

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF

# Cultural Property

VOLUME 23 2016 NUMBER 3



**CAMBRIDGE**

ISSN 0940-7391

**Subscription Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* (ISSN 0940-7391) is published quarterly in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press for the International Cultural Property Society. Annual subscription rates for Volume 23 (2016): Institutional subscription rate, print and electronic: US \$503 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £302 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, electronic only: US \$384 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £231 elsewhere. Individual subscription rate, print only: US \$79 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £42 elsewhere. Single part rates, print only: US \$145 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £87 elsewhere. Prices include surface postage.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006. USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England (for UK and elsewhere).

**Society Inquiries:** General inquiries concerning the International Cultural Property Society should be directed to Stanley N. Katz, Director, Center for the Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Woodrow Wilson School, 428 Robertson Hall, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544. Phone: 609-258-5637; fax: 609-258-1235; email: snkatz@princeton.edu.

**Rights and Permissions:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

**Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:** The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0940-7391/10 \$15.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$15.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

**Abstracting Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* is indexed and abstracted in Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts (Online Edition); ARTbibliographies Modern; Avery Index to Architectural Periodicals; Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA); British & Irish Archaeological Bibliography (Online Edition); IBZ—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur.

© International Cultural Property Society 2016

**Cover:** A display case from the Joseph Allen Skinner Museum at Mount Holyoke College, a 7000-object, one-room cabinet of curiosities established in the 1930s and preserved more or less in that form, which illustrates the challenges of attribution and provenance discussed in the essay by Marlowe and its responses. Photograph by Elizabeth Marlowe.

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF Cultural Property

VOLUME 23 (2016) NUMBER 3

## Editor

Alexander A. Bauer,  
*Queens College, CUNY, USA*

## Case Notes Editors

Janet E. Blake, *University of Shahid  
Beheshti, Iran*

Derek Fincham, *South Texas College  
of Law, USA*

## Book Review Editors

Hyung Il Pai, *University of California,  
Santa Barbara, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of  
Queensland, Australia*

## Associate Editors

Haidy Geismar, *University College,  
London, UK*

Sonia Katyal, *Fordham University School  
of Law, USA*

Tom King, *Independent Writer/Consultant, USA*

Lyndel V. Prott, *University of Queensland,  
Australia*

Kurt Siehr, *Universität Zürich, Switzerland  
and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

## Editorial Board

Gregory J. Ashworth, *Rijksuniversiteit  
Groningen, Netherlands*

Márcia Bezerra de Almeida, *Universidade  
Federal do Pará, Brasil*

Gregory Borgstede, *University of  
Pennsylvania Museum, USA*

Michael F. Brown, *School of Advanced  
Research, USA*

Mira Burri, *World Trade Institute,  
Switzerland*

Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Denver  
Museum of Nature and Science, USA*

María Luz Endere, *Conicet and Universidad  
del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos  
Aires, Argentina*

Richard Handler, *University of Virginia,  
USA*

Claire Lyons, *Getty Museum, USA*

Stephanie Moser, *University of  
Southampton, UK*

Elina Moustaira, *Faculty of Law, University  
of Athens, Greece*

Dawson Munjeri, *Delegation of Zimbabwe  
to UNESCO, Zimbabwe  
and France*

Anila Naeem, *NED University of  
Engineering and Technology, Pakistan*

James A. R. Nafziger, *Willamette University  
College of Law, USA*

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of Queensland, Australia*

Robert K. Paterson, *Faculty of Law,  
University of British Columbia, Canada*

Jorge Sánchez Cordero, *Mexican Center of  
Uniform Law, Mexico*

Daniel Shapiro, *President Emeritus,  
International Cultural Property Society,  
USA*

Folarin Shyllon, *Faculty of Law, Olabisi  
Onabanjo University, Nigeria*

Samuel Sidibé, *National Museum of Mali,  
Mali*

Neil Asher Silberman, *University of  
Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*

Madhavi Sunder, *UC Davis School of Law,  
USA*

David Throsby, *Macquarie University,  
Australia*

Alison Wylie, *University of Washington,  
USA*

## Board Members Emeritus

Clemency Coggins, *Boston University, USA*

David Lowenthal, *University College  
London, UK*

†John Henry Merryman (Founder), *Stanford  
University Law School, USA*

Stephen K. Urice, *University of Miami  
School of Law, USA*

INTERNATIONAL  
**Cultural Property**  
SOCIETY

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**President**

Stephen K. Urice  
*University of Miami School of Law, USA*

**Vice-President**

Marc-André Renold  
*Art-Law Centre, University of Geneva Law School, Switzerland*

**Treasurer**

Stephen W. Clark  
*J. Paul Getty Trust*

**Secretary**

Ana Filipa Vrdoljak  
*Faculty of Law, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia*

Derek Gillman  
*Drexel University, USA*

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

Lawrence Rosen  
*Department of Anthropology, Princeton University, USA*

Kurt Siehr, Law School  
*Universität Zurich, Switzerland and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

Susan Taylor  
*New Orleans Museum of Art, USA*

**President Emeritus**

Daniel Shapiro

# CONTENTS

## VOLUME 23 (2016) NUMBER 3

### DISCUSSION ARTICLE

- What We Talk About When We Talk About Provenance: A Response to Chippindale and Gill*  
Elizabeth Marlowe 217

### RESPONSES

- Thinking About Collecting Histories: A Response to Marlowe*  
David W. J. Gill 237
- On Provenance and the Long Lives of Antiquities*  
Claire L. Lyons 245
- Notes on Marlowe's "What We Talk about When We Talk about Provenance"*  
Malcolm Bell, III 254

### REJOINDER

- Response to Responses on "What We Talk About When We Talk About Provenance"*  
Elizabeth Marlowe 257

### ARTICLES

- With Love and Kisses: Nothing Lasts Forever: An Examination of the Social and Artistic Antiquation of Moral Rights*  
Jessica Lewis 267
- The Functioning of Indigenous Cultural Protocols in Australia's Contemporary Art World*  
Marianne Riphagen and Gretchen M. Stolte 295

### CASE NOTE

- The Elephant in the Sales Room: Ivory and the British Antiques Trade*  
Caroline Cox 321

### BOOK REVIEW

- Three Important Works on Cultural Property Crime*  
Etienne Clement 335

### ERRATUM

- Revival, Recognition, Restitution: Indigenous Rights in the Eastern Caribbean—ERRATUM* 341