

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

MacIntyre, Aquinas, and Politics
Thomas S. Hibbs

A Question for Richard Rorty
Christopher M. Duncan

On Voegelin's Calvin
William R. Stevenson, Jr.

Toward a Hayekian Theory of Commodification
and Systemic Contradiction
Gus diZerega

Edmund Randolph and Virginia
Constitutionalism
Kevin R. C. Gutzman

Review Essay: Literature and Nationalism
Catherine Frost

Book reviewers include—

F. J. Crosson on Thomas Pangle
David Thunder on Charles Taylor
Lawrence Cunningham on Hans Küng
David Weber on Leon Kass
David Schaefer on Ann Hartle

Summer, 2004

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor

WALTER NICGORSKI

Managing Editor

DENNIS WM MORAN

Book Review Editor

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

Assistant Book Review Editor

Geoff Bowden

Editorial Intern: Tim Dale

Associate Editors

Fred R. Dallmayr
Philip Gleason

E. A. Goerner
Alasdair MacIntyre

Thomas Werge
Catherine Zuckert

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian

M. A. Fitzsimons
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson
Donald P. Kommers

Editorial Advisory Board

Henry J. Abraham
University of Virginia
Charles W. Anderson
University of Wisconsin–Madison
Shlomo Avineri
Hebrew University of Jerusalem
Jean Bethke Elshtain
University of Chicago
James T. Kloppenberg
Harvard University
Arend Lijphart
*University of
California–San Diego*
Harvey C. Mansfield
Harvard University
Wilson Carey McWilliams
Rutgers University

Mary Nichols
Fordham University
Doris Marie Provine
Arizona State University
Bruce M. Russett
Yale University
Arlene Saxonhouse
University of Michigan
Steven B. Smith
Yale University
Kenneth W. Thompson
University of Virginia
Glenn Tinder
*University of Massachusetts–
Boston*
Jean M. Yarbrough
Bowdoin College

Administrative Assistant: Nancy Benjamin

Production Managers: Erin Horvath, Jonathan T. Morgan, and
Katherine J. Mounts

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to politics.

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

Vol. 66

Summer 2004

No. 3

Thomas S. Hibbs

MacIntyre, Aquinas, and Politics 357

Christopher M. Duncan

A Question for Richard Rorty 385

William R. Stevenson, Jr.

An Agnostic View of Voegelin's Gnostic Calvin 415

Gus diZerega

Toward a Hayekian Theory of Commodification
and Systemic Contradiction: Citizens,
Consumers, and the Media 445

Kevin R. C. Gutzman

Edmund Randolph and Virginia Constitutionalism . . . 469

Review Essay

Catherine Frost: Literature, Nationalism, and the
Challenge of Representation 499

Reviews:

Russell Arben Fox: UNDERSTANDING HERDER
Review of F.M. Barnard's *Herder on Nationality, Humanity
and History* 513

Ronald Schmidt, Sr.: OPEN ENGAGEMENT
Review of John Francis Burke's *Mestizo Democracy:
The Politics of Crossing Borders* 516

David Thunder: THE FLATTENING OF TIME
Review of Charles Taylor's *Modern Social Imaginaries* 519

Andrew R. Murphy: BEYOND THE SELF
Review of Ingrid Creppell's *Toleration and Identity:
Foundations in Early Modern Thought* 521

David Lewis Schaefer: NO ACCIDENT
Review of Ann Hartle's *Michel de Montaigne:
Accidental Philosopher* 523

Matthew J. Franck: JUDICIALIZED POLITICS
Review of Paul O. Carrese's *The Cloaking of Power:
Montesquieu, Blackstone, and the Rise of Judicial Activism*. . . . 526

Steven Alan Samson: LIBERALISM AND FOREIGN POLICY
Review of David Clinton's *Tocqueville, Lieber, and Bagehot:
Liberalism Confronts the World* 529

