

# EJRR

EUROPEAN  
JOURNAL OF  
RISK  
REGULATION

## FROM THE EDITOR'S DESK

The Birth of the European Journal of Risk Regulation

*Alberto Alemanno*

## ARTICLES

Foundations of Risk Regulation:

Science, Decision-Making, Policy Learning and Institutional Reform

*Giandomenico Majone*

If in Doubt, Leave it Out? EU Precaution in WTO Regulatory Space

*James Flett*

The Regulatory Challenge of Animal Cloning for Food –

The Risks of Risk Regulation in the European Union

*Maria Weimer*

What REACH can teach us about TSCA:

Retrospectives of America's Failed Toxics Statute

*James T. O'Reilly*

Nanomaterials under REACH: Legal Aspects

*Jean-Philippe Montfort, Giovanni Indirli, Daniela Georgieva and Claire-Marie Carrega*

## REPORTS

Biotechnology · Intellectual Property · Regulatory Impact Assessment ·  
Pharmaceuticals · Risk Communication

THE LEGAL PUBLISHER

**lexxion**

• BERLIN

# Contents

## FROM THE EDITOR'S DESK

- The Birth of the European Journal of Risk Regulation 1

## ARTICLES

- Foundations of Risk Regulation:  
Science, Decision-Making, Policy Learning and Institutional Reform 5  
*Giandomenico Majone*
- If in Doubt, Leave it Out?  
EU Precaution in WTO Regulatory Space 20  
*James Flett*
- The Regulatory Challenge of Animal Cloning for Food –  
The Risks of Risk Regulation in the European Union 31  
*Maria Weimer*
- What REACH can teach us about TSCA:  
Retrospectives of America's Failed Toxics Statute 40  
*James T. O'Reilly*
- Nanomaterials under REACH: Legal Aspects 51  
*Jean-Philippe Montfort, Giovanni Indirli, Daniela Georgieva and Claire-Marie Carrega*

## REPORTS

- Biotechnology 63  
*Justo Corti Varela*
- Intellectual Property 72  
*Enrico Bonadio*
- Regulatory Impact Assessment 76  
*Lorenzo Allio*
- Pharmaceuticals 81  
*Alessandro Spina*
- Risk Communication 83  
*Sweta Chakraborty*

## CASE NOTES

- Member States Have a Wide Margin of Appreciation When Drawing National Action Plans in Environmental Protection  
Case T-263/07 Republic of Estonia v. Commission  
Case T-183/07 Republic of Poland v. Commission 86  
*Vihar Georgiev*
- On How to Assess a Medicinal Product By Function 90  
Case C-27/08 BIOS Naturprodukte GmbH v. Saarland  
*Kai Purnhagen*

## BOOK REVIEWS

- Clapp/Fuchs: Corporate Power in Global Agrifood Governance 93  
*Adam Sneyd*
- Everson/Vos: Uncertain Risks Regulated 95  
*Peter Kugel and Anne Meuwese*
- Clapp/Cohen: The Global Food Crisis: Governance, Challenges and Opportunities 96  
*Matias E. Margulis*

## MISCELLANEOUS

- Masthead III
- Imprint V
- Upcoming Conferences and Events VII

## EDITOR

*Alberto Alemanno*  
HEC Paris, France  
alemanno@hec.fr

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

### Articles Submission

*Pascal Cardonnel*  
European Court of Justice, Luxembourg

*Peter Kugel*  
Attorney at law, Brussels, Belgium

### Book Reviews

*David J. Hornsby*  
University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg,  
South Africa

### Case Notes

*Kai Purnhagen LL.M.*  
European University Institute, Florence, Italy

### Reports

*Enrico Bonadio*  
University of Abertay, Dundee, Scotland,  
United Kingdom

## ADVISORY BOARD

*Carl Baudenbacher*  
University of St. Gallen, Switzerland  
President of the EFTA Court, Luxembourg

*Marco Bronckers*  
University of Leiden, Netherlands  
VVGB, Brussels, Belgium

*Theofanis Christoforou*  
European Commission Legal Service,  
Brussels, Belgium

*Miguel Maduro*  
European University Institute, San Domenico  
di Fiesole, Italy

*Giandomenico Majone*  
European University Institute, San Domenico  
di Fiesole, Italy

*José Esteve Pardo*  
University of Barcelona, Spain

*Jacques Pelkmans*  
College of Europe, Bruges, Belgium

*Michael D. Rogers*  
Independent Consultant on Risk, Ethics and Law,  
Tervuren, Belgium

*Giorgio Sacerdoti*  
Bocconi University, Milan, Italy  
Member of the WTO Appellate Body

*Nicolas de Sadeleer*  
University of Saint Louis, Brussels, Belgium

*Francis Snyder*  
University Paul Cézanne, Aix-Marseille III, France

*Denis Waelbroeck*  
Ashurst, Brussels, Belgium  
College of Europe, Bruges, Belgium

