

*Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, 19 (2022), pp 641–648 © The Author(s), 2022. Published by Cambridge University Press. This is an Open Access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution licence (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

## CD REVIEW

### *Wisps in the Dell*

---

Makaris

Fiona Gillespie, *lead vocals and Irish whistle*, Emi Ferguson, *flute, piccolo, and vocals*, Elliot Figg, *fortepiano*, Edwin Huizinga, *violin*, Kivie Cahn-Lipman, *violoncello*, Doug Balliett, *double bass*

Olde Focus Recordings, fcr916, 2019 (1 CD: 68 minutes) \$11.99

---

According to the album booklet that accompanies this CD, ‘A *makar* (pl. *makaris*) was the name given to the royal court troubadours of medieval Scotland. The term was resurrected centuries later to refer to the literary giants of the Edinburgh Enlightenment, and it is used today to describe a Scottish bard or poet’ (p. 2, italics in the original). On this album, members of the North American early-music ensemble Makaris explore repertoire from the Scottish folk revival at the turn of the nineteenth century. The album is part of the Olde Focus Recordings line – which specializes in new recordings of treasures from the early music repertoire – curated by Makaris cellist Kivie Cahn-Lipman and produced by parent company New Focus Recordings.

During the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, Edinburgh music publisher George Thomson (1757–1851) commissioned a substantial collection of Scottish folk song arrangements from eminent continental European composers. Thomson’s volumes became the chief publications of the broader Scottish folk revival that had begun in the early eighteenth century, and his collection is likewise the source of many of the arrangements featured on this album. The album includes one or more arrangements by every composer he commissioned, encompassing 15 of the 23 tracks.<sup>1</sup> He began in the 1790s with commissions from

---

<sup>1</sup> Ten of the tracks were published in Thomson’s vocal volumes: ‘Dermot and Shelah’ (track 3), ‘Come draw we round a cheerful ring’ (track 5), ‘Sunset’ (track 8), ‘Jock o’ Hazeldean’ (track 10), ‘Jenny Dang the Weaver’ (track 11), ‘Pho pox o’ this nonsense’ (track 13), ‘Sweet Annie’ (track 16), ‘From thee, Eliza’ (track 19), ‘Should auld acquaintance be forgot’ (track 20), and ‘Come fill, fill my good fellow’ (track 23). Five additional tracks also stem from Thomson’s commissions, but as explained later, the versions of those arrangements that are recorded on this album differ from those published in his vocal volumes: ‘True-hearted was he’ (track 2), ‘My love she’s but a lassie yet’ (track 7), ‘On the Massacre of Glencoe’ (track 12), ‘The soothing shades of gloaming’ (track 17), and ‘Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie’ (track 18). Tracks 2 and 17 contain Carl Maria von Weber’s original

Austrian-born Ignace Joseph Pleyel (1757–1831) in France,<sup>2</sup> and Bohemian-born Leopold Kozeluch<sup>3</sup> (1747–1818) in Vienna.<sup>4</sup> Though lesser-known today, Pleyel and Kozeluch were famous throughout Europe during their lives.

Austrian Franz Joseph Haydn (1732–1809) received the next commission from Thomson. Per Cahn-Lipman's liner notes (p. 6), of the over 200 arrangements Haydn submitted to Thomson under his own name between 1800 and 1804, 36 have since been identified as the work of his Austrian student Sigismund Ritter von Neukomm (1778–1858). The album features one such arrangement by Neukomm, 'Jenny Dang the Weaver', which portrays young Jenny's efforts to rid herself of an overly loquacious partner at a country dance.<sup>5</sup> This narrative remains humorously relatable today, especially to those of us who enjoy social dancing.

Thomson's next engagement was a fraught, yet enduring, collaboration with German composer Ludwig van Beethoven (1770–1827) from 1803 to about 1820.

---

arrangements of 'True-hearted was he' and 'The soothing shades of gloaming', without the revisions requested (and published) by Thomson. Track 7 contains the instrumental version of Franz Joseph Haydn's arrangement of 'My love she's but a lassie yet', which Thomson published two years after the vocal version. Track 12 is a premiere recording of Ludwig van Beethoven's rewritten arrangement of 'On the Massacre of Glencoe', which Thomson requested but received too late to publish. Track 18, also a premiere recording, contains Beethoven's original arrangement of 'Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie', without Thomson's published simplifications to the violin part.

