeli Supreme Court*)  
PROF. DAPHNE BARAK-EREZ (*Tel Aviv University*)  
PROF. ANTONIO CASSESE† (*Florence University*)  
PROF. MALCOLM FEELEY (*University of California, Berkeley*)  
PROF. JOCHEN FROWEIN (*Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law  
and International Law, Heidelberg*)  
PROF. FRANÇOISE HAMPSON (*University of Essex*)  
PROF. VICKI JACKSON (*Harvard University*)  
PROF. MICHAEL KARAYANNI (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. ECKART KLEIN (*Potsdam University*)  
PROF. MORDECHAI KREMNIETZ (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. DAVID KRETZMER (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. FIONNUALA NÍ-AOLÁIN (*University of Minnesota and University of Ulster*)  
PROF. FRANCES RADAY (*College of Management Academic Studies, Rishon leZion*)  
PROF. WILLIAM SCHABAS (*Middlesex University, London;  
National University, Ireland*)  
PROF. MALCOLM SHAW (*Leicester University*)  
PROF. HENRY STEINER (*Harvard University*)

## ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

The *Israel Law Review* is the oldest and most acclaimed Israeli law journal published in English. Since its establishment in 1966 by the Law Faculty at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, the *Israel Law Review* has served as a leading source of legal scholarship on Israeli law and on issues relevant to Israeli society.

As of 2009, the *Israel Law Review* is published under the auspices and management of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem's Minerva Center for Human Rights. Under this new stewardship, it focuses on scholarship in the fields of human rights, public law and international law and examines the application of legal norms under conditions of conflict and political uncertainty, highlighting the relevance of the Israeli experience in these fields to other parts of the world and that of other societies to Israel. The *Israel Law Review* is peer-reviewed and presently indexed in major databases and abstracting services including Lexis, Hein, and EBSCO.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the very generous financial assistance provided by the P.E.F. Israel Endowment Funds, in memory of the funds' founder and first president, Judge Julian W. Mack and by the permanent endowment fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, U.S.A., in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt. The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the Faculty of Law, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance provided by the Minerva Foundation for the publication of the *Israel Law Review*.

This issue contains articles presented at an international symposium, entitled "Human Dignity and the Criminal Law," which was the product of a research collaboration between German and Israeli scholars, funded by the German-Israeli Foundation for Scientific Research and Development, and was organized by the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.

## SUBMISSIONS

The *Israel Law Review* accepts unsolicited articles for submission. Please follow the submission guidelines available at <http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=741&in=735>.

## SUBSCRIPTION

The *Israel Law Review* is issued three times annually. The annual subscription price is \$65 USD (inclusive of shipment by airmail).

## DISCLAIMER

The opinions expressed in articles are those of the signed authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem or of the *Israel Law Review*.

## COPYRIGHT

All rights reserved. Permission to reproduce articles should be obtained through the *Israel Law Review*.

## CONTACT

*Israel Law Review*  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
Faculty of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem  
Mount Scopus, Jerusalem 91905  
Israel  
Tel: +972-2-5881156  
Fax: +972-2-5819371  
[ilr@savion.huji.ac.il](mailto:ilr@savion.huji.ac.il)  
<http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=735>  
ISSN 0021-2237