

# Social Philosophy & Policy

## The Welfare State

### CONTENTS

DAVID SCHMIDTZ	Guarantees	1
DAVID T. BEITO	"This Enormous Army": The Mutual Aid Tradition of American Fraternal Societies before the Twentieth Century	20
STEPHEN DAVIES	Two Conceptions of Welfare: Voluntarism and Incorporationism	39
HOWARD HUSOCK	Standards versus Struggle: The Failure of Public Housing and the Welfare-State Impulse	69
THEDA SKOCPOL	The G.I. Bill and U.S. Social Policy, Past and Future	95
DANIEL SHAPIRO	Can Old-Age Social Insurance Be Justified?	116
PETER J. FERRARA	Privatization of Social Security: The Transition Issue	145
JAMES M. BUCHANAN	Can Democracy Promote the General Welfare?	165
H. TRISTRAM ENGELHARDT, JR.	Freedom and Moral Diversity: The Moral Failures of Health Care in the Welfare State	180
LAWRENCE M. MEAD	Citizenship and Social Policy: T. H. Marshall and Poverty	197
ALAN WOLFE and JYTTE KLAUSEN	Identity Politics and the Welfare State	231
RICHARD A. EPSTEIN	The Problem of Forfeiture in the Welfare State	256

# Social Philosophy & Policy

ISSN 0265-0525

**Editor:** Ellen Frankel Paul

**Associate Editors:** Fred D. Miller, Jr., and Jeffrey Paul

**Managing Editor:** Harry Dolan

*Social Philosophy and Policy Center*

## Editorial Board

David Braybrooke

*University of Texas, Austin*

Baruch Brody

*Rice University*

Allen Buchanan

*University of Wisconsin, Madison*

James Buchanan

*Center for Study of Public Choice,*

*George Mason University*

Jules Coleman

*Yale University*

Jack Douglas

*University of California, San Diego*

Richard A. Epstein

*University of Chicago Law School*

James Fishkin

*University of Texas, Austin*

Antony G.N. Flew

*University of Reading (Emeritus)*

Martin Golding

*Duke University*

John Gray

*Jesus College, Oxford University*

Gilbert Harman

*Princeton University*

Seymour Martin Lipset

*George Mason University and*

*Hoover Institution, Stanford University*

Eric Mack

*Tulane University*

Harvey Mansfield, Jr.

*Harvard University*

Wallace I. Matson

*University of California, Berkeley*

Jan Narveson

*University of Waterloo*

Robert Nozick

*Harvard University*

Nicholas Rescher

*University of Pittsburgh*

David Sidorsky

*Columbia University*

Hillel Steiner

*University of Manchester*

James Q. Wilson

*University of California,*

*Los Angeles*

Leland B. Yeager

*Auburn University*

*Social Philosophy & Policy* is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints of contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

**Editorial Office:** Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Bowling Green, OH 43403, USA.

**Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Information:** See inside back cover.

Copyright © 1997 Social Philosophy and Policy Foundation

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from *Social Philosophy & Policy*. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0265-0525/97 \$7.50+ .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained from *Social Philosophy & Policy* for all other copying.

Printed in the United States of America

## CONTRIBUTORS

**David Schmidtz** is Associate Professor of Philosophy and, by courtesy, Associate Professor of Economics at the University of Arizona. He is the author of *Rational Choice and Moral Agency* (1995) and *The Limits of Government: An Essay on the Public Goods Argument* (1991). He and Robert Goodin are currently preparing a book for Cambridge University Press on responsibility and welfare.

**David T. Beito** is Assistant Professor of History at the University of Alabama. His current research interests are focused on the history of the nongovernmental provision of public services. He is the author of *Taxpayers in Revolt: Tax Resistance during the Great Depression* (1989) and of articles in the *Journal of Urban History*, *Critical Review*, and the *Journal of Policy History*. He is currently working on a book entitled *From Mutual Aid to the Welfare State*, which discusses the role of fraternal societies as sources of social welfare during the twentieth century.

**Stephen Davies** is Senior Lecturer in the Department of English and History at Manchester Metropolitan University in Manchester, England. He received a degree in Medieval and Modern History at the University of St. Andrews in 1976, and earned his Ph.D. from the same university in 1984. He is the author of *Beveridge Revisited: New Foundations for Tomorrow's Welfare* (1986) and is currently at work on a book which examines the successful provision of charitable services by private organizations in England during the nineteenth century.

**Howard Husock** is Director of Case Studies in Public Policy and Management at the Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, where he is also affiliated with the Taubman Center for State and Local Government. He has published widely on housing and social policy, and his work has appeared in such periodicals as the *Wall Street Journal*, the *New York Times*, *City Journal*, *The Responsive Community*, *Critical Review*, and *The Public Interest*. He is a 1972 graduate of the Boston University School of Public Communication and was a 1981-92 Mid-Career Fellow at the Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs, Princeton University.

