

The  
Journal  
of  
Ecclesiastical  
History

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# The Journal of Ecclesiastical History

## *Editors*

James Carleton Paget, University of Cambridge  
Diarmaid MacCulloch, University of Oxford

## *Assistant Editor*

Christine Linehan, Cambridge

## *Advisory Editorial Board*

David Bebbington, *University of Stirling*  
Michael Bourdeaux, *Keston Institute, Oxford*  
Martin Brett, *University of Cambridge*  
Euan Cameron, *Union Theological Seminary, New York*  
Richard Carwardine, *University of Oxford*  
W. O. Chadwick, *University of Cambridge*  
Gillian Clark, *University of Bristol*  
Patrick Collinson, *University of Cambridge*  
R. B. Dobson, *University of York*  
Eamon Duffy, *University of Cambridge*  
Judith Herrin, *Kings College, London*

Simon Keynes, *University of Cambridge*  
Peter Linehan, *University of Cambridge*  
David Maxwell, *University of Cambridge*  
Rosamond McKitterick, *University of Cambridge*  
Hugh McLeod, *University of Birmingham*  
J. S. C. Riley-Smith, *University of Cambridge*  
W. J. Sheils, *University of York*  
Pauline Stafford, *University of Liverpool*  
W. R. Ward, *Hampshire*  
Frances Young, *University of Birmingham*  
Patrick Zutshi, *University of Cambridge*

## *International Advisory Board*

J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu, *Trinity College,  
Legon, Ghana*  
Elizabeth Clark, *Duke University, USA*  
Giles Constable, *Institute for Advanced Study,  
Princeton, USA*  
Sergei Filatov, *Institute of Eastern Studies, Moscow,  
Russia*  
Clara García Ayuardo, *Centro de Investigación y  
Docencia Económicas, Mexico City, Mexico*  
Jean-Philippe Genet, *Université Paris I, France*  
David Hilliard, *Flinders University, Australia*

Dominique Iogna-Prat, *Centre d'Études  
Médiévales, Paris, France*  
Susan Karant-Nunn, *University of Arizona, USA*  
Peter Lake, *Princeton University, USA*  
Hartmut Lehmann, *Max-Planck-Institut für  
Geschichte, Göttingen, Germany*  
Harry O. Maier, *Vancouver School of Theology,  
Canada*  
Claudia Rapp, *University of California, USA*  
André Vauchez, *École Française de Rome, Italy*

Contributions and books for review should be addressed to the Editors, *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, Robinson College, Cambridge CB3 9AN, UK; e-mail [jeh@robinson.cam.ac.uk](mailto:jeh@robinson.cam.ac.uk). The *Journal* normally expects articles to be not longer than eight thousand words, inclusive of endnotes; this represents a maximum of 33–5 pages of published text and 40–5 pages of an average double-spaced A4 typescript. A copy of the *Journal's* style sheet will be sent to intending contributors on application to the Editors.

## **Subscriptions**

*The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* (ISSN 0022-0469) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press in January, April, July and October. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes delivery by air where appropriate, plus electronic access to institutional subscribers (but excluding VAT) of volume 62 in 2011 is £309 (US \$533 in USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; the print only price for institutions is £284 (US\$489) and £69 (US \$125) for individuals ordering direct from the publishers and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £78 net (US \$134 in USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. The electronic only price available to institutional subscribers is £261 (\$450 in USA, Canada and Mexico). EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered members should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 10994–2133. Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: send address changes in USA, Canada and Mexico to *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 10994–2133.

# THE JOURNAL OF ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY

Volume 62 Number 1

January 2011

## Contents

### ARTICLES

|   |    |
|---|----|
| THE EUSEBIUS ESSAY PRIZE  | 1  |
| PETER ABELARD, HELOISE AND JEWISH BIBLICAL EXEGESIS IN THE TWELFTH CENTURY:<br>BY CONSTANT J. MEWS AND MICHA J. PERRY               | 3  |
| STANDING STILL OR RUNNING ON? RECONSIDERING RHETORIC IN THE STRASBOURG<br>ANABAPTIST–SPIRITUALIST DEBATES, 1530–1531: BY PAUL BRAND | 20 |
| THE MAKING OF ABIEZER COPPE: BY ARIEL HESSAYON  | 38 |
| THE SECULARISATION OF SIN IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY: BY DOMINIC ERDOZAIN  | 59 |
| VATICAN INVOLVEMENT IN THE IRISH CIVIL WAR: MONSIGNOR SALVATORE LUZIO'S<br>APOSTOLIC DELEGATION, MARCH–MAY 1923: BY M. P. McCABE    | 89 |

