THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 88TH ANNUAL MEETING



WASHINGTON, D.C. April 6–9, 1994

It is the policy of The American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the addresses, remarks and discussions delivered at its Annual Meetings and appearing in its printed *Proceedings* are those of the individual speakers and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Society.

The Society is a professional association devoted to the study and use of law in international affairs. Membership is open to people of all nations, lawyers and nonlawyers, who are interested in the challenging problems of law and policy. Its large and diverse membership of some 4,400, drawn from more than 100 countries, includes scholars, practitioners, government officials, international civil servants, and students.

Founded in 1906, the Society serves as a meeting place, forum and collegial research center, hospitable to all viewpoints in its meetings, publications and other activities. Publications include the American Journal of International Law, International Legal Materials, Studies in Transnational Legal Policy, the ASIL Newsletter, and reports and books produced by its programs of research, study and outreach.

The Society is a nonpartisan, tax-exempt, nonprofit corporation headquartered at Tillar House on Sheridan Circle in Washington, DC.

Subscription Information

ASIL members may subscribe to the Proceedings of the Annual Meeting for \$50; outside U.S.A., \$60. Nonmembers may subscribe for \$60; outside U.S.A., \$70. To place a subscription or receive information on back issues, please contact The American Society of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Washington, DC 20008-2864. Telephone (202) 939-6000; FAX (202) 797-7133.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use (beyond that permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law), or for the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by The American Society of International Law for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the base fee of \$5.00 per copy, plus \$.25 per page, is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. For organizations that have been granted a photocopy license by CCC, a separate system of payment has been arranged. The fee code for users of the Transactional Reporting Service is: 0272-5037/95, \$5.00 + .25. Educational copying is permitted. Please address requests to CCC Academic Permissions Service; (508) 750-8400, fax (508) 750-4744.

© 1995 The American Society of International Law

INTRODUCTION

For two years running, the Society's Annual Meetings have focused especially on the concept of *sovereignty*. This focus is of course reflected in these Proceedings for 1993 and 1994, which consist of the edited renditions of papers presented during the Meeting and informal discussion that followed these presentations in the various panels and other groups.

Underlying these themes has been the realization that the period of far-reaching and accelerated transition with which the international community has been grappling now for several years implicates the notion of sovereignty in a multitude of ways not yet clearly perceived or well understood. States have broken apart; new and more numerous states have replaced them. In some places, newly-freed impulses of nationhood or other group loyalties have surged up to bedevil efforts toward a stable realignment of the state system and to call for novel political approaches to that end, while in other places hoary, intractable disputes between bitterly contending states or factions have moved toward accommodation and settlement. Broad changes involving multinlateral institutions are afoot, both in the emergence of new institutions in economic and other areas, and in the rapid evolution of the role and function of existing ones. The idea of international standards of human rights, with its necessary impingement on sovereign prerogatives, apparently is becoming a factor to be seriously reckoned with in more and more areas of international policy and action.

Shedding light on the ways in which sovereignty is implicated in these changes was the special assignment of the two successive annual meetings. As this volume goes to press, plans for the 1995 meeting call for giving the notion of sovereignty as such a rest: presumably not, alas, on the theory that all has now been made luminously clear, but only that a lively, insightful and rewarding effort has been made, as I believe a reading of this volume will demonstrate.

Echoing this year's meeting theme, "The Transformation of Sovereignty," this volume opens with four panels designed specifically to explore questions of the evolution of the concept of sovereignty. The first deals with new theoretical perspectives among international scholars. A second discusses the various entities that may demonstrate emergent "multiple tiers of sovereignty"—from nation-states themselves, to various substate entities involving local autonomy arrangements, to supranational entities such as the European Union.

A third "theme panel" examines international law aspects of the breakup of states. The fourth panel, raising the question "The End of Sovereignty?", brings together issues and conclusions on the overall meeting theme that emerge not only in the foregoing three panels but also in others that were, in the minds of the program planners, "selected and shaped to capture various aspects of the transformation of sovereignty."

