

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review



Theoretical and Critical Contexts in  
Nineteenth-Century Performance Practice

Volume 9 • Issue 1 • June 2012

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review

*Nineteenth-Century Music Review* locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

## General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

## Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER, *Louisiana State University  
School of Music, USA*  
TOMI MÄKELÄ (Recording Review Co-Editor)  
*Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg Institut  
für Musik, Germany*  
MANUELA SCHWARTZ (Recording Review Co-Editor)  
*Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany*

JAMES WILLIAM SOBASKIE (Book Review Editor)  
*Mississippi State University, USA*  
R. LARRY TODD (Score Review Editor)  
*Duke University, USA*  
WILLIAM WEBER, *California State University,  
Long Beach, USA*  
PHYLLIS WELIVER, *Saint Louis University, USA*

## Advisory Board

ROSAMUND BARTLETT  
*King's College, London, UK*  
PHILIP V. BOHLMAN  
*University of Chicago, USA*  
ANDREW BOWIE  
*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*  
ANNA CELENZA  
*Georgetown University, USA*  
GEOFFREY CHEW  
*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*  
NICHOLAS COOK  
*University of Cambridge, UK*  
JOHN DEATHRIDGE  
*King's College, University of London, UK*  
JAMES DEAVILLE  
*Carleton University, Canada*  
JEREMY DIBBLE  
*Durham University, UK*  
STEPHEN DOWNES  
*University of Surrey, UK*  
KATHARINE ELLIS  
*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*  
ANNEGRET FAUSER  
*University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA*  
PETER FRANKLIN  
*University of Oxford, UK*  
SOPHIE FULLER  
*Trinity College of Music, UK*

LYDIA GOEHR  
*Columbia University, USA*  
THOMAS GREY  
*Stanford University, USA*  
JULIAN HORTON  
*University College Dublin, Ireland*  
LINDA HUTCHEON  
*University of Toronto, Canada*  
HERVÉ LACOMBE  
*Université Rennes 2 - Haute Bretagne, France*  
RALPH LOCKE  
*Eastman School of Music, USA*  
ROBERTA MARVIN  
*University of Iowa, USA*  
SIMON McVEIGH  
*Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK*  
JULIAN RUSHTON  
*University of Leeds, UK*  
JIM SAMSON  
*Royal Holloway, University of London, UK*  
MARY ANN SMART  
*University of California, Berkeley, USA*  
NICHOLAS TEMPERLEY  
*University of Illinois, USA*  
SUSAN WOLLENBERG  
*University of Oxford, UK*  
SUSAN YOUENS  
*University of Notre Dame, USA*

**SUBSCRIPTIONS** *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published twice a year in June and December. Two parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 9 (2012), which includes print and electronic access, is £120 net (US\$192 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £30 net (US\$50 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £60 (US\$90 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 10994-2133, USA.

**COPYING** This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2012. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use*, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Journals Online service which can be found at [journals.cambridge.org](http://journals.cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2012

# Contents

VOLUME 9, ISSUE 1

Notes on Article Contributors 1

Mine Doğantan-Dack  
Introduction 3

## ARTICLES

Mine Doğantan-Dack  
'Phrasing – the Very Life of Music': Performing the Music and  
Nineteenth-Century Performance Theory 7

David Milsom  
Practice and Principle: Perspectives upon the German 'Classical'  
School of Violin Playing in the Late Nineteenth Century 31

Mary Hunter  
'The Most Interesting Genre of Music': Performance, Sociability and  
Meaning in the Classical String Quartet 1800–1830 53

Peter Johnson  
'Labyrinthine Pathways and Bright Rings of Light': Hoffmann's  
Aesthetics of Music in Performance 75

## REVIEWS

### *Book Reviews*

Denise Von Glahn  
Candace Bailey, *Music and the Southern Belle: From Accomplished Lady to  
Confederate Composer* (Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University  
Press, 2010). xvi + 256 pp. \$29.95 93

Matthew Pritchard  
Scott Burnham, *Sounding Values: Selected Essays* (Farnham, UK:  
Ashgate, 2010). xviii + 328 pp. £85.00 97

