



JOURNAL OF Law and Religion

VOLUME XXVII NUMBER 2 2011-12

ARTICLES

Common Cause in the Culture Wars?
René Reyes

"For the Judgment is God's": Human Judgment and Divine
Justice in the Hebrew Bible and in Jewish Tradition
Haim Shapira

The "Gatekeepers" of Jewish Family Law: Marriage
Annulment as a Test Case
Avshalom Westreich

The Catholic and Jewish Court: Explaining the Absence of
Protestants on the Nation's Highest Judicial Body
Zachary Baron Shemtob

Parentally Mandated Religious Healing for Children: A
Therapeutic Justice Approach
Sana Loue

"Command and Coercion": Clerical Immunity, Scandal, and
the Sex Abuse Crisis in the Roman Catholic Church
John F. Wirenius

Sponsored by: Hamline University School of Law

Published by: JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION
ISSN: 0748-0814

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVII

2011-2012

NUMBER 2

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor in Chief

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Associate Editor

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

Technical Editors

MARY L. DUNNEWOLD, Hamline University School of Law

STEPHEN LIEBO, Hamline University School of Law

Production/Subscription Manager

LINDA BERGLIN, Hamline University School of Law

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

SARAH ERICKSON

JESSICA FARBER

NICOLE HERTEL

LOGAN MORTENSON

EDITORIAL BOARD

JOSÉ ROBERTO JUÁREZ, University of Denver, Sturm College of Law, Chair

FRANK S. ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law

DEBORAH CANTRELL, University of Colorado Law School

PAULA COOEY, Macalester College

PERRY DANE, Rutgers University

Ex Officio

ANVER M. EMON, University of Toronto

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Ex Officio

M. CHRISTIAN GREEN, University of Notre Dame

Ex Officio

EMILY ALBRINK HARTIGAN, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

AFRA JALABI, Islamic Scholar, Beaconsfield, Quebec

HOWARD LESNICK, University of Pennsylvania Law School

DONALD LEWIS, Hamline University School of Law

Ex Officio

ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee, Secretary

RUSSELL PEARCE, Fordham University School of Law

MICHAEL PERRY, Emory University School of Law

THOMAS PORTER, JUSTPEACE Center for Mediation & Conflict Transformation
ASIFA QURAIISHI, University of Wisconsin Law School
KATHLEEN SANDS, University of Hawaii at Manoa
EARL SCHWARTZ, Hamline University
STEVEN D. SMITH, University of San Diego School of Law
DARRYL TRIMIEW, Medgar Evers College
AMELIA UELMEN, Fordham University School of Law
HOWARD J. VOGEL, Professor Emeritus, Hamline University School of Law, Treasurer

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

- SAM LEVINE, Touro Law Center, Chair*
- TAHA JABER AL-ALWANI, Graduate School of Social and Islamic Sciences*
- AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond*
- ABDULLAHI AN-NA'IM, Emory University School of Law*
- ZAFAR ISHAQ ANSARI, Islamic Research Institute, International Islamic University, Pakistan*
- GERARD BRADLEY, University of Notre Dame Law School*
- MICHAEL J. BROYDE, Emory University School of Law*
- LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law*
- Southern Methodist University*
- STEPHEN L. CARTER, Yale Law School*
- ROBERT F. COCHRAN, JR., Pepperdine University School of Law*
- MOHAMED S. EL-AWA, Islamic Scholar, Egypt*
- CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law*
- EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law*
- RICHARD HIERS, Professor Emeritus, University of Florida*
- M. CATHLEEN KAVENY, University of Notre Dame Law School*
- PATRICK R. KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary*
- DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths*
- MICHAEL KESSLER, Georgetown University*
- URFAN KHALIQ, Cardiff Law School*
- SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law*
- DAVID LITTLE, Harvard University Divinity School*
- ELIZABETH MENSCH, SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor Emerita*
- EBRAHIM MOOSA, Duke University*
- SEYYED HOSSEIN NASR, George Washington University*
- LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College*
- KAY PRANIS, Saint Paul, Minnesota*
- JAWDAT SAID, Muslim Scholar and Activist, Syria*
- ELISABETH SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School*
- THOMAS L. SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School*
- DONALD W. SHRIVER, Professor Emeritus, Union Theological Seminary in New York*
- DANIEL SINCLAIR, Tel Aviv Law School*
- DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University*
- PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law*
- CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, South Africa*
- MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany*
- JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law*
- WILSON YATES, Professor Emeritus, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities*
- STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota*

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a interdisciplinary, interfaith academic and professional publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, which is published twice annually, are \$25.00 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$35.00 for institutions, and \$12.00 for students. Add an additional \$10.00 for foreign postage. Subscription requests, manuscripts, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION
1536 Hewitt Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104
lberglin@hamline.edu

The JOURNAL currently follows the Blue Book citation format. Citations to Jewish/Christian Biblical sources conform to the SBL Handbook of Style and the Jewish Law Annual. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline, <http://heinonline.org>

The views and opinions expressed in the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by the H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on-line on a variety of computer database services.

