



THE JOURNAL  
OF THE GILDED  
AGE AND  
PROGRESSIVE ERA

# THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

Volume 17 • Number 1 • January 2018

<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537781417000482> Published online by Cambridge University Press

## CONTRIBUTORS

## EDITORS' NOTE

## SHGAPE ANNOUNCES NEW JOURNAL EDITORS

## PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

World War I and the Paradox of Wilsonianism  
*Lloyd E. Ambrosius*

## FORUM

A Shadow on the Past: Teaching and Studying Migration and Borders in the Age of Trump  
*Hasia Diner, Sonia Hernández, Benjamin H. Johnson, Julian Lim, Maddalena Marinari, and Elliott Young*

## ARTICLES

Commercializing the Sacred Office: Sexual Revolution and the Scandal of the Modern Marrying Parson, 1895–1930  
*Paul Emory Putz*

"Business Sense if Not Souls": Boosters and Religion in Colorado Springs, 1871–1909  
*Gregory Atkins*

Forty Acres and a Carabao: T. Thomas Fortune, Newspapers, and the Pacific's Unstable Color Lines, 1902–03  
*Brian Shott*

Newcomb College Pottery, Arts and Crafts, and the New South  
*Meghan Freeman*

Industry, Improvement, and Intellectual Disability: Finding the Hopes and Fears of Parents and Superintendents at the Pennsylvania Training School  
*Brent Ruswick and Elliott W. Simon*

## BOOK ROUNDTABLE

Torrie Hester and the Histories of Deportation  
*Emily Pope-Obeda, Hidetaka Hirota, Aviva Chomsky, Rachel Ida Buff, Grace Peña Delgado, and Torrie Hester*

## BOOK REVIEWS

Published by the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era  
[www.jgape.org](http://www.jgape.org)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Additional sponsors: Illinois State University, the University of Illinois at Chicago,  
Loyola University Chicago, and Kent State University

**Editors:** Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago  
Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois at Chicago  
Boyd Cothran, York University  
C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa, George Mason University  
**Book Review Editor:** Elaine Frantz Parsons, Kent State University  
**Book Review Editor's Assistant:** Michele Curran Cornell, Kent State University  
**Editorial Assistant:** Timothy Herbert, University of Illinois at Chicago  
**Online Editor:** Christopher McKnight Nichols, Oregon State University  
**Founding Editor, 2000–2003:** Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University  
**Editor, 2004–2014:** Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University

#### Editorial Board

Cara Caddoo Indiana University	Michael Lansing Augsburg University
Christopher Cantwell University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee	Beth Lew-Williams Princeton University
Rosanne Currarino Queen's University	Rebecca Tinio McKenna University of Notre Dame
Greg Downs University of California–Davis	Michele Mitchell New York University
Cristina Groeger Lake Forest College	Kevin Murphy University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
LaShawn Harris Michigan State University	Julia Ott The New School
Sonia Hernandez Texas A & M University	K. Stephen Prince University of South Florida
Doug Kiel Northwestern University	Daniel Wortel-London New York University

Hal Moore, *ex officio*  
Cambridge University Press

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *America: History and Life*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Scopus*, and in the Thompson Reuters *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, and *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, [www.jstor.org](http://www.jstor.org), with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact [alwood@ilstu.edu](mailto:alwood@ilstu.edu) or go to <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 17, 2018, are \$198.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £129.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$155.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £97.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$45.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$45.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is £/\$18 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$500.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Single part: \$57.00 in the U.S. A., Mexico, and Canada and £37.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: [psc@periodicals.com](mailto:psc@periodicals.com)

Manuscripts should be submitted electronically in MS Word or RTF format to the co-editor, Robert D. Johnston, at [jgape@uic.edu](mailto:jgape@uic.edu). Before submitting any manuscript, please consult <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained via email at [jgape@uic.edu](mailto:jgape@uic.edu).