The latter include discussions touching on virtually every major area of international policy and law currently in the forefront of international attention—multiple international security issues such as making and maintaining peace and controlling weaponry; developments in international economic law and institutions as world markets continue their increasing globalization; environmental protection; human rights and democratization of national societies; refugees and migration; and environmental protection. Also included are a number of important issues of narrower scope, such as developments in space law concerning sovereign rights, in response to new technologies; and prosecuting violations of international humanitarian law in the International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. A healthy majority of this set of panels struck me as especially successful in accomplishing their declared purposes. To mention a few examples: the panels on the New Law of GATT/World Trade Organization (p. 125); Implementing the Chemical Weapons Convention (p. 221); Human Rights, Multinational Business and International Financial Institutions (p. 271); Regional Trade Oganizations and their effect on gobal trade and trading arrangements (p. 309); Harmonization Efforts in Securities and Banking Regulation (p. 398); Sovereign Immunity, presenting a comparative perspective on the United States and the United Kingdom (p. 509); and Global Nonproliferation Efforts (p. 552).

One of the most useful aspects of the *Proceedings* is that individual panels, or groups of panels, in addition to the analyses and insights they present, often serve as a well-presented updating review of both facts and policy issues on matters that continue from year to year and on which important developments have taken place in the recent past or are impending in the near future. Their value for this purpose is enhanced by a characteristically high proportion of government and international organization officials participating in the discussions. Fully half of the panels in the 1994 *Proceedings* will be found to perform this function particularly well. The panels on implementation of the Chemical Weapons Convention and on the Former Yugoslavia Tribunal, and the several dealing with the aftermath of the Uruguay Round (particularly the GATT and the World Trade Organization), the NAFTA and other regional trade organizations are a few examples.

The Society, Proceedings Assistant Editor Susan Bassuener, and I owe special thanks to the Reporters for each panel, whose demanding role is critical to the production of the Proceedings; to Patricia Allen, who ably assisted in the copyediting and proofreading, and to Grant McClanahan, who again ably prepared the Index.

John Lawrence Hargrove Editor October 1994

PROCEEDINGS OF THE EIGHTY-EIGHTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

THE TRANSFORMATION OF SOVEREIGNTY

Co-CHAIRS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE ANNUAL MEETING Anne-Marie Slaughter Burley Jeffrey M. Lang EDITOR OF THE PROCEEDINGS John Lawrence Hargrove Assistant Editor Susan F. Bassuener

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS*

CENTRAL THEME PANELS

Theoretical Perspectives on the Transformation of Sovereignty	1
The Rise of Nationalism and the Breakup of States Multiple Tiers of Sovereignty: The Future of International Governance The End of Sovereignty? (Round Table)	33
	51
	71



International Enforcement in the Clinton Administration	89
Reforming the United Nations	105
Trading in a Post-Uruguay World: The New Law of the GATT/World Trade Organization	125
Conflict Prevention for a New Century	142
Fast-Breaking Developments: Withdrawing from the World? The United States as Reluctant Hegemon	163
The Challenge of Accommodating the Needs of the New Economies of the Former Communist Bloc in International Economic Institutions and under Domestic Law	178
Democratization and International Law: Building the Institutions of Civil Society	197
Practical Aspects of Transnational Practice	213
Implementing the Chemical Weapons Convention: Progress and Challenges	221
Prosecuting and Defending Violations of Genocide and Humanitarian Law: The International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	239

* The following speakers delivered special addresses in the course of the Annual Meeting: Carol Lee (Corporate Counsel Luncheon); Conrad Harper (ASIL/ABA Luncheon); and Barry Mawhinney (ASIL/CCIL Luncheon). The Presidential Reception at the Embassy of Japan was hosted by Ambassador and Mrs. Takakazu Kuriyama.

