

VOLUME 10
NUMBER 2
JUNE 1987

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

How brains make chaos in order to make sense of the world Christine
A. Skarda & Walter J. Freeman

**Dopamine, schizophrenia, mania, and depression: Toward a unified
hypothesis of cortico-striato-pallido-thalamic function** Neal R. Swerdlow
& George F. Koob

Primate handedness reconsidered Peter F. MacNeilage, Michael G. Studdert-
Kennedy & Bjorn Lindblom

**Also, Continuing Commentary on "Social versus reproductive
success: The central theoretical problem of human
sociobiology"** (Vining) **"Can human irrationality be experimentally
demonstrated?"** (Cohen) **"The impending demise of the icon: A
critique of the concept of iconic storage in visual information
processing"** (Haber) **"Choice, optimal foraging, and the delay-
reduction hypothesis"** (Fantino & Abarca) **"Unconscious cerebral
initiative and the role of conscious will in voluntary
action"** (Libet) **"Supplementary motor area structure and function:
Review and hypotheses"** (Goldberg) **"Matrilineal inheritance: New
theory and analysis"** (Hartung) **"Are there independent lexical and
nonlexical routes in word processing?"** (Humphreys & Evett)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Assistant Editor

Laura Triest

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge
Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Birbeck College, London

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/Harvard

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 10 (1987) is US \$140.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£83.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$61.00 net (£39.00) for individuals; US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$39.00 net (£23.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

Zelizer
12/8/87

Skarda, C. A. & Freeman, W. J. How brains make chaos in order to make sense of the world 161

Open Peer Commentary

Babloyantz, A. Chaotic dynamics in brain activity	174
Barnden, J. A. Chaos, symbols, and connectionism	174
Boynton, R. M. Spatial analysis of brain function: Not the first	175
Brown, R. Can brains make psychological sense of neurological data?	175
Corner, M. A. & Noest, A. J. When the "chaos" is too chaotic and the "limit cycles" too limited, the mind boggles and the brain (model) flounders	176
Earle, D. C. On the differences between cognitive and noncognitive systems	177
Garfinkel, A. The virtues of chaos	178

Grossberg, S. Stable self-organization of sensory recognition codes: Is chaos necessary?	179
Levine, D. S. Is chaos the only alternative to rigidity?	180
Perkel, D. H. Chaos in brains: Fad or insight?	180
Rosenfeld, R., Touretzky, D. S. & the Boltzmann Group Connectionist models as neural abstractions	181
Thom, R. Chaos can be overplayed	182
Werner, G. Cognition as self-organizing process	183

Authors' Response

Skarda, C. A. & Freeman, W. J. Physiology: Is there any other game in town?	183
---	-----

Swerdlow, N. R. & Koob, G. F. Dopamine, schizophrenia, mania, and depression: Toward a unified hypothesis of cortico-striato-pallido-thalamic function 197

Open Peer Commentary

Alheid, G. F. & Heimer, L. The "extended amygdala" as a receptor area for psychotherapeutic drugs	208
Beart, P. M. Roles for glutamate and norepinephrine in limbic circuitry and psychopathology	208
Chute, D. L. Intracellular considerations in models of psychopathology	209
Cools, A. R. The relevance of feedforward loops	210
Fallon, J. H. The ghost in the machine: What if the midbrain output is excitatory?	210
Fibiger, H. C. Neural circuit models of psychopathology: Dancing on the precipice of neuromythology?	212
Gardner, E. L. The neuropathology of schizophrenia, mania, and depression: Diseases of cognitive initiation and switching?	213
Grace, A. A. An electrophysiologist's eye view of the basal ganglia	214
Gray, J. A. & Baruch, I. Don't leave the "psych" out of neuropsychology	215
Jaskiw, G. E. & Weinberger, D. R. The prefrontal cortex-accumbens circuit: Who's in charge?	217

Kalivas, P. W. Where have all the peptides gone?	218
Kelley, A. E. Dopamine and mental illness: Phenomenological and anatomical considerations	219
Kolb, B., Jacobs, W. J. & Petrie, B. Searching for a technology of behavior	220
Le Moal, M. Toward a neurological psychiatry	221
Phillips, A. Unified theories of psychoses and affective disorders: Are they feasible without accurate neural models of cognition and emotion?	222
Soubrié, P. & Carnoy, P. Neuropsychiatry: Pitfalls of inferring functional mechanisms from observed drug effects	222
Stevens, J. R. Psychopharmacology of psychosis: Still looking for missing links	223
Tassin, J. P. Dopamine and mental illness: And what about the mesocortical dopamine system?	224
Wolkin, A. & Cancro, R. Madness and clarity	225

Authors' Response

Swerdlow, N. R. & Koob, G. F. Toward a unified neuropsychiatric hypothesis	226
--	-----

MacNeilage, P. F., Studdert-Kennedy, M. G. & Lindblom, B. Primate handedness reconsidered 247

Open Peer Commentary

Annett, M. Handedness as chance or as species characteristic	263
Bradshaw, J. L. But what about nonprimate asymmetries and nonmanual primate asymmetries?	264
Brésard, B. & Bresson, F. Reaching or manipulation: Left or right?	265
Bryden, M. P. & Steenhuis, R. E. Handedness is a matter of degree	266

Calvin, W. H. On evolutionary expectations of symmetry and toolmaking	267
Cicchetti, D. V. On viewing the evidence for primate handedness: Some biostatistical considerations	268
Corballis, M. C. Straw monkeys	269
Deuel, R. K. & Schaffer, S. P. Patterns of hand preference in monkeys	270
Ettlinger, G. Primate handedness: How nice if it were really so	271

