

THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

Hannes Leitgeb, *Coordinating Editor*

Andrew Arana

Wesley Holliday

Rosalie Iemhoff

Peter Koellner

Carsten Lutz

Catarina Dutilh Novaes

David Ripley

Robert van Rooij

Charlotte Werndl

VOLUME 8 • NUMBER 3 • SEPTEMBER 2015 • ISSN 1755-0203

Copyright © 2013 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Coordinating Editor

Hannes Leitgeb

*Department of Philosophy, Philosophy of Science, and Study of Religion
Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich*

Editors

Andrew Arana

*Department of Philosophy
University of Illinois at
Urbana-Champaign*

Wesley Holliday

*Department of Philosophy
University of California, Berkeley*

Rosalie Iemhoff

*Department of Philosophy
Utrecht University*

Peter Koellner

*Department of Philosophy
Harvard University*

Carsten Lutz

*Department of Computer Science
University of Bremen*

Catarina Dutilh Novaes

*Department of Philosophy
University of Groningen, Netherlands*

David Ripley

*Department of Philosophy
University of Connecticut*

Robert van Rooij

*Department of Philosophy and
Institute for Logic
University of Amsterdam*

Charlotte Werndl

*Department of Philosophy, Logic,
and Scientific Method
London School of Economics*

Advisory Board

Maria Aloni

*Department of Philosophy and Institute
for Logic, Language and Computation
University of Amsterdam*

Roy Cook

*Department of Philosophy and Minnesota
Center for Philosophy of Science
University of Minnesota*

J. Michael Dunn

*Departments of Computer Science
and Philosophy
Indiana University*

Richard G. Heck

*Department of Philosophy
Brown University*

Geoffrey Hellman

*Department of Philosophy
University of Minnesota*

Juliette Kennedy

*Department of Mathematics
and Statistics
University of Helsinki*

Peter Koellner

*Department of Philosophy
Harvard University*

Elaine Landry

*Department of Philosophy
University of California, Davis*

Bernard Linsky

*Department of Philosophy
University of Alberta*

Penelope Maddy

*Department of Logic and Philosophy
of Science
University of California, Irvine*

Edwin Mares

*School of History, Philosophy, Political
Science & International Relations
Victoria University of Wellington*

Rohit Parikh

*Department of Computer
and Information Science Brooklyn College,
City University of New York*

Greg Restall

*Department of Philosophy
University of Melbourne*

Stewart Shapiro

*Department of Philosophy
Ohio State University*

Gila Sher

*Department of Philosophy
University of California, San Diego*

Achille C. Varzi

*Department of Philosophy
Columbia University*

Rineke Verbrugge

*Institute of Artificial Intelligence
University of Groningen*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Harmonising Harmony LUCA TRANCHINI.	411
Consistency and the Theory of Truth RICHARD G. HECK, JR.	424
Solovay-Type Theorems for Circular Definitions SHAWN STANDEFER	467
How a Semantics for Tonk Should Be ANDREAS FJELLSTAD	488
Contractions of Noncontractive Consequence Relations ROHAN FRENCH AND DAVID RIPLEY.	506
Axioms for Finite Collapse Models of Arithmetic ANDREW TEDDER.	529
Frege Meets Brouwer (or Heyting or Dummett) STEWART SHAPIRO AND ØYSTEIN LINNEBO	540
Naive Set Theory and Nontransitive Logic DAVID RIPLEY.	553
Relative Categoricity and Abstraction Principles SEAN WALSH AND SEAN EBELS-DUGGAN	572
Edward Nelson (1932–2014) MIKHAIL G. KATZ AND SEMEN S. KUTATELADZE.	607

Subscription Information: *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press for the Association for Symbolic Logic. Annual subscription rates for Volume 8 (2015): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$956.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £600.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$820.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £516.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$930.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £580.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$197.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £123.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$221.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £123.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Association for Symbolic Logic. Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.** The email address of the Association's business office is asl@vassar.edu. The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

Coordinating Editor: Hannes Leitgeb, Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich, Faculty of Philosophy, Philosophy of Science and Study of Religion Geschwister-Scholl-Platz 1, D-80539 Munich, Germany. Email: Hannes.Leitgeb@lmu.de.

Copyright: All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm; enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © Association for Symbolic Logic, 2015