Vexing Issues of Supreme Authority and Sovereign Rights Arising from Space Activities	259
Human Rights, Multinational Business and Internationl Financial Institutions	271
The Future of the President's Authority to Negotiate International Trade Agreements after NAFTA and the Uruguay Round: What Should Congress Delegate?	290
Regional Trade Organizations: Strengthening or Weakening Global Trade?	309
From Keeping the Peace to Making it: The Changing Role of UN Security Forces	328
The Clinton Administration, Congress and International Law	354
Annual Dinner Address: ASIL President Edith Brown Weiss Address: U.S. Supreme Court Justice Harry A. Blackmun	382 383
Open Forum (New Presenters at ASIL Annual Meeting)	389
International Harmonization Efforts in Securities and Banking Regulation	398
An International Human Rights Agenda for the End of the Century: New Human Rights?	419
Immigration Politics and Sovereignty: National Responses to "Bad" Aliens	439
The Year in International Law	464
International Environmental Law: From NAFTA to a General Agreement on the Environment?	485
Sovereign Immunity: A Comparative Perspective	509
Access to Transnational Justice: Responding to NAFTA	531
A Nuclear Future? Global Nonproliferation Efforts	552
1994 Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition	573
Appendices	575
Index	599

PROCEEDINGS OF THE EIGHTY-EIGHTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

THE TRANSFORMATION OF SOVEREIGNTY

CO-CHAIRS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE ANNUAL MEETING Anne-Marie Slaughter Burley Jeffrey M. Lang EDITOR OF THE PROCEEDINGS John Lawrence Hargrove Assistant Editor Susan F. Bassuener

CONTENTS*

CENTRAL THEME PANELS

I. Theoretical Perspectives on the Transformation of Sovereignty	
CHAIR: James R. Crawford	1
Whose International Law? Sovereignty and Non-State Groups.	
Benedict Kingsbury	1
Borders of the Imagination: The State in Feminist International Law. Karen Knop	14
Some Observations on John Rawls's The Law of Peoples.	
Fernando Tesón	18
The Wonderful Artificiality of States. Martti Koskenniemi	22
DISCUSSION	30
Reporter: Amir Pasic	31
II. The Rise of Nationalism and the Breakup of States	
CHAIR: Gidon Gottlieb	33
The Fragmentation of Yugoslavia. Paul C. Szasz	33
Remarks by:	
Mike N. Barnett	39
Controlling the Breakup of States: Toward a United Nations Role.	
Steven R. Ratner	42
DISCUSSION	46
Reporter: John Schembari	50
III. Multiple Tiers of Sovereignty: The Future of International Governance	
CHAIR: Thomas M. Franck	51
Remarks by:	
Roy S. Lee	52
Paul W. Kahn	53
Ruth Wedgwood	55
Francis Deng	55
Gregory H. Fox	57

* Ambassador and Mrs. Takakazu Kuriyama hosted the ASIL President's Reception (April 6) at the Embassy of Japan. Special addresses were delivered in the course of the Annual Meeting by the following speakers: Carol Lee, General Counsel, Export-Import Bank of the United States (Corporate Counsel Luncheon, April 6); Conrad Harper, Legal Adviser, U.S. Department of State (ASIL/ABA Luncheon, April 7); and Barry Mawhinney, Legal Adviser, Canadian Department of External Affairs (ASIL/CCIL Luncheon, April 8).

PANELISTS' DISCUSSION	58
Open Discussion	64
REPORTER: Susan T. Gibbs	69

IV. The End of Sovereignty? (Round Table)

MODERATOR: James R. Crawford	71
RAPPORTEUR: Christine Chinkin	71
ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION:	- 74
Participants: Thomas M. Franck, Steven R. Ratner, Rosalyn Higgins,	
Anne-Marie Slaughter Burley, Louis Henkin, John L. Washburn,	
Edith Brown Weiss, Eric Stein	
OPEN DISCUSSION	84
Reporter: Richard Ponzio	87