<sup>2</sup> Tracks 9 ('The Ewe Bughts', B719), 16 ('Sweet Annie', B723), and 19 ('From thee, Eliza', B716) – all arranged by Pleyel between 1792 and 1793 – first appeared in *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs For the Voice To each of which are added Introductory & Concluding Symphonies & Accompaniments for the Violin & Piano Forte: by Pleyel [...]*, first set (London: Preston, 1793). The catalogue numbers listed in this footnote for Pleyel's arrangements are from Rita Benton, *Ignace Pleyel: A Thematic Catalogue of His Compositions* (New York: Pendragon Press, 1977) – and the 'B' stands for 'Benton'.

<sup>3</sup> The album booklet consistently spells his surname 'Kozeluch', an apparent hybrid of the Germanized spelling ('Kozeluch', with no háček over the 'z' and ending in 'ch') and the Bohemian spelling ('Koželuh', with a háček over the 'z' and no 'c' before the concluding 'h'). I have opted to use the Germanized spelling, 'Kozeluch', which is used in Thomson's publications.

<sup>4</sup> Thomson first published track 20 ('Should auld acquaintance be forgot', PXXII:1), arranged by Kozeluch between 1797 and 1798, in *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs, For the Voice. To each of which are added Introductory & Concluding Symphonies & Accompaniments for the Piano Forte & Violin: by Kozeluch [...]*, third set (London: Preston, 1798). The catalogue number listed here for Kozeluch's arrangement comes from Milan Poštolka, *Leopold Koželuh: Život a Dílo* (Praha: Státní Hudební Vydavatelství, 1964); the 'P' stands for 'Poštolka', and 'XXII' denotes the section of his catalogue devoted to arrangements of folk songs.

<sup>5</sup> Track 11 ('Jenny Dang the Weaver', spuriously listed in Anthony van Hoboken's catalogue of works by Haydn as HXXXIa:240), arranged by Neukomm in 1803, was first published in *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs, for the Voice With Introductory & Concluding Symphonies & Accompaniments for the Piano Forte, Violin & Violoncello By Haydn [...]*, vol. 4 (London: Preston, [1805]). Catalogue numbers for Haydn's arrangements – and those spuriously attributed to him – are taken from Hoboken, *Joseph Haydn: Thematisch-bibliographisches Werkverzeichnis*, vol. 2, *Vokalwerke* (Mainz: B. Schott's Söhne, 1971). The 'H' stands for 'Hoboken', and 'XXXI' denotes the section of the catalogue devoted to arrangements of Scottish and Welsh folk songs and other arrangements. Hoboken further divided this group into subsections 'XXXIa' (containing 273 Scottish songs) and 'XXXIb' (containing 60 Welsh songs and 1 Irish song).

Their cooperation was strained by Beethoven's demands for greater compensation, his insistence that Thomson provide him with English texts prior to arranging, and his inflexibility in revising parts to make them more suitable for amateur performers (Cahn-Lipman, liner notes, pp. 6–7). Of the six arrangements by Beethoven featured on the album, two are claimed to be premiere recordings.

Thomson disapproved of Beethoven's melodic decisions in his initial arrangement of 'On the Massacre of Glencoe' – particularly the disjunct right-hand portion of the piano part in the introduction – and requested that Beethoven rewrite it in a more cantabile style. After failing to receive a revision from Beethoven in a timely fashion, Thomson was forced to publish the earlier, now more familiar, version.<sup>6</sup> Beethoven's long-delayed revision, recorded for the first time on this album, expressively suits the text's depiction of a horrifying massacre that occurred in the early morning hours of 13 February 1692: Scottish Government forces – who had arrived in Glencoe in late January under the guise of peace – murdered approximately 30 members and friends of Clan MacDonald, allegedly for their failure to swear allegiance to new monarchs William and Mary. The lyrical string parts in Beethoven's revision provide an appropriately plaintive atmosphere, in sharp contrast with the disjunct, almost jovial, pizzicato strings of his original arrangement. This track is an especially significant and beautiful contribution to the body of Beethoven recordings.<sup>7</sup>

