

European Constitutional Law Review

2019 VOLUME 15 ISSUE 1

Contributions by

Mattias Wendel, Renata Uitz, Stijn Smet, Joost Sillen, Edoardo Celeste, Pablo Castillo
Ortiz, Teresa Cabrita, Dana Burchardt

Subjects

RULE OF LAW: Dialogue and the crises; Illiberal attacks to constitutional courts. EUROPEAN UNION: Mutual trust and federalism; Relationships between national and EU law; Constitutional foreign policy objectives. COURT OF JUSTICE: The data retention saga. EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: Judicial independence; Religion and free speech.



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

EuConst
2019/I

BOARD OF EDITORS

Leonard F.M. Besselink, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

Monica Claes, co-editor-in-chief
Maastricht University

Jan-Herman Reestman, co-editor-in-chief
University of Amsterdam

W.T. Eijssbouts
University of Amsterdam

John W. Sap
Open Universiteit and VU Amsterdam

Thomas Beukers
European University Institute, Florence

Jan Komárek
University of Copenhagen

Gerhard van der Schyff
University of Tilburg

Mattias Wendel
University of Bielefeld

Aida Torres Pérez
Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona

François-Xavier Millet
Court of Justice of the European Union

Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme
University of Amsterdam

Bastian Michel, managing editor
University of Amsterdam

Matteo Bonelli, managing editor (a.i.)
University of Milan

Andrew Faughman, language editor
Amsterdam

Special language advisers
Jeremy B. Bierbach
Amsterdam

Russell E.M. Lawson
Oxford

BOARD OF ADVISERS

Andreas Auer
Professor emeritus of public law, Universities of
Zurich and Geneva

Marta Cartabia
Vice-president of the Italian Constitutional Court
and Professor of constitutional law, Università
Milano-Bicocca

Paul Craig
Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca
Professor of law, New York University School of Law

Bruno De Witte
Professor of European Union law, Maastricht
University, and part-time professor, European
University Institute, Florence

Olivier Duhamel
University Professor, IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis
Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerkrath
Professor of European law, University of
Luxembourg

P.J.G. Kapteyn
Former judge at the Court of Justice

Rick Lawson
Professor of European law, Leiden University

Koen Lenaerts
President of the Court of Justice and Professor of
European law, KU Leuven

Ingolf Pernice
Professor of public law and of international and
European law, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin

Jit Peters
Professor emeritus of public law, University of
Amsterdam

Lucas Prakke
Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional
law, University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal
Judge at the Court of Justice and Professor of
international and European institutional law,
Utrecht University

W.H. Roobol
Professor emeritus of European history, University
of Amsterdam

Dominique Rousseau
Professor of public law, Université Paris I
Panthéon-Sorbonne

Wojciech Sadurski
Professor in jurisprudence, University of Sydney and
professor extraordinary, University of Warsaw

András Sajó
University Professor, Central European University,
Budapest

Mirosław Wyrzykowski
Professor of constitutional law, University of
Warsaw

Peter G. Xuereb
Professor of European and comparative law,
University of Malta

Jiří Zemánek
Judge at the Czech Constitutional Court and
Professor of European Union law, Charles
University, Prague

EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2019 VOLUME 15 ISSUE 1

CONTENTS

Guest Editorial

Renáta URTZ – The Perils of Defending the Rule of Law Through Dialogue – 1

Articles

Mattias WENDEL – Mutual Trust, Essence and Federalism – Between Consolidating and Fragmenting the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice after *LM* – 17

Pablo CASTILLO-ORTIZ – The Illiberal Abuse of Constitutional Courts in Europe – 48

Dana BURCHARDT – The relationship between the law of the European Union and the law of its Member States - a norm-based conceptual framework – 73

Joost SILLEN – The concept of ‘internal judicial independence’ in the case law of the European Court of Human Rights – 104

Edoardo CELESTE – The Court of Justice and the Ban on Bulk Data Retention: Expansive Potential and Future Scenarios – 134

Case Note

Stijn SMET – Free Speech versus Religious Feelings, the Sequel: Defamation of the Prophet Muhammad in *E.S. v Austria* – 158

Book Review

Teresa CABRITA – Understanding the EU-led ‘pandemic’ of constitutional foreign policy objectives – 171

Retraction Notice

Machiel VAN BRUGGEN – Democratic rights protection: the case for weak judicial review implicit in the democratic critique of judicial review – RETRACTED – 181

Online Only

Machiel VAN BRUGGEN – Democratic rights protection: the case for weak judicial review implicit in the democratic critique of judicial review – RETRACTED

EDITORIAL POLICY & GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The journal is edited in the Hogendorp Centre for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is based in the University of Amsterdam. Published four times a year. In the tradition of the Hogendorp Centre, the *European Constitutional Law Review* (EuConst) follows the classical approach of constitutionalism, to discuss EU law's developments as well as comparative public law of the member states, political and constitutional theory and history. The journal is a platform for scholarly discussion of European constitutional events and evolution. It is open to contributions in this field from any country in the world and from any discipline. These contributions should satisfy as to substance, apart from the common scholarly criteria, two specific conditions, to a) have a distinctly European relevance and b) include a reference to and discussion of legal aspects involved.

Submitting an article, case note or book review

The editors of the *European Constitutional Law Review* are happy to receive contributions on relevant subjects at any time. Before submitting, authors should ensure that their contribution falls within the scope of EuConst as stated above.

Articles, case notes and book reviews can be sent by email to euconst@uva.nl. Manuscripts should be attached in Microsoft Word format (and not, specifically, in PDF format) to enable editing, anonymisation and comments. EuConst has an exclusive submission policy. Authors are required to state clearly, when submitting, that their contribution is not under consideration elsewhere.

Authors of article contributions are asked to aim for a length of no more than 10,000 words (including footnotes). Case notes and book reviews should not exceed 5,000 words. Upon request, the editors will consider whether relaxation of these limits is justified.

All submissions must be written in good English. Authors who are uncertain whether their English is of sufficient quality, should have their manuscript reviewed and edited by a native speaker with a background in law.

Copyright, licence to publish and open access policy

Contributors retain copyright. By submitting to EuConst, authors agree that upon acceptance of their contribution they will grant an exclusive licence to publish by signing and returning the appropriate Licence Form. Authors can make their contributions available through academic repositories. For more information, including terms and conditions of publication and authors' rights of reuse, see journals.cambridge.org/EuConst_CTF.

Revisions and house style

Accepted contributions will be edited, linguistically and substantively, subject to authors' approval. Authors should ensure that their submissions conform to the house style. A style sheet is available on the journal website, journals.cambridge.org/euconst.



The G.K. VAN HOGENDORP CENTRE FOR EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL STUDIES, short: HOGENDORP CENTRE, is a Jean Monnet centre of excellence at the University of Amsterdam. Founded in 1996, it promotes research and course development in the field of European Constitutional Studies, bringing together the disciplines of constitutional (including comparative) law, history, political theory. Gijsbert Karel van Hogendorp, 1762-1834, is the *auctor intellectualis* of the Dutch Kingdom's first constitution, of 1814.