 \sim \sim \sim

 \sim

International Enforcement in the Clinton Administration	
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS: Louis Henkin	89
CHAIR: Leo H. Phillips, Jr.	89
Remarks by:	
Michael Mann	92
Scott Blake Harris	95
Diane P. Wood	98
DISCUSSION	102
Reporter: Daniel A. Austin	104
Reforming the United Nations	
CHAIR: David D. Caron	105
Reforming the United Nations: From Management to Governance.	
Douglas J. Bennet	105
Amending the UN Charter: The Art of the Feasible. W. Michael	
Reisman	108
Remarks by:	
John L. Washburn	116
Discussion	118
Reporter: David Kaye	124
	141
Trading in a Post-Uruguay World: The New Law of the GATT/World	
Trade Organization	105
CHAIR: Irving A. Williamson	125
The Significance of the World Trade Organization for the Future of the	105
Trading System. Debra P. Steger	125
The WTO and the New Dispute Settlement. Amelia Porges	131
Remarks by:	
John H. Jackson	136
DISCUSSION	139
REPORTER: Belina Anderson	141
Conflict Prevention for a New Century	
CHAIR: Charles E. Nelson	142

Abram Chayes 142

REMARKS BY:

DISCUSSION: Ethnic Conflict and Preventive Diplomacy: New Challenges for International Organizations, Nation-States and Nongovernmental	145
Organizations. Felice D. Gaer Conflict Prevention through Peace Operations: A Perspective from the	146
	154
Clinton Administration. David J. Scheffer	154
DISCUSSION	160
Reporter: George E. Morris	162
Fast-Breaking Developments: Withdrawing from the World? The United States as Reluctant Hegemon	
CHAIR: John Anderson	163
Remarks by:	
Richard A. Falk	163
Robert D. Hormats	166
Nancy Soderberg	169
Discussion	172
Reporter: Nancy H. Duff	177
REFORTER. Mailey II. Dult	1//
The Challenge of Accommodating the Needs of the New Economies of the Former Communist Bloc in International Economic Institutions and under	
Domestic Law	170
CHAIR: Joanna Shelton U.S. Government Project Finance and Political Risk Insurance Support for American Investment in Central and Eastern Europe and the NIS.	178
Charles D. Toy	180
Demands on the Legal Environment of Recipient Countries for	
Effective Foreign Participation in the Privatization Process: The East	
German Experience. Manfred Balz	184
Remarks by:	
Linda Evans	189
Discussion	192
Reporter: Samuel Kern Alexander	192
REPORTER: Samuel Kern Alexander	190
Democratization and Internatioal Law: Building the Institutions of Civil Society	
Chair: Thomas Carothers	197
REMARKS BY:	
Larry Garber	198
-	
Lori Murray	200
Holly Burkhalter	203
DISCUSSION	206
Reporter: Farhana Y. Khera	211
Practical Aspects of Transnational Practice	
-	213
CHAIR: Robert Brown	213
REMARKS BY:	
Reinke Duhme	213
Patrick Oliver	215
An African Perspective on Transnational Practice. Eliud Kagya	218
Remarks by:	
Jessica Ball	219
REPORTER: Joseph H. Hunt	220
•	

٠

Implementing the Chemical Weapons Convention: Progress and Challenges	
Chair: Barry Kellman	221
Legal Implementation of the Chemical Weapons Convention.	
Barry Kellman	221
Remarks by:	224
Bernard L. Seward	224
Environmental and Safety Obligations of the Chemical Weapons	226
Convention. Edward A. Tanzman Export Controls and Sanctions. Burrus M. Carnahan	226 230
COMMENTARY: Australia's Approach to National Implementation of the	230
CWC. Timothy L. H. McCormack	233
Discussion	235
REPORTER: Katherine L. Starr	233
REFORTER, Ratherine E. Start	250
Prosecuting and Defending Violations of Genocide and Humanitarian Law:	
The International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia	
CHAIR: Monroe Leigh	239
Remarks by:	
Larry Johnson	239
Applicable Substantive Law. Jordan J. Paust	241
Remarks by:	
Christopher L. Blakesley	243
Steven J. Lepper	245
COMMENTARY: Michael P. Scharf	251
COMMENTARY: Franck C. Newman	253
DISCUSSION	254
Reporter: Terry Coonan	258
Vexing Issues of Supreme Authority and Sovereign Rights Arising from	
Space Activities	
CHAIR: Stephen Gorove	259
Some Thoughts about Sovereign Rights Arising from Space Activities.	
Paul G. Dembling	260
Recent Changes in Space Law's Concept of Sovereignty.	
Paul B. Larsen	264
DISCUSSION	268
REPORTER: Jean-Marie Henckaerts	270
Human Rights, Multinational Business and International Financial	
Institutions	
Chair: John J. Keller	271
Multinational Business and Human Rights. John J. Keller	271
Human Rights and Our International Economic Interests.	
Joan Spero	274
Human Rights and Multilateral Development Banks: Governance	
Concerns in Decision Making. Patricia Armstrong	277
One American Corporation's Attempt to Define and Play a Role in the	
Global Environment: Some Observations on the Standards for Social	
Responsibility of the Timberland Company. Bruce M. Landay	282
DISCUSSION	287
Reporter: Idris M. Diaz	289

