

VOL 102 NO 1101 SEPTEMBER 2021

New Blackfriars



A REVIEW

Edited by the
Dominicans of the
English Province

ISSN 0028-4289

WILEY
Blackwell

Founded in 1920 *New Blackfriars* is edited by the English Dominicans

Editor - Brian Davies OP

Assistant Editor - John O'Connor OP

Reviews Editor - Robert Ombres OP

Associate Editor - Christopher Arroyo

Editorial Board - Helen Alford OP, Gary Anderson, Margaret Atkins OSA, Michael Baur, Vivian Boland OP, Richard Conrad OP, Michael Dodds OP, John Drummond, Eamon Duffy, Nathan Eubank, Richard Finn OP, Simon Gaine OP, Martin Ganeri OP, David Goodill OP, Peter Groves, Simon Hewitt, Oliver Keenan OP, Fergus Kerr OP, Anthony Lisska, Denis Minns OP, Paul Murray OP, Richard Ounsworth OP, Aristotle Papanikolaou, Roger Pouivet, Timothy Radcliffe OP, Howard Robinson, Dominic Ryan OP, Michael Sherwin OP, Eleonore Stump, Simon Tugwell OP, Denys Turner, Gregory Murphy OP, Rik Van Nieuwenhove, Robert Verrill OP, Allan White OP, Thomas Joseph White OP

New Blackfriars is published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd, 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK; Tel: +44 (0) 1865 776868; Fax: +44 (0) 1865 714591.

Production Editor: Eva Rachelin Prenitta (NBFR@wiley.com)

JOURNAL CUSTOMER SERVICES: For ordering information, claims and any enquiry concerning your journal subscription please go to www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask or contact your nearest office.

Americas: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +1 781 388 8598 or +1 800 835 6770 (Toll free in the USA & Canada).

Europe, Middle East and Africa: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +44 (0) 1865 778315.

Asia Pacific: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +65 6511 8000.

Japan: For Japanese speaking support, Email: cs-japan@wiley.com; Tel: +65 6511 8010 or Tel (Toll-free): 005 316 50 480.

Visit our Online Customer Help available in 7 languages at www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask

Correspondence about editorial matters and books for review should be addressed to the Editor or the Reviews Editor, *New Blackfriars*, Blackfriars, Oxford OX1 3LY, UK; e-mail: nb.editor@english.op.org and nb.reviews@english.op.org

INFORMATION FOR SUBSCRIBERS: *New Blackfriars* Journal is published bi-monthly. Subscription prices for 2021 are:

Institutional print and online:	Europe €438	The Americas US\$499	Rest of World \$677
Personal print and online:	€ 60 (Europe, Euro zone) £ 60 (Europe, non-Euro zone)	US\$ 65	£ 38

Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST/HST and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/tax-vat. The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1st 2017, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/access.

DELIVERY TERMS AND LEGAL TITLE: Where the subscription price includes print issues and delivery is to the recipient's address, delivery terms are **Delivered at Place (DAP)**; the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Title to all issues transfers FOB our shipping point, freight prepaid. We will endeavour to fulfil claims for missing or damaged copies within six months of publication, within our reasonable discretion and subject to availability.

BACK ISSUES: Single issues from current and recent volumes are available at the current single issue price from cs-journals@wiley.com. Earlier issues may be obtained from Periodicals Service Company, 351 Fairview Avenue – Ste 300, Hudson, NY 12534, USA. Tel: +1 518 822-9300, Fax: +1 518 822-9305, Email: psc@periodicals.com.

DISCLAIMER: The Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors of the products advertised.

PERIODICAL ID STATEMENT: NEW BLACKFRIARS (ISSN 0028-4289) is published bi-monthly, US mailing agent: Mercury Media Processing, LLC 1850 Elizabeth Avenue, Suite #C, Rahway, NJ 07065 USA. Periodical postage paid at Rahway, NJ. Postmaster: Send all address changes to NEW BLACKFRIARS, John Wiley & Sons Inc.,/C/O The Sheridan Press, PO Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331.

COPYRIGHT AND COPYING (in any format): Copyright © 2021 The Dominican Council. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to copy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organisation (RRO), e.g. Copyright Clearance Centre (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (www.copyright.com), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for republication, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works or for resale. Permissions for such reuse can be obtained using the RightsLink "Request Permissions" link on Wiley Online Library. Special requests should be addressed to: permissions@wiley.com

ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING SERVICES: The journal is indexed by Dietrich's Index Philosophicus; New Testament Abstracts; Old Testament Abstracts; Periodicals Index Online; Philosopher's Index; Religion Index One: Periodicals; Russian Academy of Sciences Bibliographies; The Catholic Periodical and Literature Index.

