

March 1980
Volume 3
Number 1

ISSN 0140-525X



The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

In this issue

A special issue on foundations of cognitive science

Rules and representations

1

by Noam Chomsky

With Commentary by J. Andor; R. F. Cromer; R. Cummins & R. M. Harnish; D. C. Dennett; M. T. Ghiselin; G. Gottlieb; G. Harman; P. T. W. Hudson; G. Lakoff; J. C. Marshall; R. J. Matthews; J. D. McCawley; J. M. Moravcsik; A. Morton; J. Morton; H. Rachlin; B. E. Rollin; D. M. Rosenthal; G. Sampson; R. C. Schank; J. R. Searle; E. Sober; S. P. Stich; R. Van Gulick, *and Author's Response*

Methodological solipsism considered as a research strategy in cognitive psychology

63

by J. A. Fodor

With Commentary by N. Block & S. Bromberger; E. Charniak; P. M. Churchland; L. J. Cohen; R. Cummins; L. H. Davis; H. L. Dreyfus; G. Evans; P. T. Geach; G. Harman; J. Haugeland; P. Hayes; S. D. Isard; A. K. Joshi; P. W. Jusczyk & B. Earhard; J. J. Katz; B. F. Loar; D. A. Norman; G. Rey; D. M. Rosenthal; J. R. Searle; R. Shaw & M. T. Turvey; J. J. C. Smart; S. P. Stich; A. Woodfield; *and Author's Response*

Computation and cognition: Issues in the foundation of cognitive science

111

by Zenon W. Pylyshyn

With Commentary by P. S. Churchland; P. M. Churchland; K. M. Colby; W. Demopoulos; M. Fortescue; S. Grossberg; J. Haugeland; J. Heil; S. H. Hulse; E. Hunt; F. Keil; R. L. Klatzky; H. E. Kyburg, Jr.; G. A. Miller; J. R. Miller; R. C. Moore; S. Pinker; W. T. Powers; G. Rey; M. Ringle; W. E. Smythe; S. P. Stich; W. B. Weimer; S. W. Zucker, *and Author's Response*

Cambridge
University
Press

© Cambridge University Press 1980

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
P.O. Box 777
Princeton, NJ 08540

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Animal Intelligence

David Premack
Department of Psychology, University of Pennsylvania

Behavioral Biology

Hans Kummer
Zoologisches Institut und Museum der Universität Zürich

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn
Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario

Ethology and Neuroethology

John C. Fentress
Department of Psychology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S.

Higher CNS Function

Robert W. Doty
Center for Brain Research, University of Rochester

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes
Department of Psychology, Princeton University

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason
Psycholinguistics Research Unit, University College London

Neurobiology

Graham Hoyle
Department of Biology, University of Oregon

Neurophysiology

Barry H. Smith
Surgical Neurology Branch
National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Md

Neuropsychology

Karl Pribram
Department of Psychology, Stanford University

Editorial Policy

THE BEHAVIORAL AND BRAIN SCIENCES (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

The service of Open Peer Commentary is primarily devoted to original articles appearing first in BBS, but it will occasionally be extended to a recent book or already published paper widely judged to be particularly appropriate for Commentary. The editorial office will consider recommendations from the BBS readership concerning possible topics, authors or already published materials for future BBS Commentary. (Please consult the criteria for accepting manuscripts in the *Instructions*, inside back cover.)

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large and growing body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

A qualified professional is eligible to become a BBS Associate if he or she has (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) referred for BBS, or (3) had a commentary

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

or article accepted for publication. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

Copying

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 325 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 3 (1980) is US \$75.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£40.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$35.00 net (£18.50) for individuals; and US \$20.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$22.00 net (£12.00) plus postage. Orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, P.O. Box 110, Cambridge CB2 3RL, England. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. Postmaster: send address changes to Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising

Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York office of Cambridge University Press.