Thomson likewise opposed the complexity of the violin part in Beethoven's initial arrangement of 'Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie', and in the moderately simplified revision that Beethoven subsequently supplied, in which the violin frequently doubles the vocal melody. With the aim of appealing to amateur performers, Thomson published his own further simplified adaptation of the part, in which the violin mainly doubles the voice, but without the double stops found in Beethoven's revision.<sup>8</sup> In this premiere recording of Beethoven's original arrangement, the near-constant arpeggiation of its more challenging violin part, expertly performed by Edwin Huizinga, contributes significantly to the bouncy texture and spirited sense of forward momentum throughout.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>6</sup> "'On the Massacre of Glencoe", Second version of WoO 152 nr. 5, Hess 192', The Unheard Beethoven (website), <https://unheardbeethoven.org/search.php?Identifier=hess192> (accessed 7 August 2021).

<sup>7</sup> Thomson first published Beethoven's July 1810 arrangements of 'On the Massacre of Glencoe' (first version of WoO152, no. 5), 'Come draw we round a cheerful ring' (track 5, WoO152, no. 8), and 'Dermot and Shelah' (track 3, WoO152, no. 14) in *A Select Collection of Original Irish Airs For the Voice United to Characteristic English Poetry, Written for this Work with Symphonies & Accompaniments For The Piano Forte, Violin, & Violoncello, Composed by Beethoven*, vol. 1 (London: Preston, [1814]). Beethoven did not complete his revision of 'On the Massacre of Glencoe' (second version of WoO152, no. 5) – track 12 on this album – until nearly three years later, in February 1813.

<sup>8</sup> "'Bonnie Laddie, Highland Laddie", First version of Violin part to Op. 108 nr. 7, Hess 201', The Unheard Beethoven (website), <https://unheardbeethoven.org/search.php?Identifier=hess201> (accessed 7 August 2021).

<sup>9</sup> Beethoven wrote his original arrangement of 'Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie' (first version of Op. 108, no. 7) – recorded on track 18 of this album – in May 1815 and completed a revised violin part (second version of Op. 108, no. 7) for Thomson in about February 1818. Thomson first published Beethoven's arrangement of 'Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie' (with his own additional simplification of Beethoven's revised violin part) along with Beethoven's February 1817 arrangement of 'Come fill, fill my good fellow' (track 23, Op. 108, no. 13) and Beethoven's February 1818 arrangement of 'Sunset' (track 8, Op. 108,

Though it is not a modern premiere, Makaris's performance of another Beethoven arrangement, 'Sunset', also is worthy of mention here. This song's quintessentially gothic text vividly expresses a dreary nostalgia for rural landscapes and picturesque ruins. Soprano Fiona Gillespie's nuanced vocal performance complements the mystique of the lyrics. Throughout the album, she largely refrains from the use of vibrato, a decision that greatly enhances the intelligibility of the text and, though perhaps unusual today, does not contradict performance practices of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Throughout 'Sunset', she judiciously engages subtle shimmers of vibrato to accentuate the musical tension inherent within the phrase structure (on the words 'bore', 'tree', and 'chill' in each of the three verses respectively). Furthermore, Gillespie's straight tone also imbues her ornamentation with refreshingly crisp quality, which she uses in a particularly poignant manner to adorn the word 'dreary' at the climax of this track.

Thomson's final vocal commissions were from German composer Carl Maria von Weber (1786–1826) – whose arrangements introduced the flute as an additional accompanying instrument alongside the piano trio – and Austrian composer Johann Nepomuk Hummel (1778–1837) in the 1820s.<sup>10</sup> Although Hummel's other writing was often considered too difficult for most amateurs, his arrangements for Thomson were of appropriate difficulty and enjoyed higher sales than those by Beethoven. In fact, his arrangement of 'Jock o' Hazeldean', recorded on this album, was also published and sold across the Atlantic in the United States.