The Future of the President's Authority to Negotiate International Trade Agreements after NAFTA and the Uruguay Round: What Should Congress	
Delegate?	• • • •
CHAIR: S. Bruce Wilson	290
Remarks by:	
Ira Shapiro	291
The EC's Common Commerical Policy: Which Way the Swing of the	
Pendulum? Pieter Jan Kuyper	294
Remarks by:	• • • •
Charles S. Levy	300
DISCUSSION	303
Reporter: Adam H. Gordon	307
Regional Trade Organizations: Stengthening or Weakening Global Trade?	
CHAIR: Charles Roh	309
Remarks by:	
Carlos Alberto Primo Braga	310
Amelia Porges	312
Horacio A. Grigera Naón	316
Thelma Askey	318
DISCUSSION	322
REPORTER: Shara L. Aranoff	327
From Keeping the Peace to Making it: The Changing Role of UN Security	
Forces	
CHAIR: Lori F. Damrosch	328
UN Security Forces in Support of Humane Values. Thomas G. Weiss	329
The Politics of Peacekeeping. Sarah B. Sewall	336
Remarks by: Paul C. Szasz	340
PANEL DISCUSSION	344
Open Discussion	346
REPORTER: Katherine T. Ward	353
	000
The Clinton Administration, Congress and International Law CHAIR: Charles N. Brower	354
	554
Remarks by: Alan I. Kreczko	254
	354
The Seamless Web: Foreign Policy and International Law.	250
Nicholas Rostow	356
Ratification of International Human Rights Treaties: Progress and	2/2
Prospects in the Clinton Administration. Patricia L. Rengel	363
Remarks by:	
Stephen Rickard	367
DISCUSSION	371
Reporter: Aaron M. Knight	379
Annual Dinner	
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS:	
Louis Henkin	381
Awards Announcements	381

Commendations Introduction of New ASIL President	381 381
Address by Edith Brown Weiss The Supreme Court and the Law of Nations: Owing a Decent Respect	382
to the Opinions of Mankind. Harry A. Blackmun CONCLUSION	383 388
Open Forum	
CHAIR: Ronald St. John Macdonald	389
The Globalization of Sovereignty: The Evolution of Sovereignty Viewed	
from an Environmental Perspective. Arthur E. Appleton	389
Ten Years after Bhopal: International Environmental Emergency	
Measures. Jerry Speir	390
Prospects for a Permanent UN Military Force: Lessons from the	
Debate on the French Proposals at the Paris Peace Conference of	200
1919. Brian D. Lepard	390
Designing Transnational Dispute-Resolution Centers. Tobi P. Dress	391
An International Criminal Court: The Case for a Flexible Approach. Bryan F. MacPherson	202
The Campaign for a New United Nations Charter. Tad Daley	392 392
Commentary:	392
William R. Slomanson	393
Discussion	394
Reporter: April Philippa Tash	397
International Harmonization Efforts in Securities and Banking Regulation	
CHAIR: Gerhard Wegen	398
Remarks by:	
Linda Quinn	398
International Securities Regulation: Coping with the "Rashomon Effect". Edward J. Waitzer	400
Progress Report on Securities Law Harmonization.	
Roberta S. Karmel	409
Treating Like Equally: Harmonizing Position Risk Capital	
Requirements for Banks and Securities Firm—The European Union's	44.0
Capital and Adequacy Directive. Cynthia C. Lichtenstein	415
Remarks by:	417
M. P. Azevedo REPORTER: Garri Benjamin Hendell	417 418
REPORTER: Garn Benjamin Henden	410
An International Human Rights Agenda for the End of the Century: New Human Rights?	
Chair: Louis Henkin	419
Remarks by:	
Abdullahi An-Na'im	419
Mark L. Schneider	425
Implementing Human Rights Treaties: The Prognosis after Vienna.	
Anne F. Bayefsky	428
Discussion	436
Reporter: Garth Meintjes	438
-	

