

terrorist act of modern times. Bruce Harbert next suggests that contemporary liturgical texts and the changed orientation of altar reveal the loss of an eschatological perspective, indicative of a community turned in on itself and incapable of expressing a sense of the kingdom of God as a reality among us. John McDade, in what was a contribution to a colloquium on paradise in different religions, reflects on Paradise in terms of our having a present sense of being in “deep God”. By the end we may not have entered Eden but there are pointers for the journey!

David McLoughlin
President

Eden and Beyond: Images of Paradise in Biblical and extra-Biblical Literature

Paula Gooder

Introduction

The word paradise is one which is so familiar to most of us that its utterance evokes an immediate mental image of a beautiful garden where the righteous dwell for eternity. This image, while finding its roots in the biblical tradition, is influenced as much by Dante, Milton and many Christian paintings as it is by biblical traditions. In fact, it is hard to see the word paradise without bringing to mind those famous medieval and renaissance paintings of the Garden of Eden, Heaven and Hell. The problem of this Christian heritage is that it encourages a rather monochrome image of the nature of Paradise which runs contrary to the variety of images contained in texts from the biblical era.

The purpose of this study is to examine the references to Paradise in texts from the biblical era and to explore the images evoked by

them. The paper will begin and end with a consideration of the texts about Paradise in the New Testament. From there we shall move on to explore the background to these texts first in the Hebrew bible and the Septuagint and then in non-canonical texts from the second temple period. We shall note where ideas shift and develop and note how this affects the image of Paradise. We will end by returning to the texts from the New Testament and noting how this background affects our understanding of the relevant passages.

Paradise in the New Testament

There are three references to paradise in the New Testament. The first is in Luke 23:43 when Jesus says to the thief next to him on the cross: "Truly I tell you, today you will be with me in Paradise." The second is in the strange little passage in 2 Corinthians 12:2-4, which recounts the ascent of the person in Christ, who was probably Paul, into the third heaven and reads:

I know a person in Christ who fourteen years ago was caught up to the third heaven—whether in the body or out of the body I do not know; God knows.³ And I know that such a person—whether in the body or out of the body I do not know; God knows—4 was caught up into Paradise and heard things that are not to be told, that no mortal is permitted to repeat.

The third 'to everyone who conquers, I will give permission to eat from the tree of life that is in the paradise of God' is in Revelation 2:7 and occurs at the end of the first letter that John must write to the angels of the seven churches.¹

An initial examination of the three texts that do mention paradise in the New Testament indicates that they all refer to slightly different things. For example, in Luke, paradise is the destination of the thief on the cross immediately after death; in 2 Corinthians it is visited temporarily during the lifetime of the ascender and in Revelation it is the location of the tree of life, from which those who conquer might eat. In Revelation it is unclear whether the righteous will dwell there after death, especially since Revelation 7:14 refers to those who have come out of the great ordeal as standing not in a garden of delight but before the throne of God.

A common response to this variety in the text is to conflate them and treat them as referring to the same reality. This means that all the texts are understood to refer to the final resting place of the righteous experienced by the thief in Luke 23 and those who have conquered in Revelation after death and by Paul as a prolepsis of his future

experience.² In what follows we shall explore the Jewish background to the concept of paradise both in biblical and extra-biblical material and ask how these backgrounds help to illuminate the New Testament references to paradise.

Etymology

Etymology is the most common starting place for discussions of the concept of paradise and there seems no good reason to do otherwise here.³ The Greek word '*paradeisos*' is thought to be derived from an old Persian word '*pairi-da_za-*'⁴ which denotes an enclosure and thus a park or garden surrounded by a wall. '*Paradeisos*' was first used by Xenophon to refer to the parks of the Persian nobility and from then on was used to denote parks of any kind.⁵ By the time of the translation of the LXX into Greek '*paradeisos*' was widely used for any kind of park or orchard. Thus for example it is used in the Greek additions to the book of Daniel to refer to the park in which Susanna was accustomed to walk⁶ and in *Ben Sirach* it is used synonymously with '*k_pos*' which is simply another word for garden.⁷