New Blackfriars accepts articles for Open Access publication. Please visit <http://olabout.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-828081.html> for further information about OnlineOpen.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/NBFR

Printed in Singapore by C.O.S. Printers Pte Ltd

Notes for Contributors

1. All submissions should be made via the online submission system of the journal – <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/nbfr>. Submissions should be made anonymous for blind review.
2. Submissions will not be considered for publication if they have been previously published in English or are currently being considered for publication elsewhere.
3. Submissions should normally be 5-7500 words in length, including notes, though longer articles may sometimes be considered. Submissions should include a word count.
4. All submissions should have an abstract (150-200 words) and 5 keywords describing the contents of the article, for web searching purposes.
5. Submissions may follow either UK or US spelling conventions and punctuation, provided that they are consistent.
6. Single quotation marks should be used for quotations, except for those quotations that appear with another quotation. For example: ‘She reported him as saying, “I will not comply”’.
7. Foreign words/phrases should appear in italics
8. All quotations of texts in a foreign language should be translated. Greek, Hebrew, etc. should be transliterated.
9. References should appear in footnotes, which should be numbered sequentially throughout the article.
10. References should follow these formats:
 - (i) Gerald O’Collins, *Christology: A Biblical, Historical, and Systematic Study of Jesus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p. 29.
 - (ii) John P. Galvin, ‘Before the Holy Mystery: Karl Rahner’s Thought on God’, *Toronto Journal of Theology* 9 (1993), pp.229–37.
 - (iii) Werner G. Jeanrod, ‘Hans Kung’, in David F. Ford, ed., *The Modern Theologians: An Introduction to Christian Theology in the Twentieth Century* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1997), pp. 162–78.

Wiley’s Corporate Citizenship initiative seeks to address the environmental, social, economic, and ethical challenges faced in our business and which are important to our diverse stakeholder groups. Since launching the initiative, we have focused on sharing our content with those in need, enhancing community philanthropy, reducing our carbon impact, creating global guidelines and best practices for paper use, establishing a vendor code of ethics, and engaging our colleagues and other stakeholders in our efforts. Follow our progress at www.wiley.com/go/citizenship

Wiley is a founding member of the UN-backed HINARI, AGORA, and OARE initiatives. They are now collectively known as Research4Life, making online scientific content available free or at nominal cost to researchers in developing countries. Please visit Wiley’s Content Access – Corporate Citizenship site: <http://www.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-390082.html>

View this journal online at wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/NBFR

Contents

Introduction <i>Brian Davies OP</i>	601
What breed are British Dogs of the Lord? <i>Timothy Radcliffe OP</i>	607
From Dominican to Dominican: Osmund Lewry on Robert Kilwardby <i>José Filipe Silva</i>	623
Robert Holcot's Trinitarian Theology and Medieval Historiography <i>John T. Slotemaker</i>	637
The Road to Scottish Dominican Independence 1230–1511 <i>Allan James White OP</i>	658
'The Pressing Question of the Hour': Fr. Vincent McNabb O.P. & the Reception of <i>Rerum Novarum</i> <i>Richard Finn OP</i>	677
'To Do For Our Own Age What Thomas Did For His': Victor White OP <i>Clodagh Weldon</i>	694
The Influence of Victor White and the Blackfriars Dominicans on a young Elizabeth Anscombe: An Essay accompanying the Republication of G.E.M. Anscombe's 'I am Sadly Theoretical: It is the Effect of Being at Oxford' (1938) <i>John Berkman</i>	706
<i>Unum Necessarium</i> : Gerald Vann's Unifying Thomistic Vision <i>Richard Conrad OP and Nicholas Paul Crowe OP</i>	728
Dominican Ditchling and Herbert McCabe's Sacramental Politics: Backwards to a Radical Future <i>Nick O'Brien</i>	745
Making Peace at Spode <i>Brian Wicker</i>	763
The Gilby <i>Summa</i> <i>Fergus Kerr OP</i>	772
On Being a Thomist: Cornelius Ernst's Meta-Theology <i>Oliver James Keenan OP</i>	795

600

Herbert McCabe on God and Humanity 815
Simon Hewitt

Through American Eyes: A View of the English Dominican
Province 834
Richard Woods OP