This periodical is also indexed in the *ATLA Religion Database*®, published by the American Theological Library Association, 300 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 2100, Chicago, IL 60606, E-mail: atla@atla.com, [www.http://www.atla.com](http://www.atla.com).

Internet access to information about the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 27 J.L. & RELIGION (2011-12)

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

- Historical** The JOURNAL intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.
- Theoretical** The JOURNAL intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.
- Ethical** The JOURNAL intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.
- Global** The JOURNAL intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.
- Professional** The JOURNAL intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.
- Spiritual** The JOURNAL recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The JOURNAL is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the JOURNAL intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

**HAMLIN
UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF LAW**

A subscription to the
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

\$25.00 individual (U.S.)
\$35.00 individual (foreign)
\$35.00 institution (U.S.)
\$45.00 institution (foreign)
\$12.00 student

Print and send to:

Circulation Manager
JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104
U.S.

Please Enclose Payment made out to:

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Name: _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Country: _____

Phone: _____ Fax: _____ E-Mail: _____

Check out our website!

Journal of Law & Religion

<http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>



[Awards](#)



[Recent Books and Articles](#)



[Resources](#)



[Subscription Information](#)



[Symposia](#)



[View Issues/Indexes](#)



ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire
back stock, reprint and
microform rights to the

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Complete sets to date
are now available.
We can also furnish
single volumes and issues.

WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.

1285 Main Street

Buffalo, New York 14209-1987

Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at 800.828.7571;
via fax 716.883.8100; or found in electronic format for all your research
needs on HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVII

2011-2012

NUMBER 2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface	xiii
------------------------	------

For current & upcoming article abstracts, visit our website at
http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/index_of_issues.html

ARTICLES

René Reyes	<i>Common Cause in the Culture Wars?</i>	231
Haim Shapira	<i>"For the Judgment is God's": Human Judgment and Divine Justice in the Hebrew Bible and in Jewish Tradition</i>	273
Avishalom Westreich	<i>The "Gatekeepers" of Jewish Family Law: Marriage Annulment as a Test Case</i>	329
Zachary Baron Shemtob	<i>The Catholic and Jewish Court: Explaining the Absence of Protestants on the Nation's Highest Judicial Body</i>	359
Sana Loue	<i>Parentally Mandated Religious Healing for Children: A Therapeutic Justice Approach</i>	397
John F. Wirenius	<i>"Command and Coercion": Clerical Immunity, Scandal, and the Sex Abuse Crisis in the Roman Catholic Church</i>	423

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

For current and upcoming book reviews, visit our website at
http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/upcoming_reviews_essays.html

BOOK REVIEWS

- Michael Skerker *Terror, Religion, and Liberal Thought*,
by Richard B. Miller 495
- John W. Welch *Everyday Law in Biblical Israel: An Introduction*,
by Raymond Westbrook & Bruce Wells;
Justice and Compassion in Biblical Law,
by Richard H. Hiers
*God, Justice, and Society: Aspects of Law and
Legality in the Bible*,
by Jonathan Burnside 499

BOOKSHELF

- Peace-Building by, between, and beyond Muslims and Evangelical
Christians*,
edited by Mohammed Abu-Nimer & David
Augsburger
God's Economy: Faith Based Initiatives and the Caring State,
by Lew Daly
Christianity, Politics and Public Life in Kenya,
by Paul Gifford
*Religion and American Foreign Policy, 1945-1960: The Soul of
Containment*,
by William Inboden
Religious Liberty, Vol. One: Overviews and History,
by Douglas Laycock
Religious Liberty, Vol. Two: The Free Exercise Clause,
by Douglas Laycock
The Civic Life of American Religion,
edited by Paul Lichterman & C. Brady Potts.....
*Holy Hullabaloo: A Road Trip to the Battlegrounds of the Church/State
Wars*,
by Jay D. Wexler
Onward Christian Soldiers? The Religious Right in American Politics,
by Clyde Wilcox & Carin Robinson.....

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

Religion and the American Constitutional Experiment: Third Edition,
by John Witte, Jr. & Joel A. Nichols
Religion and human rights: an introduction,
edited by John Witte, Jr. & M. Christian Green
..... 515