Robert S. Snyder: THE TIMES THEY WERE A-CHANGING	
Review of Jeremi Suri's <i>Power and Protest: Global Revolution and the Rise of Detente</i>	531
William L. McBride: MARXIAN FIVE-STEP	
Review of Bertell Ollman's <i>Dance of the Dialectic: Steps in Marx's Method</i>	533
David K. Weber: BRAVE NEW WORLD	
Review of Leon R. Kass's <i>Life, Liberty, and the Defense of Dignity: The Challenge for Bioethics</i>	535
F. J. Crosson: REVELATION AND PHILOSOPHY	
Review of Thomas L. Pangle's <i>Political Philosophy and the God of Abraham</i>	538
Lawrence S. Cunningham: THE THEOLOGIAN'S I	
Review of Hans Küng's <i>My Struggle for Freedom: Memoirs</i>	540
William A. Barbieri, Jr.: THE MORALITY OF KILLING	
Review of E. Christian Brugger's <i>Capital Punishment and Roman Catholic Moral Tradition</i>	542
Alvin Bernard Tillery, Jr.: SEPARATE AND UNEQUAL	
Review of Linda Faye Williams's <i>The Constraint of Race: Legacies of White Skin Privilege in America</i>	544
Paul A. Roth: NO SAVING GRACE	
Review of F.G. Bailey's <i>The Saving Lie: Truth and Method in the Social Sciences</i>	546

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE

THOMAS S. HIBBS is Distinguished Professor of Ethics and Culture and Dean of the Honors College in Baylor University. **CHRISTOPHER M. DUNCAN** is Professor and Chair of the Department of Political Science in the University of Dayton. **WILLIAM R. STEVENSON, JR.**, is Professor of Political Science in Calvin College; he is the author of *Sovereign Grace: The Place and Significance of Christian Freedom in John Calvin's Political Thought* (1999). **GUS DIZEREGA** is Visiting Assistant Professor of Government in St. Lawrence University, Clinton, New York. **KEVIN R. C. GUTZMAN** is Assistant Professor of History in Western Connecticut State University. **CATHERINE FROST** is Assistant Professor of Political Science and Communications Studies in McMaster University, Ontario.

RUSSELL ARBEN FOX is Visiting Assistant Professor of Political Science in Arkansas State University. **RONALD SCHMIDT, SR.**, is Professor and Graduate Coordinator of the Department of Political Science in the California State University, Long Beach. **DAVID THUNDER** is a doctoral candidate in the Department of Political Science in the University of Notre Dame. **ANDREW R. MURPHY** is Assistant Professor of Humanities and Political Philosophy in Christ College, Valparaiso University. **DAVID LEWIS SCHAEFER** is Professor of Political Science in College of the Holy Cross. **MATTHEW J. FRANCK** is Chair of the Department of Political Science at Radford University in Virginia. **STEVEN ALAN SAMSON** is Professor of Government in Liberty University. **ROBERT S. SNYDER** is Associate Professor and Chair of the Political Science Department in Southwestern University. **WILLIAM L. MCBRIDE** is the Arthur G. Hansen Distinguished Professor of Philosophy in Purdue University. **DAVID K. WEBER** is a member of the faculty of theology in Valparaiso University. **F. J. CROSSON**, former Editor of *The Review of Politics*, is Cavanaugh Professor Emeritus of the

Humanities in the University of Notre Dame. **LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM** is Professor of Theology in the University of Notre Dame. **WILLIAM A. BARBIERI, JR.**, is Associate Professor, Theology and Religious Studies in The Catholic University of America. **ALVIN BERNARD TILLERY, JR.**, is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Notre Dame. **PAUL A. ROTH** is Professor of Philosophy in the University of Missouri, St. Louis.

INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in **DUPLICATE** with an accompanying computer disk of text to Professor Walter Nicgorski, Editor, *The Review of Politics*, 412 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 8,000–11,000 words. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an **ABSTRACT** of 100–150 words. We assume, in accordance with APSA policies, that you have not submitted your essay to another journal. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Professor Peter R. Moody, Jr. at the above address.

The articles in **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts, and abstracted and indexed in **ABC POL. SCI., HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS, SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX** (also available in the electronic versions), **BOOK REVIEW INDEX, INTERNATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES.**

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly for \$25.00 per year in the United States (institutional \$56.00); foreign individual, \$32.00 (institutional, \$59.00); single copies, \$14.00 (domestic) and \$15.50 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Periodicals postage paid at Notre Dame, IN and Nappanee, IN. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS**, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Visa and MasterCard accepted.

Abstracts, subscription, advertising and submission information can also be found on our World Wide Web Homepage at <http://www.nd.edu/~rop>.