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2018. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com), email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested. *Postmaster:* Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Dept., One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006. Send address changes elsewhere to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K.

## CONTENTS

<b>CONTRIBUTORS</b>	v
<b>EDITORS' NOTE</b>	1
<b>SHGAPE ANNOUNCES NEW JOURNAL EDITORS</b>	
KRISTIN HOGANSON	3
<b>PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS</b>	
LLOYD E. AMBROSIUS World War I and the Paradox of Wilsonianism	5
<b>FORUM</b>	
HASIA DINER, SONIA HERNÁNDEZ, BENJAMIN H. JOHNSON, JULIAN LIM, MADDALENA MARINARI, AND ELLIOTT YOUNG A Shadow on the Past: Teaching and Studying Migration and Borders in the Age of Trump	23
<b>ARTICLES</b>	
PAUL EMORY PUTZ Commercializing the Sacred Office: Sexual Revolution and the Scandal of the Modern Marrying Parson, 1895–1930	56
GREGORY ATKINS “Business Sense if Not Souls”: Boosters and Religion in Colorado Springs, 1871–1909	77
BRIAN SHOTT Forty Acres and a Carabao: T. Thomas Fortune, Newspapers, and the Pacific’s Unstable Color Lines, 1902–03	98
MEGHAN FREEMAN Newcomb College Pottery, Arts and Crafts, and the New South	121
BRENT RUSWICK AND ELLIOTT W. SIMON Industry, Improvement, and Intellectual Disability: Finding the Hopes and Fears of Parents and Superintendents at the Pennsylvania Training School	145
<b>BOOK ROUNDTABLE</b>	
Torrie Hester and the Histories of Deportation (Emily Pope-Obeda, Hidetaka Hirota, Aviva Chomsky, Rachel Ida Buff, Grace Peña Delgado, and Torrie Hester)	170

**On the cover:** Charles Savidge was one of the most prominent “Marrying Parsons” in the early twentieth century. As Paul Emory Putz explains in his article “Commercializing the Sacred Office,” the controversies over ministers willing to perform on-demand marriages reflected the limited ability of Protestant leaders to police the commercial use of religious privilege. Credit: Charles Savidge, *Have Faith in God: Autobiography of Rev. Charles W. Savidge, by Himself*, 90 (Omaha: The Beacon Press, 1914). Image scanned by the Nebraska State Historical Society.

## REVIEWS

- MATTHEW HARPER *The End of Days: African American Religion and Politics in the Age of Emancipation*  
(Charles F. Irons) 199
- BRITNEY C. COOPER *Beyond Respectability: The Intellectual Thought of Race Women*  
(Allison M. Parker) 200
- HILARY GREEN *Educational Reconstruction: African American Schools in the Urban South, 1865–1890*  
(Michael Hines) 202
- ANDREA L. TURPIN *A New Moral Vision: Gender, Religion, and the Changing Purposes of American Higher Education, 1837–1917*  
(Jeanne Petit) 204
- WILLIAM THOMAS OKIE *The Georgia Peach: Culture, Agriculture, and Environment in the American South*  
(Karen Senaga) 206
- RICHARD WHITE *The Republic for Which It Stands: The United States during Reconstruction and the Gilded Age, 1865–1896*  
(Scott Reynolds Nelson) 208
- MIKAËLA M. ADAMS *Who Belongs?: Race, Resources, and Tribal Citizenship in the Native South*  
(Rose Stremmlau) 209
- THOMAS W. SIMPSON *American Universities and the Birth of Modern Mormonism, 1867–1940*  
(John-Charles Duffy) 211
- MARY CAMPBELL *Charles Ellis Johnson and the Erotic Mormon Image*  
(David Monod) 213
- MARGARET E. WAGNER *America and the Great War: A Library of Congress Illustrated History*  
(Michael S. Neiberg) 214
- KRISTER D. KNAPP *William James: Psychological Research and the Challenge of Modernity*  
(Justin Tyler Clark) 215