---

no. 2) in *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs With Introductory & Concluding Symphonies & Accompaniments for the Piano Forte, Violin & Violoncello By Haydn & Beethoven* [. . .], vol. 5 (London: Preston, 1818). Beethoven incorporated elements from both of his previous versions of the violin part for 'Bonny Laddie, Highland Laddie' in his final version, published as Op. 108, in *Schottische Lieder mit englischem und deutschem Texte. Für eine Singstimme und kleines Chor mit Begleitung des Piano-Forte, Violine und Violoncelle obligat componirt von Ludwig van Beethoven* (Berlin: Schlesinger, [1822]).

<sup>10</sup> Thomson issued two supplements extending the fifth volume of *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs For The Voice With Introductory & Concluding Symphonies And Accompaniments for the Piano Forte Violn. or Flute & Violoncello By Pleyel Haydn Weber Beethoven &c.* [...], New Edition, 5 vols. (London: Preston, 1826). He first published Hummel's 1825 arrangement of 'Jock o' Hazeldean' (track 10, S169, no. 1) in the first of these supplements, *Twenty-five Additional Scottish Airs, with Songs, and Symphonies and Accompaniments for the Piano-forte, Violin, Or Flute, & Violoncello, Composed for this Work by Haydn, Hummel, Beethoven, &c. Forming a Second Part to Vol. V* (Edinburgh: John Moir, 1826). Weber's 1825 arrangement of 'Pho pox o' this nonsense' (track 13, J300) first appeared in Thomson's subsequent *Appendix, containing Twelve Favourite Melodies, newly arranged, with symphonies and accompaniments, Composed chiefly by C. M. von Weber, [to the Second Part to Vol. V] for the edition of the Scottish Collection published by G. Thomson in 1826*. Weber arranged 'The soothing shades of gloaming' on 10 February 1825 and 'True-hearted was he' on 20 March 1825, later revising those arrangements in September 1825 at Thomson's request (in a letter to Weber that does not survive). Weber's revised arrangements of 'The soothing shades of gloaming' and 'True-hearted was he' were first published, with further revisions by Thomson, in the *Second Part to Vol. V* and the *Appendix* respectively. Tracks 2 ('True-hearted was he', J298) and 17 ('The soothing shades of gloaming', J300) are recordings of Weber's original arrangements, without revisions. The catalogue number listed in this footnote for Hummel's arrangement is from Joel Sachs, 'A Checklist of the Works of Johann Nepomuk Hummel', *Notes* 30/4 (1974): 732–54. Catalogue numbers for Weber's arrangements are taken from Friedr[ich] Wilh[elm] Jähns, *Carl Maria von Weber in seinen Werken* (Berlin: Schlesinger, 1871). The 'S' in Hummel's catalogue number stands for 'Sachs', and the 'J' in Weber's numbers stands for 'Jähns'.

Gillespie's high notes impart exceptional radiance on this track, but without the sparkling moments of vibrato that she employs on Beethoven's 'Sunset'.

The album also features five vocal arrangements not published by Thomson, two of which were written by Haydn. Beginning prior to his work with Thomson, Haydn also contributed 150 arrangements to the *Selection of Scots Songs* for English publisher William Napier (c. 1740–1812) in the 1790s.<sup>11</sup> Makaris's selections from Napier's collection make striking use of the instruments in the ensemble. The low strings excel in 'My Boy Tammy', where double bassist Doug Balliett takes the lead on the continuo.<sup>12</sup> The fortepiano plays a minimal role in the instrumental passages between verses, punctuating the lyrical harmonies of the double bass, and in turn creating a thinner texture that gives prominence to cellist Cahn-Lipman's beautiful performance of a solo passage between the second and third verses. This satisfying interlude is repeated, and overlaid with flute, between the fourth and fifth verses. In Makaris's performance of 'I do confess thou art sae fair', the number of instruments gradually increases over the course of the track, producing a similarly pleasing effect.<sup>13</sup>

In a nod to Austrian composer Franz Schubert's (1797–1828) noteworthy position within the present-day musical canon, the ensemble also opted to include his setting of Johann Gottfried Herder's (1744–1803) German translation of a traditional murder ballad, 'Edward' – which is sung in English for the first time on this album.<sup>14</sup> Despite his current fame, Schubert was mostly unknown outside Vienna during his lifetime, and thus he did not receive any commissions to write for Thomson – in contrast with Koželuch and Pleyel who have since lost much of the notoriety that drew Thomson to them during their lifetimes. Although each composer on the album writes in his own distinct style, Schubert's setting for voice and piano fits in remarkably well with those commissioned by Thomson and Napier, due probably to the fact that it was written in 1827, around the same time as Thomson's final vocal commissions. The lack of string or flute parts is the only audible hint that Schubert's setting was not published in Napier's or Thomson's collections.