Suzannah Clark  
David Damschroder, *Harmony in Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge  
University Press, 2010). xii + 321 pp. \$99.00 101

- Lesley A. Wright  
Vincent Giroud, *French Opera: a short history* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010). x + 366 pp. \$40.00 107
- Daisy Fancourt  
Roe-Min Kok and Laura Tunbridge, eds, *Rethinking Schumann* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011). xv + 471pp. £30.00 110
- David Korevaar  
Jonathan Kregor, *Liszt as Transcriber* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010). xiii + 299 pp. £55.00 115
- Martin Ennis  
Wm. A. Little, *Mendelssohn and the Organ* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2010). xvi + 504 pp. \$65.00 118
- Brent Auerbach  
Ryan McClelland, *Brahms and the Scherzo: Studies in Musical Narrative* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010). xvi + 320pp. £58.50 122
- Diana R. Hallman  
Roberta Montemorra Marvin and Hilary Poriss, eds., *Fashions and Legacies of Nineteenth-Century Italian Opera* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010). xviii + 283 pp. £55.00 127
- Jennifer Oates  
Ian Taylor, *Music in London and the Myth of Decline: From Haydn to the Philharmonic* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010). xiv + 208 pp. £55.00 131
- Colin Timothy Eatock, *Mendelssohn and Victorian England* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2009). xi + 189 pp. £49.50
- Charles Edward McGuire, *Music and Victorian Philanthropy: The Tonic Sol-fa Movement* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). xxiii + 240 pp. £53.00
- Recording Reviews*
- CDs*
- Maris Gothoni
- Franz Liszt, 200 Years  
*Complete Piano Music Vol. 33: Wagner & Weber Transcriptions*, Steven Mayer, *pf*, Naxos 8.570562 (68 minutes: DDD) 137
- The Sound of Weimar, Volume 1: Dante-Symphony, Evocation à la Chapelle Sixtine*, Orchester Wiener Akademie, Chorus sine nomine, Martin Haselböck, *cond*, NCA CD 60234 (59 minutes: DDD)

*Liszt, His Life and Music* by Malcolm Hayes, Naxos Educational 2 CD Set with bonus material 8.558214-15 (154 minutes: DDD)

*Sonata in B minor, Fantasy and Fugue on the choral 'Ad nos, ad salutarem undam'* (trans Ferruccio Busoni), Garrick Ohlsson, *pf*, Bridge CD 9337 (61 minutes: DDD)

*Rare Piano Works (Réminiscences des Puritains, Phantasie und Fuge über das Thema B-A-C-H, Variationen über das Thema Weinen, Klagen, Sorgen, Zagen, Berceuse, Litanei)*, Gregorio Nardi, *pf*, Dynamic CD DM 8017 (68 minutes: DDD)

*Piano Sonata, Fantasie und Fuge über das Thema B-A-C-H, Bénédiction de Dieu dans la solitude, Venezia e Napoli*, Marc-André Hamelin, *pf*, Hyperion CDA 67760 (79 minutes: DDD)

*Funeral Odes (Von der Wiege bis zum Grabe, Zwei Episoden aus Lenaus Faust, Trois odes funèbres)*, BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra, Ilan Volkov, *cond*, Hyperion CDA 67586 (79 minutes: DDD)

*The Liszt Project (La lugubre gondola S.200, Nuages gris, Unstern!, Piano Sonata in B minor, Aux cyprès de la Villa d'Este I – Threnodie, Saint Francois d'Assise: La prédication aux oiseaux, Les Jeux d'eau à la Villa d'Este, Vallée d'Obermann + works by Wagner, Berg, Scriabin, Ravel, Bartók, Messiaen, Stroppa)*, Pierre-Laurent Aimard, *pf*, Deutsche Grammophon 4779439 (2 CDs, 166 minutes: DDD)

*Piano Works ('Après une lecture du Dante: Fantasia quasi Sonata', Lacrymosa [after Mozart's Requiem], Ballade No. 2, Liebeslied [after Schumann], Mazeppa, Nuages gris, Ständchen [after Schubert], Funérailles, Isoldes Liebestod [after Wagner])*, Lise de la Salle, *pf*, NAÏVE V 5267 (77 minutes: DDD)

#### Tobias Robert Klein

150

Louis Spohr, *Der Alchemyst*

Bernd Weikl, Moran Abouloff, Susanne Pütters, Jörg Dürmüller, Jan Zinkler, Mike Garling.

