All that to say, this is a tremendously stimulating book. It is finely tuned, and a model of balance, cogency and mature judgement. Crisp leans hard into both the aseity of the triune God and a supralapsarian Christology that recognises *theosis* not as a substantial sharing in the divine life but as the dramatic end of all God's perfecting works. Most important, it is a book that reminds us that pursuit of the truth is more important than drawing parochial boundary lines or producing something novel.

doi:10.1017/S0036930624000048

Christa L. McKirland, *God's Provision, Humanity's Need: The Gift of Our Dependence*

(Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2022), pp. xv + 217. $38.00.

Rosemary P. Carbine

Whittier College, Whittier, CA, USA (rcarbine@whittier.edu)

Christa McKirland creatively combines analytic, biblical, New Testament and systematic theology to construct a pneumatochristocentric anthropology that is grounded in a needs-based approach, especially, as McKirland argues, in humanity's fundamental need (or 'ultimate end', p. 179) for communion with God, or what McKirland clarifies as a second-person relationship with God. Drawing on analytic philosopher Garrett Thomson (in ch. 1), fundamental needs are described as 'nonderivative, inescapable, and noncircumstantial' or intrinsic constitutive needs of human nature and existence (pp. 23–4; cf. p. 138) that play integral roles in human flourishing. 'Humanity has a forward-moving *telos* (end, goal), needs God's second personal presence to be what it is, and is meant to rely on the Holy Spirit' to transform from being created in the image of God to becoming conformed to the image of Christ through the Spirit (p. 7; cf. pp. 61, 76, 84, 141). Biblical symbols of bread, water, kin relations, tabernacle and temple are exegetically explored to demonstrate God's ongoing presence and 'overarching means for human creatures to commune with the divine presence' (p. 63), as recounted in both Christian testaments, and thus meet that need. In a Christian view, Jesus Christ incarnates and mediates the divine presence as well as models fulfilled fundamental human need for relationship with God through the Spirit. Harm occurs when such fundamental needs for dependence on and relationship with the divine are unmet, but such harm 'does not undermine humanness' (p. 9; cf. pp. 20, 159).

Each chapter examines specific analytic, scriptural and systematic sources and then synthesises those sources to elaborate McKirland's pneumatochristocentric contribution to theological anthropology. McKirland engages with the *imago Dei* in the Hebrew Bible, in biblical and surrounding cultures, and in the New Testament (in chs. 2–4) to unfold the meaning of humanity and its flourishing ('to expand God's presence and reign in all the earth', pp. 34–5, 45, 70) as well as to portray Jesus Christ as the 'teleological prototype' of fulfilled humanity (p. 11, cf. pp. 49–50, 56). Nonetheless, McKirland sustains an anthropocentric imagination (except in one place – p. 184) about the *imago Dei* that supports humanity's unique relationship with God over creation, which neglects a

biocentric imagination in eco-liberationist theologies, and negatively impacts a relational anthropology that intrinsically intersects human relations with God and with all more-than-human life. McKirland then turns (in chs. 5–7) to 'geographical, metaphorical, and relational language to describe the centrality of divine presence for human flourishing' (p. 12), through detailed biblical and scriptural exegesis of bread, water, kin relations, tabernacle, and temple as major means for humanity's 'survival and flourishing' as well as community and relationship with localised and manifested divine presence (pp. 84–5, 94). For McKirland, 'human flourishing is bound to the incarnate Logos' and vivified by the Spirit (p. 56). Constructing a Christology in conversation with Kathryn Tanner (in chs. 8 and 9), McKirland then proposes a pneumatic Christology to meet human needs (in ch. 10): 'Humankind is intended to experience dynamic flourishing in and through personal communion with the very triune life of God. Such communion is possible through the incarnation of the Logos, the firstborn of creation, putting on human form, depending on the Spirit, and giving the Spirit so that all humanity might flourish both now and always' (p. 14; cf. pp. 128–30, 155–6).

McKirland views flourishing from a biblical and theological perspective via the Sermon on the Mount, which she interprets as the wise and virtuous praxis of 'wholehearted orientation toward God' (p. 35). 'Flourishing is itself constituted by union with God' (p. 152) and by participating in Christ's identity. However, McKirland does not adequately address 'ethical, communal, or ecclesial implications' of that orientation or participation (pp. 34, 144) or of harm, which contravenes her claim that 'humans are embodied and, therefore, emplaced' in their relationship with God (p. 69). On my reading, flourishing and harm are decontextualised from real-world realities: 'physical, psychological and social needs' are dismissed to other disciplines (p. 159) or categorised as 'penultimate ends' (p. 179); these needs are centralised in Jesus' ministry, and thus need further integration and enfleshment for a more cohesive argument. McKirland recognises this need ('the relationship between penultimate and ultimate needs is an area of research that would benefit from engagement', p. 179) and could have met it in the book.

