

The mass-production of 'reproductions' has thus brought it about that 'in respect of art, we are the first to be the heirs of all the earth, our heritage has undergone the most elaborate metamorphosis that the world has ever known'.

It is this new phenomenon in human history, the 'museum without walls' created, first by the breakdown of the restriction of 'art' to the products of a single period or culture, then by the easy accessibility of reproductions of the products of all periods and cultures, that has, in the author's view, rendered such a comprehensive phenomenology both possible and imperative. The result is often stimulating and exciting, though it is hard to say exactly what is stimulated or excited. But astonishing insights jostle with statements that are scarcely intelligible (we do not know if author or translator is to blame for this), and others which are plain nonsense. Even his abandoned Marxism should have taught M. Malraux better than to write, 'That day when Nicolas de Cusa wrote "Christ is Perfect Man" closed a cycle of Christendom, and, with it, the gates of hell; now Raphael's forms could come into happy being'.

But whatever may be thought of the letterpress, there can be no doubt that these three volumes, with their wealth of illustrations, make an incomparable picture-book. The volumes are beautifully made and printed in Switzerland. In England they are published by Zwemmer.

VICTOR WHITE, O.P.

NEWMAN'S UNIVERSITY: IDEA AND REALITY. By Fergal McGrath, S.J. (Dublin, Browne and Nolan; 30s.)

'Newman éducateur a été étudié à rebours en Irlande', wrote Fernande Tardivel in 1937. It was all too true. From the beginning of the second quarter of this century, the prevailing Irish view of Newman in Irish educational circles was that he was an eminent Oxford don who had tried to import some of the less desirable features of the Oxford system into Ireland, that he was willing to allow the Irish peasantry to pay for the Catholic University of Ireland but not to enter it, and that his educational Philosophy of Severance, as it was called, bordered on heresy. The headline of this opinion was set by the writings of Professor T. Corcoran, whose professorial lectures also spread it among the teachers of Ireland for many years. Gradually, however, the truth prevailed. In 1928 an article by Lambert McKenna, S.J., on the Catholic University indicated a different line of approach; in 1937, Tardivel's book completely overturned Corcoran's views; and the years bordering the centenary of Newman's conversion saw a number of studies by Irish scholars which followed similar lines. On this count, therefore, one welcomes the appearance of Father McGrath's book, a lengthy survey of the Catholic University experiment and of Newman's connection

with it, which vindicates Newman in some detail and sets forth the facts of his work and of its background.

Those interested in the Irish university question will find this work a mine of information, for it organises most of the established facts and fills in the details contained in a mass of unpublished material in the Birmingham Oratory, the Dublin diocesan archives and elsewhere. Nothing essentially new is discovered about Newman, but the ground of the Irish educational system in the last century is examined minutely and the genesis of the Catholic University is closely discussed in relation to its troubled political and religious background.

The value of Father McGrath's work is somewhat impaired by two defects. The first is a serious lack of selectiveness, which causes him to reproduce *verbatim* much of the evidence found in Ward and other sources, to waste time in that sort of elaboration of detail which Newman found so distasteful in Mosheim and Du Pin, and to refute exhaustively notions which already have been amply refuted. The second is a lack of objectivity in assessing any evidence touching the very open question of nondenominational education; Bishop Doyle's support of it, for example, is discounted largely on the ground that the eminent Augustinian wished to break down bigotry, while the Young Irelanders who supported the nondenominational Queen's Colleges with the same object in mind are represented alternately as gullible liberals and unconscious bigots, who were 'forcing on the large majority of their countrymen a system of education repugnant to their religious convictions'. This view is all the more puzzling when one considers that for almost half a century the same large majority has found nothing repugnant in nondenominational university education; the Dublin experiment, the Kensington experiment and the Glasnevin fiasco all help to explain why.

Readers who are chiefly interested in Newman will find that Father McGrath's details help to reinforce Ward's chapters on his years in Ireland and that he has made good use of Newman's own account of his 'Campaign in Ireland' to emphasise the practical side of his activities in university affairs. It is quite clear that the Catholic University of Ireland was never really under his control and that the Cullen-MacHale cleavage hampered him at every turn. Which of them prevented the Pope from making Newman a bishop? Father McGrath's analysis of the possibilities is acute but, although it casts most suspicion on the latter, the mystery remains unsolved. One lays down this book with a sad recollection of Newman's comparison of himself to a horse harnessed to the Catholic University cart and with the slight consolation that Pegasus, although kept on an unmercifully tight rein, at least refused to wear blinkers.

ROGER MCHUGH