In texts that have been translated from Hebrew, the word is used to translate the Hebrew word '*pardes*' which was likewise borrowed from the Persian original and occurs three times in the Hebrew bible (Song of Solomon 4:13; Ecclesiastes 2:5; Nehemiah 2:8) to refer to royal parks or orchards. In addition to this the same word '*paradeisos*' translates the Hebrew words '*gan*' or garden and '*gan eden*' or garden of Eden. Sometimes in this context the word means simply a normal garden, thus for example Jeremiah commands the people in exile to build themselves houses and gardens (translated in the LXX as *paradeisoi*).⁸ At other times the word refers to the Garden of Eden. It is used 14 times in Genesis 2–3 to refer to the Garden in which Adam is placed and once in Joel as a direct reference back to that story.⁹ For the most part the phrase Garden of Eden is translated with the single word '*paradeisos*' though at times it becomes the phrase '*paradeisos truph_s*' or paradise of softness or luxuriousness. Thus in most cases the word refers either simply to a garden or to a particularly luxurious garden, as a symbol of fruitfulness.

Paradise in the Hebrew Bible

It seems quite clear then that most of the instances of the word '*paradeisos*' in the Septuagint and the words they translate from the Hebrew bible refer quite simply to a garden with little significance other than that. There are, however, a few exceptions to this rule. The earliest text of interest is found in the book of Ezekiel in an oracle

addressed to Tyre (28:12-19). What is interesting about the use of the word '*paradeisos*' here is that the word appears to refer to an alternative story about the first human being in the garden of Eden. In this account of the tale the first human being lived in Eden which was not in the East but on the Mountain of God. This figure was covered with precious stones and a cherub was sent to guard him. Expulsion from the garden took place because of human pride and violence not because of an illicit consumption of fruit from a tree.¹⁰

It is interesting to note that other 'Eden myths' also exist outside the Hebrew bible. One of the most important examples of this is the Sumerian tale of 'Enki and Ninhursang'.¹¹ This story is set in the land (or island) of Dilmun which lies east of Sumer. This land is described in the story as pure and clean, a land where there is no sickness or death and where animals live in harmony. What is particularly interesting about this account is that it is immediately evocative of Isaiah of Jerusalem's vision of the future in the time when a shoot will come out from the stump of Jesse. At that time 'The wolf shall live with the lamb, the leopard shall lie down with the kid, the calf and the lion and the fatling together, and a little child shall lead them' (Isaiah 11:6) and so on.

The first time that the word 'paradise' is actually used to refer to future hope is in Isaiah 51:3 'For the Lord will comfort Zion; he will comfort all her waste places, and will make her wilderness like Eden, her desert like the garden of the Lord.' Here again the word is used to connote fruitfulness and luxury. The hope that is offered is a corporate one for the land of Judah which will, according to the prophet become 'like' the garden of Eden. Here paradise is held out in promise for the future but the substance of the promise concerns not life after death but a physical hope for the nation in the future. The return from exile will inaugurate a time of such fertility that the land will be like the garden of Eden at the start of all time. The return from exile will be a new start both spiritually for the people and physically for the land.

Another text of interest can be found in Ben Sira otherwise known as Ecclesiasticus (40:17 and 27). In these two verses the phrase '*h_s paradeisos eulogias*', is used, which, roughly speaking means like a paradise of good or fine language, translated in the NRSV as 'garden of blessings'. Here the word clearly has a more metaphorical use than ever before but again it is still being used to refer to something special. In both verses the thing compared to 'the garden of blessings' is a virtue: in 40:17 it is kindness and in 40:27 it

is the classic wisdom virtue, the fear of the Lord.

Within the Hebrew bible and the Septuagint, there is little evidence that the word paradise is used to define any kind of hope for the future. The only hint of future hope to be found is in Isaiah 51:3 which compares the rejuvenation of the land of Israel upon that return to the garden of Eden, but here the hope is clearly physical and taking place in the near future. Elsewhere the word is used either of any park or garden or to recall that first garden, the garden of Eden.

