

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation
Volume 21, Number 1, Winter 1996

The University of Chicago Press

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation

Published by The University of Chicago Press

<i>Editors</i>	Carol A. Heimer Elizabeth Mertz
<i>Review Editor</i>	Howard S. Erlanger
<i>Associate Editors</i>	John L. Comaroff Karyl A. Kinsey Victoria Saker Woeste
<i>Managing Editor</i>	John Atkinson
<i>Editorial Coordinator</i>	Rozanne Caldwell

Editorial Board

Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Ian Ayres, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Donald Black, Professor of Sociology, University of Virginia
Erhard Blankenburg, Professor of Sociology of Law, Free University of Amsterdam
John Braithwaite, Professor of Law and Sociology, The Australian National University
Jane F. Collier, Professor of Anthropology, Stanford University
Phoebe C. Ellsworth, Professor of Law and Psychology, University of Michigan
Eliot L. Freidson, Professor of Sociology, New York University
Lawrence M. Friedman, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Hazel Genn, Professor of Law, Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London
Carol J. Greenhouse, Professor of Anthropology, Indiana University
Valerie P. Hans, Professor of Criminal Justice, University of Delaware
Earl Johnson, Jr., Associate Justice, California State Court of Appeal
Doreen McBarnet, Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Wolfson College, Oxford
Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Laura Nader, Professor of Anthropology, University of California-Berkeley
Judith Resnik, Professor of Law, University of Southern California
Daniel Rubinfeld, Professor of Economics, University of California-Berkeley
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Professor of Sociology, Brown University
Martin M. Shapiro, Professor of Law, University of California-Berkeley
Susan S. Silbey, Professor of Sociology, Wellesley College
David Sugarman, School of Law, Lancaster University
David M. Trubek, Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin
Barbara Yngvesson, Professor of Anthropology, Hampshire College
Michael Zander, Professor of Law, Department of Law, London School of Economics

Law & Social Inquiry

Volume 21, Number 1, Winter 1996

ARTICLES

- Liberty without Equality: The Property-Rights Connection in a
“Negative Citizenship” Regime** 1
David Abraham
- Commentaries*
- The Antinomy of Public Purposes and Private Rights in the
American Constitutional Tradition, or Why Communitarianism
Is Not Necessarily Exogenous to Liberal Constitutionalism** 67
Howard Gillman
- What’s Wrong with “Negative Liberty”** 79
James Oakes
- Anti-Negativity as Form** 83
Frank I. Michelman
- The New Citizenship and Wars of Position** 89
Mark Tushnet
- The Difference between Blackstone-Like Error Ratios and
Probabilistic Standards of Proof** 95
Michael L. DeKay

REVIEW ESSAYS

- The Dilemma of Judicial Biography or Who Cares Who Is the Great
Appellate Judge? Gerald Gunther on Learned Hand** 135
Linda Przybyszewski
- Law, Community, and Everyday Life: Yngvesson’s Virtuous Citizens
and Disruptive Subjects** 173
Alan Hunt
- Amateurs and Professionals, Lawyers and Critics: An Essay on
Kornstein’s Shakespeare** 185
Susan Sage Heinzelman
- The Limits of Legal Realism as Biography** 205
Peter M. Shane

BOOK NOTES

215

Publication Policy

The American Bar Foundation is an independent research institute committed to socio-legal research. Consistent with its mandate to create and disseminate knowledge about law, the legal profession, and legal institutions, *Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation* invites the submission of articles that make original contributions to understanding of socio-legal processes. *Law and Social Inquiry* publishes both empirical and theoretical studies from a variety of disciplinary perspectives. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions are those of the authors alone.

Manuscript Evaluation: *Law and Social Inquiry* is a refereed journal. Manuscripts that the Editors deem appropriate for the journal are evaluated by two or more reviewers with expertise in the relevant subject matter and methodology. Manuscripts produced by ABF research fellows are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

Submission of Manuscripts: Manuscripts submitted to *Law and Social Inquiry* should be typed double-spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. The review process is anonymous; all identifying information should appear only on a separate cover sheet and not in the body of the manuscript.

Law and Social Inquiry does not accept multiply submitted articles. The Editors endeavor to make decisions promptly, usually about two months after submission.

Editing of Manuscripts: All manuscripts accepted for publication are edited for style by professional copyeditors in consultation with the author. Copyeditors do not check citations. Authors see edited manuscripts and/or proofs.