Orchestra and Chorus of the Staatstheater Braunschweig.

Conductor: Christian Fröhlich.

Oehms Classics OC 923 (3 CD)

Engelbert Humperdinck, *Königskinder*

Klaus-Florian Vogt, Juliane Banse, Christian Gerhaher, Gabriele Schnaut et al.

Deutsches Symphonie Orchester, Rundfunkchor Berlin.

Conductor: Ingo Metzmacher.

Chrystall Classics N 67 044 (3 CD)

#### DVDs

##### Sebastian Stoppe

##### Once again in rehearsal

153

*Celibidache Rehearses Bruckner's Ninth*

Director: Jan Schmidt-Garre

Arthaus Musik DVD 101 555; 2011, 58 min.

- Markus Mantere  
 How to listen and watch *Die Walküre* without Politics? 156  
 Richard Wagner: *Die Walküre*  
 Production: Tankred Dorst  
 Bayreuth Festival Orchestra, cond. Christian Thielemann  
 Siegmund – Johan Botha  
 Wotan – Albert Dohmen  
 Sieglinde – Edith Haller  
 Brünnhilde – Linda Watson  
  
 Opus Arte DVD (OABD7081D) (Recorded live from the Bayreuth  
 Festival, 2010)  
 Price 28£ (amazon.com)
- Score Reviews*
- Robin Wallace  
 Beethoven, Ludwig van. *Piano Concerto in E-flat Major WoO4*. Recent  
 Researches in the Music of the Classical Era, volume 80. Ed. Jon  
 Ceander Mitchell. Middleton, WI: A-R Editions, 2010. 161  
 \_\_\_\_\_ . *Konzert in D für Klavier und Orchester*  
 nach dem Violinkonzert. Ed. Jonathan Del Mar. Kassel: Bärenreiter,  
 2010. Score/Parts/Piano Reduction/Critical Commentary.
- Katharina Uhde  
 Brahms, Johannes. *Sextet in B-flat major, for 2 Violins, 2 Violas and 2* 163  
*Violoncellos, Op. 18*. Edited by Christopher Hogwood. Bärenreiter-  
 Verlag Urtext. Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag Karl Vötterle GmbH und Co.  
 KG, 2011. XIX, 47 p., and editorial appendix 48-58. Parts in slipcover,  
 BA 9419, €32,95, study score TP 419, €11,95.  
 Brahms, Johannes. *Sextet in G major, for 2 Violins, 2 Violas and*  
*2 Violoncellos, Op. 36*. Edited by Christopher Hogwood. Bärenreiter-  
 Verlag Urtext. Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag Karl Vötterle GmbH und Co.  
 KG, 2011. XXII, 62 p., and editorial appendix 64-77. Parts in slipcover,  
 BA 9420, €32,95, study score TP 420, €12,95.
- James Briscoe  
 Debussy, Claude. *1er Quatuor pour 2 violons, alto et violoncello, op. 10*. 167  
 Edited by Douglas Woodfull-Harris. Bärenreiter-Verlag Urtext. Kassel:  
 Bärenreiter-Verlag Karl Vötterle GmbH und Co. KG, 2010. XXX, 55 p.,  
 and editorial appendix 58-65. Parts BA 9414, €28.95, study score TP  
 414, €14.95.
- Benedict Taylor  
 MacCunn, Hamish, *Three Overtures: 'The Land of the Mountain and the* 170  
*Flood', 'The Ship o' the Fiend', 'The Dowie Dens o' Yarrow'*, ed. Jennifer  
 Oates, Madison, WI, A-R Editions (2010).