Life and Death in the Hebrew bible

While it may be surprising that the word paradise is used so rarely in the Hebrew bible and Septuagint to refer to future hope, the lack of connection to belief about life after death is unsurprising. This is because ideas about life after death only really emerged right at the end of the Hebrew bible. Until the second century BCE, there is little evidence of a belief in any kind of future after death. The best that could be hoped for was a good death. A good death involved dying only after a long life, leaving behind a son (preferably more than one) and a decent burial.¹² It is commonly believed by scholars that 'Sheol' is the abode of the dead in Hebrew bible and that it is occupied both by the good and the bad.¹³

There are a few exceptions to the general rule about death in the Hebrew bible. The most interesting cases in the early period are descriptions of those who somehow escaped death entirely. These are the famous cases of Enoch, who was no more because God took him,¹⁴ and Elijah who was caught up to heaven in a chariot of fire.¹⁵ Other exceptions talk about the dead regaining life,¹⁶ and are not so much describing life after death as a bringing back to life of the recently expired. This is something entirely different as they would still expect to die again at some point in the future.

Only two passages in the Hebrew bible refer to personal resurrection: Isaiah 26:19 and Daniel 12:1-3.¹⁷ The Isaiah verse ('Your dead shall live, their corpses shall rise. O dwellers in the dust, awake and sing for joy!', 26:19) poses various problems. To begin with the Hebrew is unclear and could be translated 'May your dead live', which would have a different connotation. Furthermore, it is unclear whether, like other prophets such as Hosea and Ezekiel,¹⁸ the author is referring to the nation being dead and about to be restored, or to the resurrection of certain individuals.¹⁹ It is only if this verse is interpreted as definite ('Your dead will live') and referring to individuals that this passage can be included in a discussion about life after death.

Much less problematic is the reference to resurrection in Daniel.

Daniel 12:1-3 describes the awakening of those who sleep in the dust of the earth, some to everlasting life and some to everlasting disgrace. This passage clearly concerns individual resurrection and a different fate for the righteous to that of the wicked.²⁰ It is unclear, however, whether this resurrection will be bodily or not, nor where the righteous will go after they are raised. Thus it is impossible to tell whether the author of the book of Daniel has in mind any specific location for the righteous, either that of Paradise or of anywhere else.

Life after death in Second Temple Judaism

It is only in the post-biblical period that ideas about life after death begin to emerge more fully. Although there are only a few references to an existence beyond the grave in the Hebrew Bible itself, by the end of the first century CE such a belief had become so common that Josephus used it to differentiate one sect from another. Thus he states that both the Pharisees and the Essenes believed in the 'immortality of souls', whereas the Sadducees believed that 'souls die with the bodies'.²¹ In fact belief in a continued existence after death was very much more complex than Josephus allows. The only major characteristic of beliefs in this period is that of variety.

On the whole, the beliefs can be split into four major types. The first consists of those, like the Sadducees who do not believe in life after death at all. The second, like Daniel, believe that the dead remain without judgement until a final climactic event when they will be raised and judged then as righteous or wicked.²² The third type believes that judgement takes place immediately upon death and remains in place for eternity,²³ and the fourth type that judgement takes place immediately upon death but remains in place temporarily and after this limited period has expired the righteous will receive their reward.²⁴ A further variety exists over belief about physical resurrection as opposed to spiritual resurrection. Those that believe in a final climactic event (the second and fourth types) differ over whether resurrection will be bodily or not. Some are clear that a resurrection will take place involving the body;²⁵ others are clear that it will be spiritual;²⁶ others still do not make it clear in either direction.²⁷

Paradise in Second Temple Judaism

Ideas about paradise in Second Temple Judaism are equally diverse. There is little agreement within them either about who will enter it and when, or about where it is. Texts variously describe Paradise as being on the earth, in the East, the North, the Northwest or the West,

or in heaven sometimes in the third heaven and sometimes elsewhere. One text, the Apocalypse of Moses, even has an earthly and a heavenly paradise. The texts about Paradise are so diverse that it is only possible to sketch out the most important texts here. If we attempt to organise the many different ideas about Paradise, three major themes emerge: Paradise as the Garden of Eden, Paradise as a place to visit during ascent into heaven and Paradise as the resting place of the righteous.

