

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 4 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1979

Medical Paternalism and the Rule of Law: A Reply to Dr. Relman

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.

Reconciling *Quinlan* and *Saikewicz*: Decision Making for the Terminally Ill Incompetent

George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H.

***Genetics, Law, and Social Policy*, by Philip Reilly**

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

For Health Lawyers, Things Never Looked So Good

David M. Kinzer, President, Massachusetts Hospital Association

Editor's Response to Kinzer

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

Report on the National Health Lawyers Association

Jordan Braverman, M.P.H.

Selected Recent Court Decisions

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Highlights of Federal Legislative and Executive Action

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Selected Book Releases, Annotated

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.

Selected Articles from Various Journals

Jim McMahan, J.D.

Protecting the Rights of the Developmentally Disabled: Alternatives to the Existing Statutory and Regulatory Scheme

Lawrence L. Athan, Jr.

Published by the MIT Press for the American Society of Law & Medicine

Editorial support provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE was founded in response to the need for a scholarly yet pragmatic publication encompassing all aspects of medico-legal relations. The JOURNAL seeks to provide a broad perspective on our complex health care system, to encourage interdisciplinary communication, and to stimulate creative solutions to the pressing medicolegal problems of our time.

In addition to serving as a forum for analyses and proposals in such areas as health law and policy, legal and insurance medicine, and bioethics, the JOURNAL offers a wide variety of pertinent reference materials in these and related areas.

The JOURNAL serves persons from a variety of fields who seek to understand and influence medicolegal developments: physicians, other health care providers, and health administrators; lawyers; health analysts and planners; researchers and educators in health specialties; judges, legislators, and government administrators; insurance officials; consumer advocates; and concerned members of the general public.

The JOURNAL is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter for the American Society of Law & Medicine by the MIT Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, and London, England. Beginning with Volume 5, it will be published by the American Society of Law & Medicine. Editorial support is provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the Editor-in-Chief on behalf of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the publishers, the Society, or the law schools.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine, 454 Brookline Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 969-0100, ext. 4394.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, and claims for missing copies, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 454 Brookline Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 734-8316.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$60.00 for 1979). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 454 Brookline Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 734-8316.

Copyright © 1979 by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. All or any part of materials appearing in the JOURNAL may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Contents of Current Legal Periodicals*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts in accordance with Permit No. 54518 (Nonprofit Org.).

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 4 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1979

BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.
Boston College Law School

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Harvard Medical School
Boston College Law School

MANAGING EDITOR

Jim McMahon, J.D.

ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR

Judy Lesser, J.D.

Mark D. Altschule, M.D.
Harvard University

Donald B. Barkan, M.D., F.A.C.P.
Health Director, Lynn Hospital School
of Nursing

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Patrick Carroll, J.D.
Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,
Massachusetts Hospital Ass'n

Roger C. Cramton, J.D.
Dean, Cornell Law School

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
General Counsel, Northwestern
Memorial Hospital

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Harvard Medical School

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
General Counsel, Am. Med. Ass'n

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Dean, Boston College Law School

Alan K. Kaplan, LL.B., M. Sci.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Georgetown Univ. Medical School

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch.,
M.R.C.P., D.C.H.**
Harvard Medical School; Director,
Genetics Division, Shriver Center

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
Rutgers Medical School, College of
Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law

Honorable Max Rosenn
United States Court of Appeals

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
Dean, New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.
Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Dean, Tufts Univ. School of
Dental Med.; Past Pres., ADA

Richard E. Speidel, J.D., LL.M.
Dean, Boston University School of Law

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Inst. of Legal
Med.; Coroner, Allegheny County

RESEARCH ASSOCIATES

Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANTS

Beverly Denise Clifton
Cecily Anne Wells

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

PRESIDENT

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Boston College Law School
Harvard Medical School

FIRST VICE-PRESIDENT

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney and Consultant in Health Law, Boston, Massachusetts
Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine

VICE-PRESIDENT

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School
President, American College of Legal Medicine

SECRETARY

Michael D. Jusell
Senior Claims Supervisor
Employers Insurance of Wausau

TREASURER

Barry C. Reed, LL.B.
Trial Attorney

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.
Managing Editor, Medicolegal News

HONORARY SECRETARY-TREASURER

J. Robertson Knowles, M.D.
Former Secretary-Treasurer, Massachusetts Society of Examining Physicians

GENERAL COUNSEL

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 4 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1979

ARTICLES

- Medical Paternalism and the Rule of Law: A Reply to Dr. Relman 337 Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
- Reconciling *Quinlan* and *Saikewicz*: Decision Making for the Terminally Ill Incompetent 367 George J. Annas, J.D., M.P.H.

BOOK REVIEW

- Genetics, Law, and Social Policy*, by Philip Reilly 397 Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

CORRESPONDENCE

- For Health Lawyers, Things Never Looked So Good 403 David M. Kinzer, President, Massachusetts Hospital Association
- Editor's Response to Kinzer 407 John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

GUEST ORGANIZATION

- Report on the National Health Lawyers Association 413 Jordan Braverman, M.P.H.

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- Selected Recent Court Decisions 419 John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.
Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
- Highlights of Federal Legislative and Executive Action 433
- Selected Book Releases, Annotated 439 Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
- Selected Articles from Various Journals 453 Jim McMahan, J.D.

NOTE

- Protecting the Rights of the Developmentally Disabled: Alternatives to the Existing Statutory and Regulatory Scheme 461 Lawrence L. Athan, Jr.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 4 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1979

STUDENT BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Lois D. Friedman
Boston University School of Law

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Richard M. Sandman
Boston College Law School

MANAGING EDITORS

Kathleen Anne Ford
Boston University School of Law

Marilyn D. Stempler
Boston College Law School

TOPICS EDITORS

Mark E. Cohen
Boston University School of Law

Norah Wylie
Boston College Law School

ARTICLES EDITORS

William J. Brown
Boston College Law School

Larry P. Rothman
Boston University School of Law

CASE and NOTE EDITORS

Robert B. Luce
Boston University School of Law

Peter McNulty
Boston College Law School

Sue Ellen Schmutter
Boston University School of Law

Lawrence L. Athan, Jr.
Boston University School of Law

STUDENT STAFF

BOSTON COLLEGE LAW SCHOOL

Diane Breslin
Carol Booth
Peter D. Goldstein
Regina M. Hopkins
Matthew S. Kozol
William A. Lowell
Robert Mendillo
Madeline S. Mirabito
Mary M. Rudser
Stephen Westheimer
Bette A. Winik

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL of LAW

Joanne Acford
Scott E. Cooper
Emily Jane Donovan
Ellen P. Epps
Eve T. Horwitz
Nancy Elizabeth Jones
Laurie A. Kamaiko
Joanne G. Petrie
Shari B. Rubin
Elizabeth D. Schrero
David S. Szabo
Genise W. Teich

FACULTY ADVISORS

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law