The remaining two vocal arrangements stand out a great deal more, stylistically. The album's opening track, a traditional arrangement of 'The Burning of Auchindoun', sets the stage for Napier's and Thomson's commissions by recalling earlier Scottish music and history; this modal track begins with an expressive

<sup>11</sup> In the liner notes, Cahn-Lipman posits that Thomson's decision to commission folk song arrangements from continental composers was 'perhaps inspired by Napier's success with Haydn' (p. 5).

<sup>12</sup> Napier first published Haydn's undated arrangement of 'My Boy Tammy' (track 15, HXXXIa:18) in *A Selection of Original Scots Songs in Three Parts. The Harmony by Haydn [...]*, vol. 2 (London: Napier, [1792]).

<sup>13</sup> Napier first published Haydn's 1795 arrangement of 'I do confess thou art sae fair' (track 4, HXXXIa:110) in *A Selection of Original Scots Songs in Three Parts. The Harmony by Haydn [...]*, vol. 3 (London: Napier, [1795]).

<sup>14</sup> Schubert wrote three versions of this setting (D. 923). The first and third versions, completed in September 1827 and April 1828 respectively, are both for two voices (one female and one male) and piano. Makaris have recorded the second version, completed in September 1827 (shortly after the first version), for solo voice and piano. This version, not published during Schubert's lifetime, first appeared in the *Alte Gesamt-Ausgabe* in 1895. Cahn-Lipman explains in the liner notes that Herder's translation 'was so carefully syllabized to match its original English text that the song can be performed in English with no musical alterations' (p. 8). The catalogue number for Schubert's settings is from Otto Erich Deutsch, *Schubert: Thematic Catalogue of All His Works in Chronological Order*, in collaboration with Donald R. Wakeling (New York: W.W. Norton, 1951) – and the 'D' stands for 'Deutsch'.

performance of a starkly monophonic flute solo followed by a haunting, homophonic vocal duet about Clan MacIntosh's 1592 sacking of Auchindoun Castle. In contrast, the penultimate track on the album was arranged during a much later period: in the spirit of Thomson's commissioning process, Makaris double bassist Doug Balliett (b. 1982) was tasked with writing a new arrangement of 'The Bonnie House o' Airlie' on a tight deadline imposed by a performance, having been supplied with only the melody and the text.<sup>15</sup> Raised in central Massachusetts and currently based in New York City, Balliett hails from farther from Scotland than the continental European arrangers featured on this album. In terms of musical style, though, the geographical disparity between Balliett's arrangement and the others is overshadowed by chronological distance. This is particularly evident in the conspicuously modern harmonic language that Balliett employs (for example, his use of cluster chords in the pianoforte to punctuate the text 'I wadna kiss thee fairly' in the fifth verse). However, despite Balliett's stylistically evident chronological distance from the other arrangers on this album, there is an aspect of his arrangement that ties it to the time of Thomson: having already eschewed the notion of amateur performance on this album, particularly in the modern Beethoven premieres discussed above, this track adopts a blurring of the roles of composers/arrangers and performers that was much more common during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The text of Balliett's arrangement likewise connects it with the rest of the album. Similar in theme to 'The Burning of Auchindoun', the text in 'The Bonnie House o' Airlie' concerns the 1640 destruction of Airlie Castle (which belonged to Clan Ogilvy, supporters of King Charles I) by Parliamentary troops during the Second Bishops' War. These two tracks thus serve as apt historico-stylistic bookends to the others – the themes of their texts weaving together nicely with that of 'On the Massacre of Glencoe', which appears midway through the album.

