

# Law and History Review

## Law and History Review

---

**Editor**

Christopher Tomlins  
*American Bar Foundation*

**Associate Editor**

Laura Edwards  
*UCLA*

**Managing Editor**

Diane Levin  
*American Bar Foundation*

---

*Law and History Review* (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6975. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

---

© 2000 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

*This journal is printed on acid-free paper.*

# Law and History Review

---

Volume 18, Number 3

Fall 2000

---

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press  
for the American Society for Legal History*

## Editorial Board

David Abraham  
*University of Miami*

William P. Alford  
*Harvard University*

Mary Frances Berry  
*University of Pennsylvania*

Thomas Brennan  
*U.S. Naval Academy*

Martin Chanock  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Elaine Clark  
*University of Michigan,  
Dearborn*

Martha F. Davis  
*NOW Legal Defense,  
New York*

Thomas J. Davis  
*Arizona State University*

Cornelia Dayton  
*University of Connecticut*

Laura Engelstein  
*Princeton University*

Jean-Marie Fecteau  
*Université du Québec  
à Montreal*

Christian G. Fritz  
*University of New Mexico*

Judy Fudge  
*York University, Toronto*

Paul Hyams  
*Cornell University*

Nancy Isenberg  
*University of Northern Iowa*

Bruce Kercher  
*Macquarie University, NSW*

Diane Kirkby  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Michael Klarman  
*University of Virginia*

David Konig  
*Washington University,  
St. Louis*

Mindie Lazarus-Black  
*University of Illinois at  
Chicago*

Kenneth F. Ledford  
*Case Western Reserve  
University*

Brian P. Levack  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Jeanette Neeson  
*York University, Toronto*

Kent Newmyer  
*University of Connecticut*

James P. Oakes  
*CUNY Graduate Center*

John V. Orth  
*University of North Carolina*

Steven Pincus  
*University of Chicago*

W. Wesley Pue  
*University of British  
Columbia*

Nicole Hahn Rafter  
*Northeastern University*

Gerry R. Rubin  
*University of Kent,  
Canterbury*

Lucy E. Salyer  
*University of  
New Hampshire*

John Henry Schlegel  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Stephen A. Siegel  
*De Paul University*

Rayman L. Solomon  
*Rutgers University, Camden*

Robin Chapman Stacey  
*University of Washington*

Robert J. Steinfeld  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Emily Z. Tabuteau  
*Michigan State University*

Victor M. Uribe  
*Florida International  
University*

Barbara Y. Welke  
*University of Minnesota*

James Q. Whitman  
*Yale University*

Stephen C. Yeazell  
*University of California,  
Los Angeles*

## Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscripts and all general editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611 (tel 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579; e-m <clt@abfn.org>). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to Laura Edwards, Department of History, UCLA, 6265 Bunche Hall, Los Angeles, CA 90095-1473 (tel 310 825 3737; fax 310 206 9043; e-m <edwards@history.ucla.edu>). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page <www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html>. Please use word processing wherever possible. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

# Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 18, No. 3, Fall 2000

[www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html](http://www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html)

**In This Issue** vii

## Articles

- A Historian as a Source of Law: Abbot Peter of Henryków and the Invocation of Norms in Medieval Poland, c. 1200–1270  
Piotr Górecki 479
- Industrial Arbitration, Equity, and Authority in England, 1800–1850  
James A. Jaffe 525

## Forum: Truth, Law, and History. New Departures in Israeli Legal History, Part One

- Historical Adjudication: Courts of Law, Commissions of Inquiry, and “Historical Truth”  
Asher Maoz 559

## Comments

- Where Hannah Arendt Went Wrong  
David Abraham 607
- Making History: Israeli Law and Historical Reconstruction  
Eben Moglen 613

## Response

- Law and History—A Need for Demarcation  
Asher Maoz 619

## Notes and Commentary

- Rethinking the Nineteenth-Century Employment Contract, Again  
John Fabian Witt 627

## The *LHR* Electronic Resource Page

- Recovering and Reporting Australia’s Early Colonial Case Law: The Macquarie Project  
Bruce Kercher 659

## Book Reviews

- Contracting a Cure: Patients, Healers, and the Law in Early Modern Bologna*—Gianna Pomata  
reviewed by Mary Lindemann 667
- Social Identity in Imperial Russia*—Elise Kimberling Wirtschafter  
reviewed by Golfo Alexopoulos 669
- Autocracy under Siege: Security Police and Opposition in Russia, 1866–1905*—Jonathan Daly  
reviewed by Abby M. Schrader 671
- Soviet Criminal Justice under Stalin*—Peter H. Solomon, Jr.  
reviewed by Peter Krug 673
- State-Making and Labor Movements: France and the United States, 1876–1914*—Gerald Friedman  
reviewed by John H. M. Laslett 675
- Slavery and the Law*—Paul Finkelman, editor  
reviewed by Timothy S. Huebner 677
- Sex and Citizenship in Antebellum America*—Nancy Isenberg  
reviewed by Sarah Barringer Gordon 679
- Law, Labor, and Ideology in the Early American Republic*—  
Christopher L. Tomlins  
reviewed by R. Ben Brown 681
- Shifting the Blame: Literature, Law, and the Theory of Accidents in  
Nineteenth-Century America*—Nan Goodman  
reviewed by Peter Karsten 683
- White Women, Black Men: Illicit Sex in the Nineteenth-Century  
South*—Martha Hodes  
reviewed by Ariela Gross 686
- Policing the Elephant: Crime, Punishment, and Social Behavior on  
the Overland Trail*—John Phillip Reid  
reviewed by Andrew R. L. Cayton 688
- Race, Place, and the Law, 1836–1948*—David Delaney  
reviewed by David F. Godshalk 690
- Race, Labor, and Punishment in the New South*—Martha Myers  
reviewed by Alex Lichtenstein 692

<i>A New South Rebellion: The Battle against Convict Labor in the Tennessee Coalfields, 1871–1896</i> —Karin A. Shapiro reviewed by Pete Daniel	694
<i>Woman Suffrage and the Origins of Liberal Feminism in the United States, 1820–1920</i> —Suzanne M. Marilley reviewed by Kate Greene	696
<i>The Farmer's Benevolent Trust: Law and Agricultural Cooperation in Industrial America, 1865–1945</i> —Victoria Saker Woeste reviewed by Peter Carstensen	698
<i>A Fabric of Defeat: The Politics of South Carolina Millhands, 1910–1948</i> —Bryant Simon reviewed by Eric Arnesen	700
<i>Tales of Wayward Girls and Immoral Women: Case Records and the Professionalization of Social Work</i> —Karen W. Tice reviewed by Ruth M. Alexander	702
<i>Creating Born Criminals</i> —Nicole Hahn Rafter reviewed by Michael Willrich	704
<i>Lochner v. New York: Economic Regulation on Trial</i> —Paul Kens reviewed by Michael A. Ross	707
<i>Worker's Paradox: The Republican Origins of New Deal Labor Policy, 1886–1935</i> —Ruth O'Brien reviewed by Colin Gordon	708
<i>Law and History: The Evolution of the American Legal System</i> —Anthony Chase reviewed by Kermit L. Hall	710
<i>Running Steel, Running America: Race, Economic Policy, and the Decline of Liberalism</i> —Judith Stein reviewed by Josh A. Sides	712
<i>Colorblind Injustice: Minority Voting Rights and the Undoing of the Second Reconstruction</i> —J. Morgan Kousser reviewed by David Goldfield	714

