

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER

Louisiana State University, USA

JAMES SOBASKIE (CD/DVD Review Editor)

Mississippi State University, USA

NANCY NOVEMBER (Score Review Editor)

University of Auckland, New Zealand

HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)

Ball State University, USA

SANNA PEDERSON (Book Review Editor)

University of Oklahoma, USA

KATHERINE PRESTON

William & Mary, USA

WILLIAM WEBER

California State University, Long Beach, USA

BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT

Clark University, USA

Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

University of Chicago, USA

ANDREW BOWIE

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

SUZANNAH CLARK

Harvard University, USA

NICHOLAS COOK

University of Cambridge, UK

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

King's College, University of London, UK

JAMES DEAVILLE

Carleton University, Canada

JEREMY DIBBLE

Durham University, UK

STEPHEN DOWNES

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

KATHARINE ELLIS

University of Cambridge, UK

ANNEGRET FAUSER

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

PETER FRANKLIN

University of Oxford, UK

SOPHIE FULLER

Trinity College of Music, UK

LYDIA GOEHR

Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY

Stanford University, USA

SARAH HIBBERD

University of Bristol, UK

JULIAN HORTON

Durham University, UK

LINDA HUTCHEON

University of Toronto, Canada

HERVÉ LACOMBE

Université Rennes 2, Haute Bretagne, France

ALICIA LEVIN

University of Kansas, USA

RALPH LOCKE

Eastman School of Music, USA

ROBERTA MARVIN

University of Massachusetts, USA

SIMON McVEIGH

Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

JULIAN RUSHTON

University of Leeds, UK

DOUGLASS SEATON

Florida State University, USA

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

University of Oxford, UK

SUSAN YOUENS

University of Notre Dame, USA

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published three times a year in April, August and December. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 19 (2022), which includes print and electronic access, is £265 net (US\$418 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £56 net (US\$89 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £102 (US\$160 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfilment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use*, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at [cambridge.org/core](https://www.cambridge.org/core).

© Cambridge University Press 2022

Contents

VOLUME 19, ISSUE 2

Notes on Article Contributors 205

INTRODUCTION

James William Sobaskie
Critical Responses to Nineteenth-Century French Music 207

ARTICLE

Ralph Locke
How Reliable Are Nineteenth-Century Reviews of Concerts and Operas?:
Félicien David's *Le Désert* and His Grand Opéra *Herculanum* 217

CORRIGENDUM

Ralph Locke
How Reliable Are Nineteenth-Century Reviews of Concerts and Operas?:
Félicien David's *Le Désert* and His Grand Opéra *Herculanum* -
CORRIGENDUM 235

ARTICLES

Lesley A. Wright
Critical Allusion and Critical Assessment: Berlioz's and Reyer's Reviews of
Bizet in the *Journal des débats* 237

Heather de Savage
'Under the Gallic Spell': Boston's Embrace of Gabriel Fauré, 1892–1924 255

Christopher Moore
Three Versions of Classic: The Construction of Gabriel Fauré in the 1920s 273

Estelle Joubert
'Distant Reading' in French Music Criticism 291

BOOK REVIEWS

Christopher Dingle, ed.
The Cambridge History of Music Criticism
by Richard Taruskin 317

David Milsom
Romantic Violin Performance Practices: A Handbook
by Geronimo Oyenard 334

- Marjorie W. Hirsch and Lisa Feurzeig, eds.
The Cambridge Companion to Schubert's Winterreise
 by Clive McClelland 340
- François Le Roux and Romain Raynaldy
Le Chant Intime: The Interpretation of French Mélodie trans. Sylvia Kahan
 by James William Sobaskie 343
- Hervé Lacombe, ed.
Histoire de l'opéra français: Du Consulat aux débuts de la IIIe République
 by Peter Mondelli 348
- Katherine K. Preston
George Frederick Bristow
 by E. Douglas Bomberger 357

CD REVIEWS

- Jacquelyn Sholes
To a Camia: Piano Music from Romantic Manila Sally Pinkas, piano MSR 363
 Classics MS 1645, 2019 (1 CD: 76 minutes) \$12.95
- Emily Eubanks
Night Music, Music for a Viennese Salon Steven Zohn *eight-keyed fl*, Rebecca 367
 Harris *vln*, Marika Holmqvist *vln*, Daniel Elyar *vla*, Rebecca Humphrey
 Diederich *vc*, Heather Miller Lardin *violone* Avie 2423, 2020 (1 CD: 66
 minutes).

SCORE REVIEWS

- Marie Sumner Lott 373
 Antonín Dvořák. *String Quartet No. 10 in E-flat major, Op. 51.*
 Edited by Hartmut Schick
 Antonín Dvořák. *Piano Quartet in D Major, Op. 23.*
 Edited by Robin Tait. Preface by David Beveridge
 Antonín Dvořák. *Serenade for Wind Instruments, Violoncello and Double Bass,*
Op. 44. Edited by Robin Tait. Preface by David Beveridge
- Callum Blackmore 376
Ohé! les p'tits agneaux!: A Parisian revue de fin d'année for 1857,
 edited by Richard Sherr

DIGITAL RESOURCE REVIEWS

- Estelle Joubert 381
 RIPM: A Retrospective Index to Music Periodicals (1760–1966)
- Miguel J. Ramirez 388
 Bruckner-online