

THE
JOURNAL
OF
LAW
AND
RELIGION



Volume XI

1994-95

Number 1

Sponsored by:

Hamline University School of Law

Published by:

**Hamline University School of Law
ISSN: 0748-0814**

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XI

1994-95

NUMBER 1

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editors

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University, School of Law

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary

Managing & Book Editor

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University, School of Law

Production Manager

JO ANNE MATSON

Editorial Assistants

BARBARA DEVRIES

LORI FERRIS

BRIAN HALL

SANDRA HILLER

MICHAEL HUBBARD

KRISTINE ISLE

JANE JACOBSON

EDITORIAL BOARD

THOMAS PORTER, Attorney at Law, Boston, Chair

FRANK ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law

AZIZAH Y. AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law

STEPHEN CARTER, Yale Law School

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, Jr., Valparaiso University School of Law

EMILY FOWLER HARTIGAN, St. Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary, St. Paul

RAYMOND R. KRAUSE, Hamline University School of Law

ROBIN LOVIN, Southern Methodist University

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee

LOUIS NEWMAN, Carlton College

MICHAEL J. PERRY, Northwestern University School of Law

MICHAEL SCHERSCHLIGT, Hamline University School of Law

DOUGLAS STURM, Bucknell University

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

RICHARD BAEPLER, Valparaiso University

HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law

JAMES BRESNAHAN, Northwestern University Medical School

LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law

FRED CARNEY, Southern Methodist University

ROGER CRAMTON, Cornell University School of Law

CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law

MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University of New York

LEIGH LERNER, Rabbi, Montreal

DAVID LITTLE, U.S. Institute of Peace

MARTIN MARTY, University of Chicago Divinity School

ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law

NOOR MOHAMMAD, University of Baltimore School of Law

ELIZABETH SCHUESSLER-FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School

THOMAS SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School

PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law

ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Minnesota Supreme Court

STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, St. Paul

The Journal of Law and Religion is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a nonprofit, nonpartisan publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$15 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$25 for institutions and \$10 for students. Add \$10 for foreign airmail service. Subscription requests, manuscripts and general correspondence should be addressed to:

Jo Anne Matson
Production Manager
The Journal of Law and Religion
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Book review manuscripts and books to be reviewed should be sent to:

Howard J. Vogel
Book Review Editor
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Commencing with Volume X, citations will conform to: *The University of Chicago Manual of Legal Citation* (1989) copyright by the University of Chicago. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on line on a variety of computer data base services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available online through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

Internet access to *The Journal of Law and Religion* is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/~jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 11 J LAW & RELIG



A Subscription to the
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

- \$15.00 individual (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$25.00 individual (foreign air mail)
- \$25.00 institution (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$35.00 institution (foreign air mail)
- \$10.00 student

Production Manager
Journal of Law and Religion
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, Minnesota 55104

- Payment enclosed.
- Please bill me.
- Begin my subscription with vol. _____, number _____.

Name: _____

Street Address: _____

City & State: _____ Zip code: _____

ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire
back stock, reprint and
microform rights to the

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Complete sets to date
are now available. We
can also furnish single
volumes and issues.

WILLIAM S. HEIN & CO., INC.
1285 Main Street
Buffalo, New York 14209

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XI

1994-95

NUMBER 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface	vii
-------------------------------	-----

Articles

Daniel Westberg	The Relation Between Positive and Natural Law in Aquinas	1
Arnold N. Enker	Error Juris in Jewish Criminal Law	23
Robert J. Araujo, S.J.	Political Theory and Liberation Theology: The Intersection of Unger and Gutiérrez ..	63
John Howard Yoder	How Many Ways Are There to Think Morally About War?	83
David Orgon Coolidge	A Legal Fantasy: <i>Marylanders for Tolerance Now! v. Maryland State Administrative Board of Election Laws and American Citizens for Tolerance Now! v. Federal Election Commission</i>	109

Symposium in Honor of Judge John T. Noonan, Jr.

Bernard J. Cassidy	Essays in Honor of Judge John T. Noonan, Jr.: An Introduction	143
Kevin Starr	Judge John T. Noonan, Jr. A Brief Biography	151
Bernard Häring	Learning More About God's Plan in a Worldwide Community	177
M. Cathleen Kaveny	Listening for the Future in the Voices of the Past: John T. Noonan, Jr. on Love and Power in Human History	203
Monroe H. Freedman	John T. Noonan, Jr.: Exemplar of Ethical Conduct	229
Richard H. Helmholz	Excommunication in Twelfth Century England	235
Robert E. Rodes, Jr.	Pilgrim Law	255

Stephan Kuttner	Did Rolandus of Bologna Write a “ <i>Stroma ex Decretorum Corpore Captum?</i> ”	267
Andrew L. Kaufman	The First Judge Cardozo: Albert, Father of Benjamin	271
David Daube	The Contrariness of Speech and Polytheism	317
John S. Dunne	The Friends of God “guided and guarded” J.R.R. Tolkien	323
Knut Wolfgang Nörr	“Economic Constitution”: On the Roots of a Legal Concept	343
Robert A. Destro	The Structure of the Religious Liberty Guarantee	355

Book Reviews

Daniel G. Ashburn	<i>Legal Issues and Religious Counseling</i> , by Ronald K. Bullis and Cynthia S. Mazur	411
David R. Dow	On Reading Stephen Carter’s <i>The Culture of Disbelief</i> —A Dissenting Opinion	417
Mary Läuchli	<i>The Culture of Disbelief: How American Law and Politics Trivialize Religious Devotion</i> by Stephen L. Carter	449
Emily Fowler Hartigan	Loving the Medium: A Review of Stephen Carter’s <i>The Culture of Disbelief</i>	459