

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBERS 2 & 3 1989

## ARTICLES

*THE WEBSTER AMICUS CURIAE BRIEFS:  
PERSPECTIVES ON THE ABORTION CONTROVERSY AND  
THE ROLE OF THE SUPREME COURT*

NURSES AND PRESCRIPTIVE AUTHORITY: A LEGAL AND  
ECONOMIC ANALYSIS Elizabeth Harrison Hadley

## NOTES AND COMMENTS

JUDICIAL POSTPONEMENT OF DEATH RECOGNITION:  
THE TRAGIC CASE OF MARY O'CONNOR

THE INCOMPETENT DEVELOPMENTALLY DISABLED  
PERSON'S RIGHT OF SELF-DETERMINATION: RIGHT-  
TO-DIE, STERILIZATION AND INSTITUTIONALIZATION

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE  
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$45.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$25.00 for air mail postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10 (plus \$3 for postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$95.00 for 1989). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in WESTLAW, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

#### **ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President*,

*University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

JOSEPH BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., *Dean ad interim and Professor of Law*

LARRY W. YACKLE, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

#### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE**

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President*

BERNARD M. DICKENS, Ph.D., LL.D., *President-Elect*

CHRISTINE MITCHELL, R.N., M.S., M.T.S., *Secretary*

GEORGE J. ANNAS, J.D., M.P.H., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## BOARD of EDITORS

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**Frances H. Miller, J.D.**  
Boston University School of Law

### FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

**EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**  
**John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.**

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

**Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.**

### DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

**American Society of Law & Medicine**  
**Merrill Kaitz**

### CIRCULATION MANAGER

**Susan Reddy**

## EDITORS

### **Michael Baram, J.D.**

Boston University Schools of Law  
and Public Health

### **Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Henry Beyer, J.D.**

Boston University School of Law

### **Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.**

Nutter, McClennen & Fish  
Hyannis, Massachusetts

### **William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.**

Harvard University School of  
Public Health

### **Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.**

Powers & Hall  
Boston, Massachusetts

### **Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.**

Harvard Medical School

### **Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.**

Department of Preventive Medicine  
Medical College of Wisconsin

### **Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.**

Duke University School of Law

### **Nathan Hershey, J.D.**

University of Pittsburgh  
Graduate School of Public Health

### **Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.**

Wildman, Harold Allen & Dickson  
Chicago, Illinois

### **Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.**

Hollowell & Silverstein  
Raleigh, North Carolina

### **Richard G. Huber, J.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.**

Director, Program on Science Technology  
and Society  
Cornell University

### **Jay Katz, M.D.**

Yale University Law School

### **Renée M. Landers, J.D.**

Boston College Law School

### **Sylvia A. Law, J.D.**

New York University School of Law

### **Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.**

**F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**

Boston University School of Medicine

### **Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.**

University of Medicine and Dentistry  
of New Jersey

### **Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.**

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida  
Jacksonville, Florida

### **Honorable Max Rosenn**

United States Court of Appeals for the  
Third Circuit

### **Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.**

Founder, American Society of  
Law & Medicine  
Harvard Medical School

### **E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.**

New York Law School

### **Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.**

Former Director, Medical Genetics  
Center

University of Texas at Houston

### **Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.**

Special Assistant to the President  
Tufts University

### **Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.**

Grad. Sch. of Business Administration  
University of Michigan

### **Paul R. Trembley**

Boston College Law School

### **David G. Warren, J.D.**

Duke University

### **Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.**

Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal  
Medicine

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

## INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter**  
Director  
Institute of Bioethics  
The Netherlands

**Dr. S.S. Fluss**  
Chief, Health Legislation  
World Health Organization  
Switzerland

**Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch**  
Institute for Pharmaceutical and  
Medical Law  
University of Gottingen  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.**  
Professor  
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine  
University of Toronto  
Canada

**Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen**  
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice  
Michael J. Kirby**  
President, Court of Appeals  
Supreme Court  
Australia

**Koichi Bai**  
Professor of Law  
Director of Institute of Medical  
Humanities  
School of Medicine  
Kitasato University  
Japan

**P.D.G. Skegg**  
Faculty of Law  
University of Otago  
New Zealand

**Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen**  
Institute for International, Foreign  
and Comparative Law  
Director,  
Working Centre for International  
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law  
The Free University of Berlin  
Federal Republic of Germany

**Professor Amos Shapira**  
Lubowski Professor of Law &  
Biomedical Ethics  
Faculty of Law  
Tel Aviv University  
Israel

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XV NUMBERS 2 & 3 1989

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW  
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS  
1989-1990

**EDITOR-IN-CHIEF**  
Mark Cheffo

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**  
Pamela D. Harvey

**MANAGING EDITOR**  
Robert G. Bannish

**PROJECTS EDITOR**  
James W. Tegmeier

**ARTICLES EDITORS**  
Andrea de Gorgey  
Stephen Freeland  
Daniel Gindes  
Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.

