

# Radiocarbon

An International Journal of Cosmogenic Isotope Research

VOLUME 45 / NUMBER 2 / 2003



The **THIRD INTERNATIONAL  
RADIOCARBON INTERCOMPARISON (TIRI)**

and

The **FOURTH INTERNATIONAL  
RADIOCARBON INTERCOMPARISON (FIRI)**

1990–2002

**Results, Analyses, and Conclusions**

**Guest Editor**  
E MARIAN SCOTT

**Editor**  
A J T JULL

**Associate Editors**  
J WARREN BECK  
GEORGE S BURR

**Managing Editor**  
MARK E McCLURE

**Assistant Editor**  
ROY A RAMOS

**Business Manager**  
AGNIESZKA P BAIER

Department of Geosciences  
The University of Arizona  
4717 East Fort Lowell Road  
Tucson, Arizona 85712-1201 USA

ISSN: 0033-8222

## **RADIOCARBON**

An International Journal of Cosmogenic Isotope Research

*Editor:* A J T JULI

*Associate Editors:* J WARREN BECK and GEORGE S BURR

*Managing Editor:* MARK E MCCLURE

*Assistant Editor:* ROY A RAMOS

*Business Manager:* AGNIESZKA P BAIER

*Subscriptions and Sales Manager:* KRISTA M LINDSAY

Published by

Department of Geosciences

The University of Arizona

Published three times a year at The University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85712-1201 USA.

© 2003 by the Arizona Board of Regents on behalf of the University of Arizona. All rights reserved.

*Subscription rate* (2003): \$190.00 (institutions), \$90.00 (individuals). Foreign postage is extra. A complete price list, including proceedings of international conferences, special publications and back issues, appears on the inside back cover of this issue. *Advertising rates* available upon request, or see [www.radiocarbon.org/adrates.html](http://www.radiocarbon.org/adrates.html).

*Missing issues* will be replaced without charge only if claim is made within three months (six months for India, New Zealand, and Australia) after the publication date. Claims for missing issues will not be honored if non-delivery results from failure by the subscriber to notify the Journal of an address change.

*Authors:* See our "Information for Authors" document at [www.radiocarbon.org/Authors/](http://www.radiocarbon.org/Authors/) for guidelines on manuscript submission and format. All correspondence and manuscripts should be addressed to the Managing Editor, *RADIOCARBON*, Department of Geosciences, The University of Arizona, 4717 East Fort Lowell Road, Tucson, AZ 85712-1201 USA. Tel.: +1 520 881-0857; Fax: +1 520 881-0554; Email: [editor@radiocarbon.org](mailto:editor@radiocarbon.org).

*List of laboratories.* Our comprehensive list of laboratories is published annually, and is also available at [www.radiocarbon.org/Info/lablist.html](http://www.radiocarbon.org/Info/lablist.html). We ask all laboratory directors to provide their laboratory code designation, as well as current telephone and fax numbers, and email addresses. Changes in names or addresses, additions or deletions should be reported to the managing editor. Conventional and AMS laboratories are arranged in alphabetical order by country, and we include laboratories listed by code designation.

*RADIOCARBON* on the World Wide Web: <http://www.radiocarbon.org/>

*RADIOCARBON* is indexed and/or abstracted by the following sources: *Anthropological Index; Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts; Bibliography and Index of Geology (GeoRef); British Archaeological Bibliography; Chemical Abstracts; Chemistry Citation Index; Current Advances in Ecological and Environmental Sciences; Current Contents (ISI); FRANCIS (Institut de l'Information Scientifique et Technique – CNRS); Geographical Abstracts; Geological Abstracts; Oceanographic Literature Review; Science Citation Index; Social Sciences Citation Index.*