Glezer, I. I. The riddle of Carlyle: The unsolved problem of the origin of handedness	273	adaptive significance of the bias in human handedness	283
Goodale, M. A. Two hemispheres: One reaching hand	275	Steklis, H. D. & Marchant, L. F. Primate handedness: Reaching and grasping for straws?	284
Guiard, Y. Precursors to what? Theory is lacking for handedness in humans	276	Tomasello, M. Why the left hand?	286
Heuer, H. Does a hand preference indicate a hemispheric specialization?	277	Vauclair, J. & Fagot, J. Visually guided reaching in adult baboons	287
Jerison, H. J. Which hand lost its cunning?	278	Walker, S. Or in the hand, or in the heart? Alternative routes to lateralization	288
Kolb, B. & Fantie, B. Reaching for the brain	279	Warren, J. M. Primate handedness: Inadequate analysis, invalid conclusions	288
Lehman, R. A. W. On the other hand . . .	280		
LeMay, M. Evolution of handedness	281	Authors' Response	
McKeever, W. F. Primate handedness should be considered – but not “reconsidered” at this point	281	MacNeilage, P. F., Studdert-Kennedy, M. G. & Lindblom, B. Primate predatory, postural, and prehensile proclivities and professional peer pressures: Postscripts	289
McManus, I. C. On the one hand, on the other hand: Statistical fallacies in laterality research	282		
Michel, G. F. & Harkins, D. A. Ontogenetic considerations in the phylogenetic history and			

Continuing Commentary

<i>On</i> Vining, D. R., Jr. (1986) Social versus reproductive success: The central theoretical problem of human sociobiology. <i>BBS</i> 9:167–216.			305
Cattell, R. B. Fitness and intelligence: The more concrete problem	305	Author's Response	
Flinn, M. V. Resources, reproduction, and mate competition in human populations	305	Vining, D. R., Jr. Modern human sociobiology: Some further observations	308
Machalek, R. Are the socially successful an intelligence cartel?	307		
<i>On</i> Cohen, L. J. (1981) Can human irrationality be experimentally demonstrated? <i>BBS</i> 4:317–370.			311
Taylor, J. E. Cohen on cognitive competence: Can human rationality be philosophically demonstrated?	311	Author's Response	
		Cohen, L. J. What are the foundations of normative theories about human reasoning?	312
<i>On</i> Haber, R. N. (1983) The impending demise of the icon: A critique of the concept of iconic storage in visual information processing. <i>BBS</i> 6:1–54.			313
Chow, S. L. Iconic memory or icon?	313		
<i>On</i> Fantino, E. & Abarca, N. (1985) Choice, optimal foraging, and the delay-reduction hypothesis. <i>BBS</i> 8:315–330.			315
Wynne, C. Mechanisms of optimal choice	316	Authors' Response	
		Fantino, E. & Abarca, N. Delay-reduction theory: Straddling the functional-mechanism continuum	317
<i>On</i> Libet, B. (1985) Unconscious cerebral initiative and the role of conscious will in voluntary action. <i>BBS</i> 8:529–566.			318
Davis, L. H. What are W and M awarenesses of?	318	Author's Response	
		Libet, B. Awarenesses of wanting to move and of moving	320
<i>On</i> Goldberg, G. (1985) Supplementary motor area structure and function: Review and hypotheses. <i>BBS</i> 8:567–616.			321
Preilowski, B. The role of corollary motor discharges, the corpus callosum, and the supplementary motor cortices in bimanual coordination	322	Author's Response	
		Goldberg, G. Premotor systems, motor learning, and ipsilateral control: Learning to get set	323

<i>On</i> Hartung, J. (1985) Matrilineal inheritance: New theory and analysis. BBS 8:661–688.	329
Fox, R. Paternity uncertainty: Cause or consequence?	329
<i>On</i> Humphreys, G. W. & Evett, L. J. (1985) Are there independent lexical and nonlexical routes in word processing? An evaluation of the dual-route theory of reading. BBS 8:689–740.	331
Bridgeman, B. Is the dual-route theory possible in phonetically regular languages?	331
Brown, C. D. A. On the difference between the regularity and the frequency of spelling-to-sound correspondences	332
Danks, J. H. Independent or interactive routes: What are the constraints?	333
Authors' Response	
Evett, L. J. & Humphreys, G. W. Extending the multiple-levels approach to word processing	334

***A major new
international
journal for 1988!***

VISUAL **NEUROSCIENCE**

EDITOR

Katherine V. Fite

University of Massachusetts/Amherst

Bringing together in one forum a broad range of studies reflecting the diversity and originality of contemporary research in basic visual neuroscience, the contributions will utilize neuroanatomical, neurophysiological, neurochemical, neuroimmunological, and behavioral methodologies in addition to computer-assisted theoretical formulations.

The journal's primary emphasis will be on retinal and brain mechanisms underlying visually-guided behaviors and visual perception.

Among the topics of interest are • Photoreception and transduction • Retinal anatomy, physiology and neurochemistry • Retinohthalamic pathways and nuclei • Thalamocortical pathways, visual cortex and telecephalic correlates of visual perception and cognition • Subcortical visual pathways; oculomotor and visuomotor functions • Comparative visual system organization and evolutionary perspectives • Developmental processes, patterns and neuronal specificity • Theoretical and computational models of vision and visual processes

***Published Quarterly
Annual Subscription Rates***

US and Canada: \$100 (institutions); \$50 (individuals); \$35 (students) paid in US dollars or Canadian dollar equivalent.

All other countries: £65 (institutions); £35 (individuals); £25 (students) paid in UK sterling.

 **Cambridge
Journals**

Cambridge University Press

32 East 57th St., New York, NY 10022, USA; or
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England