Castle and village raids tied to monarchical politics constitute just one of several textual threads running through the album. Amorous affairs abound above all, with eleven songs about true love,<sup>16</sup> courtship,<sup>17</sup> separation,<sup>18</sup> unrequited love,<sup>19</sup> love triangles,<sup>20</sup> and the drinking away of

<sup>15</sup> Balliett likely wrote this arrangement in September 2018. Cahn-Lipman's liner notes specify that Balliett was given 'a strict deadline – imposed by the concert that was scheduled four days later and the recording session immediately after' (p. 9). Presumably that concert was the performance of 'soprano Fiona Gillespie and members of ACRONYM: Emi Ferguson, flute and soprano, Elliot Figg, piano, Edwin Huizinga, violin, Kivie Cahn-Lipman, cello, and Doug Balliett, bass' [Makaris] at the Jaffrey Center Meetinghouse (38 Blackberry Lane, Jaffrey Center, NH 03452) on 15 September 2018, which included a world premiere by Balliett (as listed in the *Monadnock Ledger Transcript* on 13 September 2018 at [www.ledgertranscript.com/ArJfEECFionaGillespiePIC-ml-090618\\_-19928561](http://www.ledgertranscript.com/ArJfEECFionaGillespiePIC-ml-090618_-19928561)).

<sup>16</sup> 'True-hearted was he' (track 2) and 'The soothing shades of gloaming' (track 17) broadly focus on true love.

<sup>17</sup> 'My Boy Tammy' (track 15) specifically describes the courtship stage of a relationship.

<sup>18</sup> Seas separate lovers in 'Sweet Annie' (track 16) and 'From thee, Eliza' (track 19).

<sup>19</sup> 'I do confess thou art sae fair' (track 4) considers unrequited love from the perspective of the infatuated party, whereas 'Jenny Dang the Weaver' (track 11) is sympathetic to the plight faced by a recipient of such one-sided affection. In 'Dermot and Shelah' (track 3), the title characters commiserate about experiencing unrequited love and ultimately develop romantic interest in one another.

<sup>20</sup> In 'The Ewe Bughts' (track 9), the singer courts Marian, ending with a threat to 'draw up wi' Jean' should Marian forsake him. Track 10 depicts a runaway bride leaving her groom for 'Jock o' Hazeldean'.

lovesickness.<sup>21</sup> Drinking in more celebratory contexts is another theme that receives some emphasis, and Makaris have wisely concluded their album with a merry track in this vein.<sup>22</sup> In the final chorus of ‘Come fill, fill my good fellow’, the men in the ensemble lend their voices to the vocal harmonies that Beethoven arranged, thus drawing the album to a pleasantly surprising and boisterous close.

Three additional instrumental arrangements of Scottish folk songs appear on the album, peppering the programme with further variety and showcasing individual instruments. The first of these is an arrangement of ‘My love she’s but a lassie yet’ by Haydn. Two years after publishing Haydn’s vocal arrangement, Thomson published Haydn’s instrumental version as part of his *Six Admired Scotch Airs, Arranged as Rondos, for the Piano Forte with an Accompaniment for the Violin and Flute* (1805).<sup>23</sup> A natural fit for the album, this arrangement was published by Preston, the publisher responsible for the London printings of Thomson’s vocal volumes, though the set contains instrumental versions of Haydn’s vocal arrangements from both Thomson’s and Napier’s collections.

The album also features a solo piano arrangement of ‘Lochaber’ by Muzio Clementi (1752–1832), an Italian-born composer who spent most of his career in England.<sup>24</sup> Originally published in the 1811 *Appendix to the Fifth Edition of Clementi’s Introduction to the Art of Playing on the Piano Forte*, this arrangement brings the instrument’s broad range of timbres and nuanced affective capabilities to the fore. Fortepianist Elliot Figg’s musicianship plays an important role in all tracks on the album, but this solo performance allows him to truly shine.

Makaris’s final instrumental recording consists of excerpts from an 1829 set of variations on ‘The Last Rose of Summer’ for flute and piano by Danish composer Friedrich Kuhlau (1786–1832).<sup>25</sup> This is one of the best-known songs on the album, having appeared in film and television on numerous occasions. Most recently, Anya Taylor-Joy sang it in her role as the titular character in Eleanor Catton’s 2020 film adaptation of the novel *Emma* (1815) by Jane Austen (1775–1817). It is

<sup>21</sup> ‘Pho pox o’ this nonsense’ (track 13) touts imbibement as a distraction from romantic woes.