Off-Prints to Authors: Without charge, we provide authors with 25 off-prints of their articles, essays, or exchanges (but not symposia) that appear in *Law and Social Inquiry*. Additional off-prints may be ordered at the author's expense. Authors receive 1 copy of the issue in which their contributions appear.

Republication Rights: The Foundation normally permits authors to republish their manuscripts in books or use their manuscripts after publication, but *Law and Social Inquiry* has the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The journal retains the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

Copying Beyond Fair Use: The code on the first page of a contribution in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the contribution may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for classroom use without charge, copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to the Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

Comments and Responses: Comments on or responses to articles or review essays in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

Send article manuscripts to:

The Editors
Law and Social Inquiry
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding
review essays to:

Howard S. Erlanger
Review Editor
Law and Social Inquiry
Institute for Legal Studies
Law School
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53706
(608) 263-7405

Annual U.S. subscription rates:

	1 yr.	2 yr.	3 yr.
Individuals	\$36	\$66.25	\$91.80
Academic	\$29	\$53.35	\$73.95
Institutions	\$59	\$108.55	\$150.45

Outside U.S. please add a postage charge of \$6.00 per year to the U.S. rates. **Canadians please add** 7% GST tax to above rates as follows: One-year rates: Individuals \$2.52; Academic \$2.03; Institutions \$4.13. Two-year rates: Individuals \$4.64; Academic \$3.73; Institutions \$7.60. Three-year rates: Individuals \$6.43; Academic \$5.18; Institutions \$10.53.

Single copies: \$14.75 for institutions, \$9.00 for individuals. Checks should be made payable to *Law & Social Inquiry*, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, Illinois 60637. (Fax: 312-753-0811; E-mail: subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu) Volumes 1-12 available from Fred B. Rothman & Company, 10368 West Centennial Road, Littleton, Colorado 80127. (303) 979-5657

Volumes available in microfilm from University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

© 1996 American Bar Foundation. All rights reserved.

Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation (ISSN: 0897-6546) is published quarterly—winter, spring, summer, and fall—by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 South Woodlawn Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and at additional mailing office.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: *Law and Social Inquiry*, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

Acknowledgments to Reviewers

The Editors wish to thank the following reviewers whose careful evaluations and helpful recommendations have greatly assisted us in selecting manuscripts for Volume 20 of *Law and Social Inquiry*. We are grateful for their willingness to provide their expertise in furthering our efforts to ensure the publication of high-quality contributions to sociolegal scholarship.

Richard L. Abel	Carol J. Greenhouse	Peggy Pascoe
Ronald Allen	Samuel R. Gross	Carole Pateman
Joyce Appleby	Michael C. Grossberg	Laura Bennett Peterson
Robert Asher	Joseph Gusfield	David Plotke
Ava Baron	Terence C. Halliday	Joel Podolny
Randolph Bergstrom	Valerie Hans	Lawrence Poos
Amy Binder	Vivien Hart	Michael Powell
Mindie Lazarus Black	Reid Hastie	Linda Przybyszewski
Eileen Boris	John P. Heinz	David Rabban
Lisa Bower	Herbert Hovenkamp	H. Lawrence Ross
Ben Brown	Alan Hunt	Thomas D. Russell
Kitty C. Calavita	Ira Katznelson	Charles F. Sabel
Bruce Carruthers	Herbert Kritzer	Richard H. Sander
Sara Cobb	Michael D. Landon	Joseph Sanders
Rosemary Coombe	Jane Larson	Michael S. Schudson
Faye Crosby	Sylvia A. Law	Carroll Seron
Stephen Daniels	Richard Lempert	Ronen Shamir
Kenneth W. Dauber	E. Allan Lind	Martin M. Shapiro
Kevin Delaney	Sybil Lipschultz	Susan P. Shapiro
Shari S. Diamond	Steven Lubet	Peter Siegelman
Robert Dingwall	Jane J. Mansbridge	Jonathan S. Simon
Virginia R. Dominguez	Nancy Matthews	Kent W. Smith
Tom Durkin	Michael McCann	Richard Speidel
Richard J. Ellis	Kathleen A. McGraw	Mitchell Stevens
Charles R. Epp	Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow	Guy Stuart
Wendy N. Espeland	James C. Mohr	Donald Swartz
Jay M. Feinman	Karl Monsma	Mark Tushnet
Benjamin Forest	Frank Munger	Diane Vaughan
Lawrence M. Friedman	Robert Nelson	Elizabeth Warren
Judy Fudge	James Oakes	Barbara Welke
Janet A. Gilboy	Susan M. Okin	John Yinger
Howard Gillman	Pat O'Malley	Barbara Yngvesson
Sally Gordon		James Zetka