**CONTENTS**

<b>EDITORIAL BOARD</b> .....	v
<b>FROM THE GUEST EDITOR</b> .....	vii
<b>OBITUARY</b>	
Malcolm John Head	
<i>Weijian Zhou</i> .....	xi
<b>SECTION 1: THE FOURTH INTERNATIONAL RADIOCARBON INTERCOMPARISON (FIRI)</b>	135
1.1 Introduction and background to the FIRI project	
1.2 General outline of the special issue	
1.3 The principles implicit in the design and organization of a laboratory intercomparison	
1.4 The planned laboratory intercomparison (FIRI)	
1.5 Homogeneity testing	
1.6 Final sample list	
1.7 Additional investigations	
<b>SECTION 2: THE RESULTS</b> .....	151
2.1 Distribution of samples	
2.2 The basic laboratory demographics	
2.3 Modern standard and background material	
2.4 How busy are the laboratories?	
2.5 Conclusions	
<b>SECTION 3: PRELIMINARY ANALYSIS OF THE RESULTS</b> .....	159
3.1 Introduction	
3.2 FIRI Sample C: turbidite	
3.3 FIRI Sample D: Belfast dendro-dated pine	
3.4 FIRI Sample F: Belfast dendro-dated pine	
3.5 FIRI Sample E: humic acid	
3.6 FIRI Sample G: barley mash	
3.7 FIRI Sample J: barley mash	
3.8 FIRI Sample H: Hohenheim dendro-dated oak	
3.9 FIRI Sample I: Belfast cellulose	
3.10 Conclusions from the preliminary distribution of results	
3.11 Summary of the distribution of quoted errors	
3.12 Summary of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$	
3.13 Outliers or extreme values	

<b>SECTION 4: INVESTIGATION OF POTENTIAL SOURCES OF VARIATION . . . . .</b>	<b>175</b>
4.1 Introduction	
4.2 Laboratory type as a source of variation	
4.3 Modern standard and background material as sources of variation	
4.4 Summary findings of background and standard material effects	
4.5 Pretreatment as a factor in explaining the variation	
<b>SECTION 5: MEASURES OF PRECISION AND REPRODUCIBILITY . . . . .</b>	<b>213</b>
5.1 Duplicates	
5.2 Samples A and B	
5.3 Samples D and F	
5.4 Samples G and J	
5.5 Quoted errors	
5.6 Reproducibility results	
5.7 Conclusions	
<b>SECTION 6: KAURI WOOD, SAMPLES A AND B . . . . .</b>	<b>227</b>
6.1 Introduction	
6.2 Preliminary results	
6.3 Conclusions based on the preliminary analysis	
6.4 Analysis of activity, A and B separately	
6.5 Analysis of activity: sources of variation	
6.6 Analysis of age, Kauri A	
6.7 Analysis of age, Kauri B	
6.8 Analysis of age, combined results	
6.9 Conclusions	
<b>SECTION 7: CHARACTERIZATION OF THE REFERENCE MATERIALS BY CONSENSUS VALUES . . . . .</b>	<b>249</b>
7.1 Calculation of consensus values	
7.2 Initial consensus values	
7.3 The effect of screening out results with large quoted errors in consensus calculations	
7.4 Deviations from consensus values	
7.5 Evaluation of laboratory accuracy	
7.6 Conclusions	
<b>SECTION 8: OPTIONAL FURTHER STUDIES . . . . .</b>	<b>277</b>
8.1 Introduction	
8.2 The effect of sample size	
8.3 The effect of quoted error and sample size	
8.4 Conclusions	

<b>SECTION 9: OPTIONAL SAMPLES</b> .....	283
9.1 Introduction	
9.2 Sample description	
<b>SECTION 10: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	285
10.1 How comparable are the laboratories?	
10.2 How varied are the results and what factors explain the variation?	
10.3 Can we identify any reasons for the variation in results?	
10.4 Accuracy and precision issues	
10.5 Further intercomparisons	
10.6 Future proposals	
<b>PART 2: THIRD INTERNATIONAL RADIOCARBON INTERCOMPARISON (TIRI)</b> .....	293
TIRI: a brief description of study and samples	
The analysis	
Conclusions	
The original results	
<b>APPENDICES</b> .....	329
Appendix 1: Results for all samples (FIRI)	
<i>Tables</i>	
<i>Figures</i>	
Appendix 2: Results for optional samples (FIRI)	
Appendix 3: Statistical methods (FIRI)	
Appendix 4: Results for all samples (TIRI)	