The first type of belief is clearly a development of the Hebrew bible association of Paradise with gardens in general and the Garden of Eden in particular. Hardly surprisingly, the texts that make this connection are generally early. In the Book of the Watchers in 1 Enoch, commonly dated to the 3rd – 2nd centuries BCE,²⁸ Enoch is taken to visit a beautiful garden by his angel guide. The description of what he sees is clearly the biblical Garden of Eden, though it is not called Paradise (1 Enoch 32:1–6)²⁹. Elsewhere in the book, the tree of life is also described and its fruit declared to be forbidden to all but the elect who may eat it after the day of judgement (1 Enoch 25:4). Most interesting of all is the fact that during Enoch's travels he is also taken to see the souls of the dead, who do not dwell in the Garden of Eden but somewhere else entirely. Thus while 1 Enoch believes in life after death he does not associate it with the Garden of Eden.

This 1 Enoch passage also points to a second theme in traditions about Paradise and that is the fact that that it is possible for human beings to ascend to heaven and visit Paradise before their death. Enoch is reported to have done so in the passage just mentioned. Enoch also visits Paradise in 2 Enoch, an unconnected text probably from around the end of the first century CE.³⁰ In this text (2 Enoch 9–10) Paradise, which is located in the third heaven, is clearly designated as the final destination of the righteous after the day of judgement: 'This place has been prepared Enoch, for the righteous...for them this <place> has been prepared as an eternal inheritance'.³¹ Paradise is contrasted with 'a very frightful place', where there is 'every kind of torture and torment'. Here Paradise and its counterpart, also located in the third heaven, are prepared and waiting for future occupants.

Another later account, 'the four who entered Pardes', which occurs six times in Talmudic and Hekhalot literature, features a visit to heaven by four Rabbis.³² Though here the account emphasises the danger inherent in such a visit. One went in and came out unharmed; the other three did not. Of those three one looked and died; one looked and was struck and one looked and cut the plants.³³ It seems

likely that this text was influenced by the notion of the garden of Eden being protected against interlopers, though notice that one Rabbi did indeed succeed in entering and leaving *Pardes* again with impunity.³⁴ No mention is made here of anyone else dwelling in *Pardes*. It seems likely, therefore, that this passages like those of 1 and 2 Enoch regard Paradise as occupied again only after the day of judgement.

This view is confirmed by some texts that also refer to Paradise as the final location of the righteous. The Testament of Levi, commonly dated to around the 2nd century BCE, says:

And he shall open the gates of Paradise; he shall remove the sword that has threatened since Adam, and he will grant to the saints to eat of the tree of life (Testament of Levi 18:10)³⁵

This re-opening of Paradise will take place, as in 1 Enoch, on the day of judgement. Here Paradise is not the dwelling place of the righteous after death. Instead it offers eschatological hope of eternal life, on the day of judgement the righteous will gain access to the garden which has been guarded since Adam and Eve's expulsion and be allowed to eat from the tree of life. A similar idea can also be found elsewhere. In 4 Ezra 7:36 Paradise and its counterpart, Gehenna, will be the location for both the righteous and the wicked after the day of judgement. Indeed in 8:52, 4 Ezra also refers to the re-opening of Paradise.³⁶ Those who visit Paradise during their lifetime, therefore, visit an empty and closed up garden which awaits the righteous after the final judgement.

It is only a short step from here to the belief that the Garden of Eden was open to special people before the last judgement. Indeed this view can also be found in relatively early texts. For example the book of Jubilees, often dated to around the 2nd century BCE, describes what happened to Enoch after God took him:

And he [Enoch] was taken from among the children of men, and we led him to the Garden of Eden for greatness and honour. And behold he is there writing condemnation and judgement of the world. (Jubilees 4:23)³⁷.