From the Editor

With this issue, *Law and Social Inquiry* begins a transition in editorial leadership. Since 1992, the Articles section of the journal has been jointly edited by a team of three editors: first, from 1992-1994, by Arthur McEvoy, Peter Siegelman, and myself; and then, from 1994 until the present by Peter Siegelman, Christopher Tomlins and myself. In Art and Chris, *LSI* was fortunate indeed to have two of the preeminent legal historians of this generation at the helm. Their judgment and energy have been crucial in moving the journal forward. Art has joined the University of Wisconsin Law School faculty, where he will continue the law school's outstanding tradition in legal history, while Chris recently took a leave from *LSI* to become the Editor of the *Law and History Review*. *LSI* also benefitted greatly from Peter's talented guidance and unsinkable sense of humor; in addition to his remarkable ability to communicate with non-economists about matters quantitative and his wide-ranging intellectual interests, Peter brought to *LSI* meetings a never-exhausted stock of jokes to lighten the more tedious moments. Peter has left *LSI* and the ABF for his current research position at Yale University, where he will continue his pathbreaking work on law, economics, and discrimination, in collaboration with another former *LSI* editor, Ian Ayres. We owe our past special issue on "Lustration" to Peter's efforts, and our upcoming special issue on "Business Disputing" to the combined efforts of Art and Chris. They will all be sorely missed, and we wish them well. We have also been blessed with a talented editorial group which included, as Associate Editors, Karyl Kinsey, Carol Heimer, and Victoria Woeste. The Managing Editor, John Atkinson, and Editorial Coordinator, Rozanne Caldwell, have gamely tolerated our bad jokes and at-times fuzzy academic ways, and have managed us as well as the manuscripts in superlative style. And, as always, *LSI*—like the *Law & Society Review*—relies heavily on that one-woman tower of copyediting strength, Bette Sikes, who single-handedly continues to provide the bulk of the copyediting for two of the field's major journals.

It has been a joy to work with my co-editors and associate editors over the past four years. It is all too rare in academic life to find a group of colleagues from across such varied disciplines who can not only function cooperatively and learn from one another, but who also have a lot of fun in the process. As of June, 1996, *LSI* will begin a new configuration, when Carol Heimer will join me as co-editor. Carol is a sociologist who is known for her work on the management of risk through law and other normative systems. Her current research focuses on how law and other normative systems jointly produce responsibility in neonatal intensive care. She holds a

joint appointment with the American Bar Foundation and the Department of Sociology at Northwestern University. John Comaroff, a leading anthropologist whose recent work has focused on South Africa, will be joining us as an Associate Editor. He holds joint appointments at the American Bar Foundation and the Department of Anthropology at the University of Chicago. *LSI* is also very fortunate to continue to benefit from the wisdom and energy of Karyl Kinsey, whose work in social psychology focuses on issues of tax compliance, and Victoria Woeste, a legal historian whose research examines intersections of law and political economy during the early twentieth century. They will be continuing their terms as Associate Editors. I look forward to another term at *LSI* working with this exciting new editorial group.

Throughout the changes, Howard Erlanger, Voss-Bascom Professor of Law and Professor of Sociology at the University of Wisconsin, has continued to hold down the Review Section, as he has since 1982. Despite his perennial warnings that the “pipeline” may soon dry up, that section is still thriving under his able guidance. Howie’s work in the sociology of law, focusing on the legal profession and on law and organizations, is no doubt familiar to many of you.

LSI continues also in partnership with the University of Chicago Press, which publishes the journal. We are working to bring you the most innovative and solid current research and thought about the interaction of law and society. A new feature, “From the Trenches and Towers,” has initiated an ongoing effort on our part to bring scholars and practitioners into dialogue with one another, juxtaposing more immediate accounts of legal practice with scholarly understandings and analyses. Our “Trenches and Towers” in Vol. 19(1) focused on plea bargaining; we are planning some additional features in upcoming issues. We have also included a number of Articles Symposia in recent issues. The topics have ranged from “Do Lawyers Impair Economic Growth” and “Women, Law, and Violence” through more recent issues on “Law and Lustration: Righting the Wrongs of the Past” and on “Lawyering in Repressive States.” An upcoming issue will inaugurate another new feature, long in the planning stages, as we begin an occasional section of articles that contain critical reviews and theoretical exegeses of broad areas of law-and-society scholarship. We welcome your ideas and reactions; it is only in interaction with our readers that we develop and grow.

Elizabeth Mertz