**SYMPOSIUM EDITOR**  
Liane Cohen

#### **CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

Astrid W. Calderon  
Rachel Fishman  
Wayne S. Flick  
Michael C. Fondo

Miriam Kelliher  
William A. Kraiss  
Joan Lieberman  
Allison C. Linneman

#### **THIRD YEAR EDITORS**

Joan Andres  
David Baum  
David J. Breen  
Karyn Finamore  
Allen Glass  
Anne Marie Jennings

Stephen P. Kelly  
Marie Lavalleye  
Barbara A. Masterson  
Linda Mesler  
Laurie E. Meyers

Stephen B. Monick  
James Nealon  
Deborah A. Savarese  
Meredith Skinner  
Pamela L. Taylor  
Susan Tribble

#### **STAFF MEMBERS**

Evan Ackiron  
Michael Adlin  
Daniel Alcott  
Marian Baldwin  
Michael R.B. Balfe  
Michael Borruso  
Scott Brown  
Kimberle Bruckno  
Tim Busler  
Richard A. Calame  
Sally L. Davis  
Michael Flynn

Randy Frisch  
Joseph Hardcastle  
Kenneth Joel  
Carolann F. Jones  
Andrew Kim  
Anne Marie LaBue  
Karen Levin  
Suzanne D.T. Lovett  
Nancy Lubin  
Mark Mantooth  
Michele L. Miller  
Rebecca Morrissey

Heidi Poreda  
Robert H. Rieders  
Julie Rissman  
Giselle Samuely  
Wendy L. Schoen  
Lynn A. Schweinfurth  
Marc Seltzer  
Webb Steadman  
Terry Nicole Steinberg  
Laura Swecney  
Mi Jung Yoon  
David Yu

# The *Webster Amicus Curiae* Briefs: Perspectives on the Abortion Controversy and the Role of the Supreme Court

EDITORS' PREFACE .....	viii
INTRODUCTION: DID THE AMICI EFFORT MAKE A DIFFERENCE? .....	153
Kathryn Kolbert	
AMICI FOR APPELLEES .....	169
BRIEF OF BIOETHICISTS FOR PRIVACY .....	169
George Annas	
<i>WEBSTER</i> AND WOMEN'S EQUALITY .....	178
Dawn Johnsen and Marcy J. Wilder	
<i>WEBSTER</i> AND THE FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT TO MAKE MEDICAL DECISIONS .....	184
David Orentlicher	
ABORTION COUNSELING AND THE FIRST AMENDMENT: OPEN QUESTIONS AFTER <i>WEBSTER</i> .....	189
Rachael N. Pine	
BRIEF FOR 885 LAW PROFESSORS IN SUPPORT OF MAINTAINING ADHERENCE TO THE <i>ROE</i> DECISION .....	197
Norman Redlich	
AMICI FOR APPELLANTS	
THE ROLE OF <i>STARE DECISIS</i> IN THE RECONSIDERATION OF <i>ROE V.</i> <i>WADE</i> .....	204
Albert P. Blaustein, Edward R. Grant, Ann-Louise Lohr and Kevin J. Todd	
JUDICIAL STANDARD OF REVIEW AND <i>WEBSTER</i> .....	211
James Bopp, Jr. and Richard E. Coleson	
<i>WEBSTER</i> , VAGUENESS AND THE FIRST AMENDMENT .....	217
James Bopp, Jr. and Richard E. Coleson	
<i>ROE V. WADE</i> IS CONSTITUTIONALLY UNPRINCIPLED AND LOGICALLY INCOHERENT: A BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF JUDICIAL RESTRAINT .....	222
Jules B. Gerard	
<i>ROE V. WADE</i> AND THE HISTORY OF ABORTION REGULATION .....	227
Paul Benjamin Linton	
CONCLUSION: THE FUTURE OF ABORTION AS A "PRIVATE CHOICE" .....	233
Edward R. Grant	