<sup>22</sup> ‘Come draw we round a cheerful ring’ (track 5) and ‘Come fill, fill my good fellow’ (track 23) both foreground high-spirited libation.

<sup>23</sup> Thomson first published the vocal edition of Haydn’s 1801 arrangement of ‘My Love she’s but a lassie yet’ (HXXXIa:194) in *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs for the Voice, With Introductory & Concluding Symphonies & Accompaniments for the Piano Forte, Violin & Violoncello By Pleyel Kozeluch & Haydn* [ . . . ], vol. 1 (London: Preston, [1803]). Track 7 – the edition for pianoforte, violin, and flute – first appeared in *Six Admired Scotch Airs, Arranged as Rondos, for the Piano Forte with an Accompaniment for the Violin & Flute By Dr. Haydn* (London: Printed & Sold by Preston at his Wholesale Warehouses, 97. Strand, [1805]).

<sup>24</sup> This undated arrangement (track 21) first appeared in the *Appendix To the Fifth Edition of Clementi’s Introduction to the Art of playing on the Piano Forte* [ . . . ] *the whole arranged and fingered By The Editor M. Clementi* (London: Clementi, [1811]). Although that first edition of Clementi’s *Appendix* was not printed with an opus number, the revised version – *Second Part Of Clementi’s Introduction to the Art of playing on the Piano Forte, Being an improvement upon his Work formerly called An Appendix* [ . . . ] (London: Clementi, [c. 1820–21]) – was printed under the label ‘Op. 43’.

<sup>25</sup> Kuhlau composed this set of variations (Op. 105, excerpted on track 14) in 1829, and it was first published as *Variations sur un Air favori Irlandais: “Tis the last Rose of Summer” pour la Flute avec. Accompagnement oe Pianoforte composées et dédiées à Mr. W. L. Huntly par F. Kuhlau* (Leipzig: C. F. Peters, [1830]).

refreshing to hear the flute featured as the primary instrument on this tune so familiar to many of us. Flutist Emi Ferguson shows off her instrument brilliantly, and the theme and variations serves as an apt form for breaking up the verse-by-verse repetition of most of the vocal tracks.

Separated from these arrangements by a vast expanse of time and geography, North American ensemble Makaris brings the spirit of the Scottish folk revival and Thomson's commissions into the twenty-first century. They take appropriate artistic liberties, adding flute parts to a few of the arrangements (usually doubling, replacing, or alternating with the violin), while remaining predominantly rooted in the scores of the original arrangements. The album comes with a highly informative booklet, in which Cahn-Lipman's liner notes and Gillespie's annotations on the song texts are both substantive and easily digestible for readers of diverse musical backgrounds.

In folklore, a will o' the wisp is an atmospheric ghost light observed in the night sky, and the front cover art for this album, Gustav Klimt's (1862–1918) painting *Irrlichter (Will o' the Wisp)* from 1903, depicts the wisps as female humanoid figures. With this in mind, one might view the members of Makaris – especially the female singers – as the very wisps referred to in the album title, roaming the wooded dell depicted in the back cover art, Klimt's 1902 painting *Birkenwald (Birch Forest)*. In the same way a parched viewer may perceive a desert mirage as a distant body of water, weary night-time travellers may be led astray by a will o' the wisp, mistaking it for a flickering lantern.<sup>26</sup> Through the course of this album, Makaris entice listeners down a mysterious, shimmering path through time, and across the sea, to various scenes from Scotland's history. Their high-calibre performance of this eclectic selection of Scottish folk repertoire holds inherent appeal for a broad audience, from Beethoven scholars to Jane Austen enthusiasts, and beyond.

Ashley A. Greathouse  
College-Conservatory of Music, University of Cincinnati  
[ashleyagreathouse@gmail.com](mailto:ashleyagreathouse@gmail.com)  
doi: 10.1017/S147940982200026X

---

<sup>26</sup> Accordingly, a will o' the wisp may metaphorically represent either an unobtainable goal or something strange and sinister.