Beyond the communing with and indwelling in God modelled by Jesus, human needs also include racial/ethnic, gender, social, political, economic, educational, healthcare and ecological justice which shape and are shaped by that indwelling, and which are inhibited by sin. For example, McKirland reflects on Jesus' dependence on the Spirit for a life of ministry focused on flourishing – he was conceived, hypostasised as the Son, anointed, led, raised and empowered by the Spirit; he engaged in ministry through the Spirit to 'preach, heal, and set people free' (p. 101, cf. p. 160). Jesus also gives the Spirit to disciples to continue this transfigurative and transformative ministry. 'Jesus' very existence *and ministry* enables the possibility of such a persisting second-personal relationship with the indwelling Spirit' (p. 126; emphasis added). Nevertheless, McKirland misses theological opportunities to expand on Jesus' embodied life and justice-making ministry which Christians emulate and thereby encounter God (e.g. Matt 25:31–46), and to build on this needs-based approach and highlight biblical and real-world contextual examples of flourishing (beyond thin references to food, water, community and rest) that emphasise intertwined fundamental needs of mutual and just relationship with God and with all life, rooted in a pneumatochristocentric view of Jesus as 'the fully flourishing example of humanity' (pp. 127, 145–7) and of Jesus' ministry amid personal, social and systemic suffering for abundant life (Jn 10:10). Humanity is created and transfigured, following Tanner, to enjoy 'strong participation in God's life' (pp. 147, 155) or non-hierarchical, non-competitive, dynamic

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0036930623000571 Published online by Cambridge University Press

koinonia in and with God *and also* in and with a more loving, just and peaceable community and world.

McKirland claims that 'access to God's indwelling presence constitutes the identity *and function* of the followers of Christ' (p. 149; emphasis added). Discipleship also requires real-world praxis of participating in that identity through enacting, albeit imperfectly, the emancipatory reign or kin-dom of God, or what McKirland calls 'living out the power of that presence in their lives corporately' (p. 174; cf. p. 182). Further explicit theological engagement is needed about humanity's inextricably interdependent relationship with God and with all life (rather than ranked ends), which could be grounded fruitfully on McKirland's yet undeveloped insights.

doi:10.1017/S0036930623000571

Peter M. Waddell, *Broken Gospel? Christianity and the Holocaust*

(London: James Clarke & Co., 2022), pp. x + 177. £22.50.

Stephen R. Haynes

Rhodes College, Memphis, TN, USA (haynes@rhodes.edu)

Peter M. Waddell's *Broken Gospel?* asks a straightforward, though far from uncomplicated question: '[H]as the Church's wickedness [with regard to Jews] been so thorough that the truth of the Gospel itself is called into question?' (p. 2). This is not a new question; it has been asked by a series of Christian and Jewish scholars for at least fifty years. If Waddell had not learned from these scholars, we might well respond, 'Why ask again?' But he has learned from them, and as a result *Broken Gospel?* offers new insights on a decades-old debate.

The book addresses a variety of issues related to the moral credibility of Christianity. The first, addressed in chapter 1, 'Barabbas and His Afterlife', concerns the Jews' responsibility for the death of Jesus; the chapter asks whether this is the teaching of the New Testament, whether it is historically probable, and how the Christian belief in Jewish culpability for Jesus' death, and the theological teaching of contempt that that grew from it, placed Jews in mortal peril in the Constantinian era and beyond. Waddell concludes that traditional Christian anti-Semitism, rooted ultimately in New Testament texts, was a necessary, but not sufficient, condition for the Holocaust, that 'a direct, if twisting, line between the Barabbas story and the Final Solution remains' (p. 26). This is, in essence, the conclusion drawn by Rosemary Ruether fifty years ago. But Waddell remains hopeful about ethical handling of the passion narratives, adding a section on responsible reading of the Barabbas story today.

In chapter 2, subtitled 'Christian Churches and the Killing', Waddell takes up the matter of whether Christians were responsible for the Holocaust. Here he addresses Pope Pius XII's activity (or inactivity) in response to Nazi anti-Semitism and recent attempts to assess the pope's level of complicity in Jewish suffering. When considering German Protestants, Waddell focuses on the ambivalent tone struck by the early