*Vern Walker*  
Hofstra University School of Law, Hempstead,  
New York

*Thomas Werlen*  
Novartis, Basel, Switzerland

**EDITORIAL BOARD***Lucas Bergkamp*

Hunton &amp; Williams, Brussels, Belgium

*Susana Borrás*

Copenhagen Business School, Frederiksberg, Denmark

*Morten Broberg*

University of Copenhagen, Denmark

*Dirk Detken*

European Food Safety Authority (EFSA), Parma, Italy

*Mary Footer*

University of Nottingham, United Kingdom

*Candido Garcia Molyneux*

Covington &amp; Burling, Brussels, Belgium

*Liana Giorgi*

The Interdisciplinary Centre for Comparative Research in the Social Sciences (ICCR), Vienna, Austria

*Minna Heikkilä*

European Chemical Agency (ECHA), Helsinki, Finland

*Sebastian Krapohl*

Otto-Friedrich-University, Bamberg, Germany

*Bettina Lange*

University of Oxford, United Kingdom

*Ragnar Lofstedt*

King's College London, United Kingdom

*Benn McGrady*

Georgetown University, Washington, United States

*Sara Poli*

University of Rome 'Tor Vergata', Italy

*Reinhard Quick*

VCI Liaison Office, Brussels, Belgium

*Claudio Radaelli*

Exeter University, United Kingdom

*Andrea Renda*Centre for European Policy Studies (CEPS), Brussels, Belgium  
LUISS Guido Carli University, Rome, Italy*Vincenzo Salvatore*

European Medicines Agency (EMA), London, United Kingdom

*Colin Scott*

University College Dublin, Ireland

*Stijn Smismans*

Cardiff University Law School, Wales

*Geert Van Calster*DLA Piper, Brussels, Belgium  
K. U. Leuven, Belgium*Ellen Vos*

Maastricht University, The Netherlands

*Jonathan Wiener*

Duke University School of Law, Durham, United Kingdom

**CORRESPONDENTS****Biotechnology***Justo Corti Varela*

Universidad CEU San Pablo, Madrid, Spain

*Shane Morris*

University College Cork, Ireland

*Maria Weimer*

European University Institute, Florence, Italy

**Intellectual Property***Enrico Bonadio*

University of Abertay, Dundee, Scotland, United Kingdom

**Regulatory Impact Assessment***Lorenzo Allio*

Independent Policy Analyst and Consultant, Morbio, Switzerland

*Anne Meuwese*

University of Antwerp, Belgium

*Jacopo Torriti*

University of Surrey, United Kingdom

**Pharmaceuticals***Alessandro Spina*

European Medicines Agency (EMA), London, United Kingdom

**Risk Communication***Sweta Chakraborty*

King's College London, United Kingdom

**WTO**

*Alessandra Arcuri*  
Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands

*Alexia Herwig*  
University of Antwerp, Belgium

**Nanotech**

*Mihail Kritikos*  
University of Exeter School of Law,  
United Kingdom  
European Commission, Brussels, Belgium

**Food**

*Barbara Klaus*  
meyer//meistererst, Milan, Italy

*Stéphanie Mahieu*  
European Court of Justice, Luxembourg

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

*Patricia Hellmuth*  
Lexxion Publisher, Berlin  
hellmuth@lexxion.de

*Publisher*

Lexxion Verlagsgesellschaft mbH  
Güntzelstraße 63 · 10717 Berlin · Germany  
Phone: +49 30/81 45 06-0 · Fax: +49 30/81 45 06-22  
www.lexxion.de

*Typeset*

G.K.W. Kuhle Werbung GmbH, Berlin

*Annual Subscription Price (4 issues)*

€ 348,- / US\$ 494,-; online edition only: € 315,- / US\$ 440,-  
Prices include Postage and Handling. EU Member States:  
VAT will be added if applicable. EJRR is supplied under our  
terms of sale and supply. Copies of our terms and conditions  
are available upon request.  
Lexxion Verlagsgesellschaft mbH. VAT Reg.No. DE 209981990.

*For further information please contact*

info@lexxion.de  
Tel.: +49 30/81 45 06-0 · Fax: +49 30/81 45 06-22

*Contributions*

are welcome and should be sent to the Editor at the above address. Any such contribution is accepted on the understanding that the author is responsible for the opinions expressed in it.

*Photocopying*

All rights reserved. No part of this journal may be reproduced in any form whatsoever, e.g. by photo print, microfilm, or any other means, without prior permission of the publisher. This journal was carefully produced in all its parts. Nevertheless, authors, editors and publishers do not warrant the information contained therein to be free of errors. Readers are advised to keep in mind that statements, data, illustrations, procedural details or other items may inadvertently be inaccurate.

This journal may be cited as [2010] EJRR.

Ownership and shareholdings pursuant to Section 7 lit. a No. 2 and Section 2 No. 6 of the Berlin Press Act: Shareholder of Lexxion Verlagsgesellschaft mbH is Dr. Wolfgang Andreae, Publisher, Berlin.

ISSN 18 67-299X