Rather surprisingly from a Christian perspective, one view stands out as less common than all the others and this is that Paradise is the location of the righteous immediately after death and before the day of judgement. Few texts maintain this position with any level of

clarity. On of these is the Testament of Abraham 20, dated to around the end of the 1st Christian century. At the end of the text God commands the angels to take Abraham, 'to Paradise where are the tents of my righteous ones and the resting places of my saints...'.³⁸

Concluding Remarks

If we attempt to draw some conclusions from this variety of attitudes to Paradise, a few pointers emerge. It is possible to trace how ideas about Paradise evolved. References to paradise began simply as references to gardens in general. From there the word became particularly associated with one notable garden, the Garden of Eden. As beliefs about life after death developed, they became attached in certain circles to a belief that it would be possible to re-enter Eden after the day of judgement to eat of the fruit of the tree of life and hence gain immortality. Associated with this was a belief that the righteous could stay in Paradise and that the wicked would remain in Gehenna, Paradise's counterpart. In very rare cases, people also believed that the righteous went straight to Paradise immediately after death. Some texts also believed that it was possible for human figures to visit Paradise during an ascent to heaven. However, Paradise is not the sole image for beliefs about life after death, other images exist which locate the righteous elsewhere either before or after the time of judgement.

Of those texts that do contain the image of Paradise, most contain only a partial representation. In no text does a complete picture emerge. The texts are not systematic and resist organisation. Any attempt to organise them involves imposing an alien framework upon them. The strongest characteristic of beliefs about paradise is vagueness. Texts appear almost deliberately opaque, sometimes even self-contradictory, as if the aim is to be impressionistic rather than exact. In fact it is this position that, more than anything else, helps us to understand the New Testament texts with which we started. Each one of these texts contains a theme that occurs in other second temple texts about Paradise. 2 Corinthians 12 refers to the tradition that it is possible for a human figure to visit Paradise during an ascent into heaven. Revelation 2, refers to the tradition about the re-opening of Paradise so that the righteous can eat of the fruit of the Tree of Life and live for ever. The book does not, however, seem to think that they will remain there. Instead, they will worship before the throne of God.

Luke 23 appears to be another rare example, alongside the Testament of Abraham, which believes that it is possible to go to Paradise immediately after death and before judgement. Or does it?

One of the striking features of this passage is that it is not a righteous person who will be going to Paradise but a convicted thief. It is not the thief's righteousness, but the fact that Jesus declares him to be going to Paradise that ensures his future after death. In this case judgement has already taken place and perhaps enabled Paradise to be re-opened before time.

Beliefs about Paradise in second temple Judaism are fragmentary and at times contradictory. New Testament texts are similarly fragmentary, presenting single strands of belief but never the whole picture. References to Paradise are opaque and unresolved and perhaps this can provide the key for our own ruminations on the subject. Life after death and Paradise are concepts so far beyond our finite, mortal understanding that impressionistic, sometimes contradictory views of them are the only ones that will suffice.

Works Cited

- Anderson, F.I.** "2 (Slavonic Apocalypse of) Enoch." In *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by J.H. Charlesworth, Vol. 1, 90-221. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Collins, John J.** *Apocalypticism in the Dead Sea Scrolls*. London: Routledge, 1997.
- Evans, Christopher.** *Saint Luke*. London: SCM Press, 1990.
- Harris, R.L.** "Sheol." In *Theological Wordbook of the Old Testament*, edited by R. L. Harris, G. L. Archer and B. K. Waltke, 892-893. Chicago, 1980.
- Isaac, E.** "1 (Ethiopic Apocalypse of) Enoch." In *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by J.H. Charlesworth, 13-89. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Jeremias, Joachim.** "Paradeisos." In *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*, edited by Gerhard Friedrich, 765-773. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1967.
- Kee, H.C.** "Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs." In *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by J.H. Charlesworth, Vol. 1, 788-795. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Lincoln, Andrew T.** *Paradise Now and Not Yet. Studies in the Role of the Heavenly Dimension in Paul's Thought with Special Reference to His Eschatology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Martinez, F.G.** *The Dead Sea Scrolls Translated. The Qumran Texts in English*. E.J. Brill: Leiden, 1994.
- Maunder, A.S.** "The Date and Place of Writing of the Slavonic Book of Enoch." *The Observatory* 41 (1918): 309-316.
- Metzger, B.M.** "The Fourth Book of Ezra." In *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by J.H. Charlesworth, Vol. 1, 517-559. New York: Doubleday, 1983.
- Murray-Jones, C.R.A.** "Paradise Revisited (2 Cor. 12:1-12): The Jewish Mystical Background of Paul's Apostolate." *Harvard Theological Review*

86 (1993): 177-217, 265-192.