Immigration Politics and Sovereignty: National Responses to "Bad" Aliens	
CHAIR: Karen Engle	439
Immigration Crisis, "Nativism" and Legitimacy. Linda Bosniak	440
Bad Citizens: The Nonassimilating Immigrant and the Xenophobic	
Native. Jean Manas	446
Who Are the Archetypal "Good" Aliens? Harold Hongju Koh	450
Images of Women in U.S. Immigration Policy—The Paradox of	
Domestic Violence. Stacy Brustin	454
DISCUSSION	458
Reporter: John Linarelli	463
The Year in International Law	
CHAIR: Diane P. Wood	464
The Maturing of the ICJ. Frederic L. Kirgis, Jr.	464
Remarks by:	
Jamison Selby Borek	469
John F. Murphy	
Peter D. Trooboff	
DISCUSSION	
REPORTER: Robert D. Vander Lugt	484
International Environmental Law: From NAFTA to a General Agreement on	
the Environment?	40.5
CHAIR: Kenneth Berlin	485
REMARKS BY:	400
Daniel Esty	490
Trade and Environment: The Business Point of View. Khristine Hall	
DISCUSSION	
REPORTER: Heather J. MacGregor	508
Sovereign Immunity: A Comparative Perspective	
Chair: Gary B. Born	509
Has the Time Come to Revise the Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act?	203
Joseph W. Dellapenna	509
REMARKS BY:	309
Allan Gerson	517
Rosalyn Higgins	
Discussion	
REPORTER. Mark S. Zalu	550
Access to Transnational Justice: Responding to the NAFTA	
Chair: David M. Trubek	531
Access to Transnational Justice under the NAFTA: Different Interests,	
Different Access. Robert F. Housman	531
Enforcing Worker Rights under the NAFTA Labor Side Accord.	551
Lance Compa	535
Trading Places: Greening World Trade or Trading in the Environment?	555
Ileana M. Porras	540
DISCUSSION	
Reporter: Ruth Buchanan	
	551

A Nuclear Future? Global Nonproliferation Efforts
CHAIR: Edwin M. Smith
Remarks by:
Gary S. Samore
Nonproliferation: Recent Legislative Developments. Theodore M. Hirsch
Reexamining Export Controls from the Demand Side.
Dorinda G. Dallmeyer
Remarks by:
Barry S. Kellman
DISCUSSION
Reporter: Christopher Tracy
1994 Philip C. Jessup International Law Moot Court Competition
Appendices
BUSINESS MEETING
Eulogies
Report of the Executive Director
Election of Officers and Executive Council
Announcement of Awards
Elections to the Board of Editors of the AJIL
Elections to the Advisory Committee of ILM
Officers, Committees and Staff of The American Society of

Staff	592
Report of the Committee on Publications of the U.S. Departmen State and the United Nations	
Index	599

International Law for the Year 1994

Corresponding Editors

Contributing Editors

American Journal of International Law: Board of Editors

International Legal Materials: Editorial Advisory Committee and

Basic Documents of International Economic Law: Editor,