**Theda Skocpol** is Professor of Government and Sociology at Harvard University. She received her B.A. in 1969 from Michigan State University, and her Ph.D. in 1975 from Harvard University. She was the 1996 President of the Social Science History Association, and is a member of the Council of the American Political Science Association and a fellow of the

American Academy of Arts and Sciences. She is the author of *States and Social Revolutions: A Comparative Analysis of France, Russia, and China* (1979), *Protecting Soldiers and Mothers: The Political Origins of Social Policy in the United States* (1992), and *Boomerang: Clinton's Health Security Effort and the Turn against Government in U.S. Politics* (1996).

**Daniel Shapiro** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at West Virginia University. He received his B.A. from Vassar College in 1976 and his Ph.D. from the University of Minnesota in 1984, and has held visiting appointments at Rice University, the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and Bowling Green State University. He has published a variety of articles in social and political philosophy in such journals as *Philosophical Studies*, *Social Theory and Practice*, *Public Affairs Quarterly*, *Journal of Political Philosophy*, and *Law and Philosophy*. He is currently at work on a book which compares welfare-state institutions to more free-market alternatives, as judged by central values or principles in contemporary political philosophy.

**Peter J. Ferrara** is General Counsel and Chief Economist at Americans for Tax Reform and an Associate Scholar at the Cato Institute. He has served as Associate Deputy Attorney General of the United States (1992–1993), as Associate Professor of Law at George Mason University School of Law (1987–1991), and as a senior staff member at the White House Office of Policy Development (1981–1983). He has written numerous books, studies, and articles on Social Security, including *Society Security: The Inherent Contradiction* (1981). He is a graduate of Harvard College and Harvard Law School.

**James M. Buchanan** is Harris University Professor at George Mason University and Advisory General Director of the Center for Study of Public Choice. He received his B.A. from Middle Tennessee State College in 1940, his M.S. from the University of Tennessee in 1941, and his Ph.D. from the University of Chicago in 1948. He is the recipient of the 1986 Nobel Prize in Economic Sciences, the editor of *The Return to Increasing Returns* (with Yong J. Yoon, 1994), and the author of *Ethics and Economic Progress* (1994), *The Economics and the Ethics of Constitutional Order* (1991), *Constitutional Economics* (1991), *Economics: Between Predictive Science and Moral Philosophy* (1987), *The Limits of Liberty* (1975), and *The Calculus of Consent* (with Gordon Tullock, 1962).

**H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr.** is Professor of Medicine at Baylor College of Medicine, Professor of Philosophy at Rice University, and Member of the Center for Medical Ethics and Health Policy at Baylor College of Medicine. He is the editor of the *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* and the coeditor of *Christian Bioethics*. He is also the coeditor of the book series *Philosophy and Medicine* and *Clinical Medical Ethics*, and the editor of the

## CONTRIBUTORS

book series *Philosophical Studies in Contemporary Culture*. A revised second edition of his book *The Foundations of Bioethics* was published by Oxford University Press in 1996.

**Lawrence M. Mead** is Professor of Politics at New York University, where he teaches public policy and American government. He has also been a visiting professor at Harvard University, Princeton University, and the University of Wisconsin. A specialist on social policy and poverty, he has been a leading advocate and scholar of work requirements as an approach to welfare reform. He has published *Beyond Entitlement* (1986), *The New Politics of Poverty* (1992), and many journal articles on social policy, welfare, and welfare reform.

**Alan Wolfe** is University Professor of Sociology and Political Science at Boston University. He is the author of a number of books including *Whose Keeper? Social Science and Moral Obligation* (1989) and, most recently, *Marginalized in the Middle* (1996). A contributing editor of *The New Republic* and *The Wilson Quarterly*, he is currently writing a book on middle-class morality.

**Jytte Klausen** is Assistant Professor of Comparative Politics at Brandeis University and a Fellow at the Center for European Studies, Harvard University. She is currently completing a book on the social dimension of postwar economic policy, *Parity Politics in European Capitalism, 1945–1995*. She is also the author of articles on citizenship and the European welfare state, and on the position of women in trade unions, and is the coeditor (with Louise A. Tilly) of *European Integration as a Social Process: Historical Perspectives, 1850–1995*.

**Richard A. Epstein** is James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Takings: Private Property and the Power of Eminent Domain* (1985), *Forbidden Grounds: The Case against Employment Discrimination Laws* (1992), *Bargaining with the State* (1993), and *Simple Rules for a Complex World* (1995). He is an editor of the *Journal of Law and Economics* and a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.