Nickelsburg, G.W. *Resurrection, Immortality and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism*. Harvard: Cambridge University Press, 1972.

Nickelsburg, G.W.E. *Jewish Literature between the Bible and the Mishnah. A Historical and Literary Introduction*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981.

Tigay, J.H., and B.J. Bamberger. "Paradise." In *Encyclopedia Judaica*, Vol. 13, 78-86. Jerusalem: Keter Publishing, 1971.

Turner, N. "The Testament of Abraham." In *The Apocryphal Old Testament*, edited by H.D.F. Sparks, 393-421. Oxford: Clarendon, 1984.

Wintermute, O.S. "Jubilees." In *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, edited by J.H. Charlesworth, Vol. 2, 35-155. New York: Doubleday, 1985.

- 1 This study will restrict itself to references about paradise. There are numerous passages, such as the parable commonly called 'Dives and Lazarus' (Luke 16:19-31), which contain visions of what happens to people after they die. While these passages are undoubtedly important for building up a complete picture of beliefs about life after death, they do not mention the word paradise and so will not be explored here. The concept of life after death will be explored only as a background for ideas about paradise in the second temple period. The study of the concept will not be exhaustive, as this is not the primary concern of the paper.
- 2 See for example Andrew T. Lincoln, *Paradise Now and Not Yet. Studies in the Role of the Heavenly Dimension in Paul's Thought with Special Reference to His Eschatology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981) 176.
- 3 See for example Joachim Jeremias, "Paradeisos," in *Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*, ed. Gerhard Friedrich (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1967), 765-766.; J.H. Tigay and B.J. Bamberger, "Paradise," in *Encyclopedia Judaica* (Jerusalem: Keter Publishing, 1971), 78; Christopher Evans, *Saint Luke* (London: SCM Press, 1990) 873-874.
- 4 In particular from Avestan, see Jeremias, "Paradeisos," 765.
- 5 Xenophon (c. 428-354 BCE).
- 6 c.f. Susanna 4, 7, 15, 17, 18, 20, 25, 26, 36, 38, 54.
- 7 c.f. Ben Sirach 24:30
- 8 c.f. Jeremiah 29:5 and also Numbers 24:6; 2 Chronicles 33:20 and Isaiah 1:30
- 9 c.f. Genesis 2:8; 2:9; 2:10; 2:15; 2:16; 3:1; 3:2; 3:3; 3:8; 3:8; 3:10; 3:23; 3:24, 13:10; Joel 2:3
- 10 Elsewhere in Ezekiel (31:8-9), Egypt is compared favourably to the trees in the garden of Eden but here no mention of either the Tree of the Knowledge of Good and Evil or of the Tree of Life is made.
- 11 Jeremias, "Paradeisos," cols. 37-41.
- 12 For evidence of these beliefs see Genesis 15:15 and Psalm 128:1-6.
- 13 Although in recent years scholars such as R.L. Harris have argued that Sheol was not the place where the dead reside, there seems little reason to accept his argument. See R.L. Harris, "Sheol," in *Theological*

Wordbook of the Old Testament, ed. R. L. Harris, G. L. Archer, and B. K. Waltke (Chicago: 1980).

