

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF

# Cultural Property

VOLUME 17 2010 NUMBER 3



**CAMBRIDGE**

ISSN 0940-7391

**Subscription Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* (ISSN 0940-7391) is published quarterly in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press for the International Cultural Property Society. Annual subscription rates for Volume 17 (2010): Institutional subscription rate, print and electronic: US \$338 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £198 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, electronic only: US \$276 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £163 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, print only: US \$310 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £184 elsewhere. Individual subscription rate, print only: US \$70 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £35 elsewhere. Single part rates, print only: US \$85 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £51 elsewhere. Prices include surface postage.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England (for UK and elsewhere).

**Society Inquiries:** General inquiries concerning the International Cultural Property Society should be directed to Stanley N. Katz, Director, Center for the Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Woodrow Wilson School, 428 Robertson Hall, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544. Phone: 609-258-5637; fax: 609-258-1235; email: snkatz@princeton.edu

**Rights and Permissions:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

**Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:** The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0940-7391/10 \$15.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$15.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

**Abstracting Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* is indexed and abstracted in Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts (Online Edition); ARTbibliographies Modern; Avery Index to Architectural Periodicals; Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA); British & Irish Archaeological Bibliography (Online Edition); IBZ—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur.

© International Cultural Property Society 2010

**Cover:** Williams Pars (1742–1782) drew this view of the Athenian Acropolis around 1765. Pars was employed by the Society of the Dilettanti and many of his drawings were used as originals for the engravings in the influential publications of the Society. The engraving of this particular image, showing how a piece of inscribed marble is reworked into an Ottoman tombstone, is used by Fredrik Thomasson on page 503 of this issue to illustrate the reuse of artefacts. © Trustees of the British Museum.

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF Cultural Property

VOLUME 17 (2010) NUMBER 3

## Editor

Alexander A. Bauer,  
*Queens College, CUNY, USA*

## Chronicles Editor

Kurt Siehr, *Universität Zürich, Switzerland*  
and *Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

## Case Notes Editor

Robert K. Paterson, *Faculty of Law,*  
*University of British Columbia, Canada*

## Book Review Editor

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of*  
*Queensland, Australia*

## Associate Editors

Michael F. Brown, *Williams College, USA*

Stephanie Moser, *University of*  
*Southampton, UK*

Lyndel V. Prott, *University of Queensland,*  
*Australia*

Madhavi Sunder, *UC Davis School of*  
*Law, USA*

Joe Watkins, *University of Oklahoma,*  
*USA*

## Editorial Board

Gregory J. Ashworth, *Rijksuniversiteit*  
*Groningen, Netherlands*

Janet E. Blake, *University of Shahid*  
*Beheshti, Iran*

Michael Blakey, *College of William and*  
*Mary, USA*

Michael Cernea, *George Washington*  
*University, USA*

Clemency Coggins, *Boston University,*  
*USA*

María Luz Endere, *Conicet and*  
*Universidad del Centro de la*  
*Provincia de Buenos Aires, Argentina*

Pedro Paulo Funari, *Universidade*  
*Estadual de Campinas, Brazil*

Richard Handler, *University of Virginia,*  
*USA*

Thomas F. King, *SWCA Environmental*  
*Consultants, USA*

David Lowenthal, *University College*  
*London, UK*

Claire Lyons, *Getty Museum, USA*

Lynn Meskell, *Stanford University, USA*

Elina Moustaira, *Faculty of Law,*  
*University of Athens, Greece*

Dawson Munjeri, *Delegation of Zimbabwe*  
*to UNESCO, Zimbabwe and France*

Anila Naeem, *NED University of*  
*Engineering and Technology, Pakistan*

James A. R. Nafziger, *Willamette*  
*University College of Law, USA*

Hyung Il Pai, *International Research*  
*Center for Japanese Studies, Japan*

Jorge Sánchez Cordero, *Mexican Center*  
*of Uniform Law, Mexico*

Daniel Shapiro, *President Emeritus,*  
*International Cultural Property Society,*  
*USA*

Folarin Shyllon, *Faculty of Law, Olabisi*  
*Onabanjo University, Nigeria*

Samuel Sidibé, *National Museum of Mali,*  
*Mali*

Neil Asher Silberman, *University of*  
*Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*

Stephen K. Urice, *Esq., University of*  
*Miami School of Law, USA*

Alison Wylie, *University of Washington,*  
*USA*

## Founder and Board Member Emeritus

John Henry Merryman, *Stanford*  
*University Law School, USA*

INTERNATIONAL  
**Cultural Property**  
SOCIETY

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**President**

Derek Gillman  
*Barnes Foundation, USA*

**Treasurer**

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

**Secretary**

Stephen K. Urice  
*University of Miami School of Law, USA*

**Vice-President**

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

Stephen W. Clark  
*J. Paul Getty Trust*

Talat S. Halman  
*Center for Turkish Literature, Bilkent University, Turkey*

Marc-André Renold  
*Art-Law Centre, University of Geneva Law School, Switzerland*

Lawrence Rosen  
*Department of Anthropology, Princeton University, USA*

Kurt Siehr, Law School  
*Universität Zurich, Switzerland and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

President Emeritus  
Daniel Shapiro

# CONTENTS

## VOLUME 17 (2010) NUMBER 3

### ARTICLES

- Justifying and Criticizing the Removals of Antiquities in Ottoman Lands:  
Tracking the Sigeion Inscription*  
Fredrik Thomasson 493
- Intellectual Property for Mystics? Considerations on Protecting Traditional  
Wisdom Systems*  
Rosanne Trottier 519
- Law and the Politics of the Past: Legal Protection of Cultural Heritage in  
Greece*  
Daphne Voudouri 547

### “IN DEFENSE OF PROPERTY”: AN EXCHANGE

- Culture, Property, and Peoplehood: A Comment on Carpenter, Katyal,  
and Riley’s “In Defense of Property”*  
Michael F. Brown 569
- Clarifying Cultural Property*  
Kristen A. Carpenter, Sonia K. Katyal, and Angela R. Riley 581

### BOOK REVIEWS

- Beat Schönenberger, *The Restitution of Cultural Assets*  
reviewed by Craig Forrest 599
- Lynn Meskell, ed., *Cosmopolitan Archaeologies*  
reviewed by Lyndel V. Prott 603