- 14 Gen. 5:24
- 15 2 Kgs 1:11
- 16 See for example 1 Kgs 17:17–24; 2 Kgs 4:31–37; 2 Kgs 13:20–21
- 17 Though others exist, such as Hosea 6:1–4, which speak of corporate resurrection.
- 18 See Hos. 6:1–3; Eze 37:12.
- 19 Contrast G.W. Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism* (Harvard: Cambridge University Press, 1972) 18. with John J. Collins, *Apocalypticism in the Dead Sea Scrolls* (London: Routledge, 1997) 111.
- 20 It is worth noting that Collins regards this passage as setting out the destiny only of the very good and the very bad. See Collins, *Apocalypticism in the Dead Sea Scrolls* 112.
- 21 Josephus *Antiquities* 18.1.3–5.
- 22 This belief also forms the backdrop to Mat 25:31–46, commonly known as the parable of the sheep and the goats.
- 23 See for example 1QS iv.6–14, where the fate of the righteous is ‘healing, plentiful peace in a long life, fruitful offspring with all everlasting blessings, eternal enjoyment with endless life...’ (7) and the fate of the wicked is ‘a glut of punishment at the hands of all the angels of destruction, for eternal damnation ...’. (translated F.G. Martinez, *The Dead Sea Scrolls Translated. The Qumran Texts in English* (E.J. Brill: Leiden, 1994) 6–7.
- 24 See 4 Ezra 4:35 ‘Did not the souls of the righteous in their chambers ask about these matters, saying, “How long are we to remain here? And when will come the harvest of our reward?”’ (translated B.M. Metzger, “The Fourth Book of Ezra,” in *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, ed. J.H. Charlesworth (New York: Doubleday, 1983), 531.)
- 25 See 2 Maccabees 7, passim but especially vv.9–14: ‘And when he was at his last breath, he said, “You accursed wretch, you dismiss us from this present life, but the King of the universe will raise us up to an everlasting renewal of life, because we have died for his laws.” After him, the third was the victim of their sport. When it was demanded, he quickly put out his tongue and courageously stretched forth his hands,¹¹ and said nobly, “I got these from Heaven, and because of his laws I disdain them, and from him I hope to get them back again.”¹² As a result the king himself and those with him were astonished at the young man’s spirit, for he regarded his sufferings as nothing. After he too had died, they maltreated and tortured the fourth in the same way.¹⁴ When he was near death, he said, “One cannot but choose to die at the hands of mortals and to cherish the hope God gives of being raised again by him. But for you there will be no resurrection to life!”’
- 26 See Jubilees 23:30–31 ‘and the righteous ones will see and rejoice... And their bones will rest in the earth, and their spirits will increase joy’, (translated O.S. Wintermute, “Jubilees,” in *Old Testament*

- Pseudepigrapha*, ed. J.H. Charlesworth (New York: Doubleday, 1985), 102.
- 27 See Daniel 12: 1-3.
 - 28 See discussion in G.W.E. Nickelsburg, *Jewish Literature between the Bible and the Mishnah. A Historical and Literary Introduction* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981) 48.
 - 29 Translation in E Isaac, "1 (Ethiopic Apocalypse of) Enoch," in *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, ed. J.H. Charlesworth (New York: Doubleday, 1983).
 - 30 Though this text may be considerably later than this. Some scholars such as A.S. Maunder have argued that the text was only written in the 11th–12th centuries CE, though few today accept such a late date as this. See A.S. Maunder, "The Date and Place of Writing of the Slavonic Book of Enoch.," *The Observatory* 41 (1918): 309-316.
 - 31 Translation in F.I. Anderson, "2 (Slavonic Apocalypse of) Enoch," in *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, ed. J.H. Charlesworth (New York: Doubleday, 1983), 119.
 - 32 This story occurs four times in the Talmud and twice in the Hekhalot literature: *Babylonian Hagigah* 14b; *Jerusalem Hagigah* 77b; *Tosefta Hagigah* 2.3-4; *Shir ha Shirim Rabbah* 1.4, *Hekhalot Zutarti* (§§338-346) and *Merkavah Rabbah* (§§671-673).
 - 33 For an explanation of what these odd afflictions may connote see C.R.A. Morray-Jones, "Paradise Revisited (2 Cor. 12:1-12): The Jewish Mystical Background of Paul's Apostolate.," *Harvard Theological Review* 86 (1993): 177-217, 265-192.
 - 34 Pardes may mean simply garden here, rather than Paradise and for this reason I have left it un-translated.
 - 35 Translation in Anderson, "2 (Slavonic Apocalypse of) Enoch.," H.C. Kce, "Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs," in *Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, ed. J.H. Charlesworth (New York: Doubleday, 1983), 795.
 - 36 Elsewhere in 4 Ezra the righteous are described as being 'in the chambers of the righteous' (4:35) from which they will escape on the day of judgement. Paradise is only entered after judgement day.
 - 37 Translation in Wintermute, "Jubilees," 62-63.
 - 38 Translation in N. Turner, "The Testament of Abraham," in *The Apocryphal Old Testament*, ed. H.D.F. Sparks (Oxford: Clarendon, 1984).