### REVIEW ARTICLE

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| CONCORD AND CONFLICT: SCRIPTURE and NATURE IN THE ABRAHAMIC RELIGIONS:<br>BY NICHOLAS KEENE | 107 |
|---|-----|

### THEOLOGIAN REVISITED

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| ALBERT SCHWEITZER: BY JAMES CARLETON PAGET | 113 |
|--|-----|

### REVIEWS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| TOSCANO, <i>Fanaticism. On the uses of an idea</i> : by David Martin   | 132 |
| KESSLER and WALLRAFF (eds), <i>Biblische Theologie und historisches Denken. Wissenschaftsgeschichtliche Studien. Aus Anlass der 50. Wiederkehr der Basler promotion von Rudolf Smend</i> : by John Barton  | 133 |
| GUIVER, <i>Vision upon vision. Processes of change and renewal in Christian worship</i> : by Bryan D. Spinks   | 133 |
| HOVHANESSIAN (ed.), <i>The Old Testament as authoritative Scripture in the early Churches of the east</i> : by Lionel Wickham  | 134 |
| SACHS, <i>Homosexuality and the crisis of Anglicanism</i> : by Diarmaid MacCulloch   | 135 |
| NASRALLAH, <i>Christian responses to Roman art and architecture. The second-century Church amid the spaces of empire</i> : by James Carleton Paget   | 136 |
| BERNARDINO, <i>Un solo battesimo una sola chiesa. Il concilio di Cartagine del settembre 256</i> : by Allen Brent  | 140 |
| SCHOTT, <i>Christianity, empire, and the making of religion in late antiquity</i> : by Richard Lim   | 141 |
| CANER, <i>History and hagiography from the late antique Sinai. Including translations of Pseudo-Nilus' Narrations, Ammonius' Report on the slaughter of the monks of Sinai and Rhaitou, and Anastasius of Sinai's Tales of the Sinai Fathers</i> : by John Chryssavgis                                       | 142 |
| GREGORY OF NYSSA (Greek text JAEGER, trans. and notes WINLING), <i>Contre Eunome, I: 1–146</i> ; Radde-Gallwitz, <i>Basil of Caesarea, Gregory of Nyssa, and the transformation of divine simplicity</i> ; Corrigan, <i>Evagrius and Gregory. Mind, soul and body in the 4th century</i> : by Lionel Wickham | 143 |

ii CONTENTS

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| CROGRIEZ-PÉTREQUIN and JAILLETTE (eds), <i>Le Code théodosien. Diversité des approches et nouvelles perspectives</i> : by A. J. B. Sirks  | 145 |
| SCHECK, <i>Reform and resistance. Formations of female subjectivity in early medieval ecclesiastical culture</i> : by Marie-Luise Ehrenscheidtner                                       | 146 |
| MAZEL (ed.), <i>L'Espace du diocèse. Genèse d'un territoire dans l'occident médiéval (Ve–XIIIe siècle)</i> : by Julia Barrow  | 147 |
| FÖRSTEL, <i>Schriften zum Islam von Arethas und Euthymios Zīgabenos und Fragmente der griechischen Koranübersetzung</i> : by Jonathan Shepard   | 148 |
| RABAN MAUR and CLAUDE DE TURIN (Latin text COLVENER and DOUGLAS, trans. and notes MONAT), <i>Deux Commentaires sur le Livre de Ruth</i> : by Aidan Breen                                | 149 |
| HEIDECKER, <i>The divorce of Lothar II. Christian marriage and political power in the Carolingian world</i> : by James A. Brundage  | 150 |
| BULTOT-VERLEYSEN (ed.), <i>Ordon de Cluny. Vita sancti Geraldii Auriliacensis. Édition critique, traduction française, introduction et commentaires</i> : by Scott G. Bruce             | 151 |
| BALE (ed.), <i>Edmund, king and martyr. Changing images of a medieval saint</i> ; MORTIMER (ed.), <i>Edward the Confessor. The man and the legend</i> : by Brian Golding                | 151 |
| COTTS, <i>The clerical dilemma. Peter of Blois and literate culture in the twelfth century</i> : by John W. Baldwin   | 153 |
| ROREM, <i>Hugh of Saint Victor</i> : by Constant J. Mews  | 154 |
| FERRELL, <i>The Bible and the people</i> : by Patrick J. O'Banion   | 155 |
| RILEY-SMITH, <i>Templars and Hospitallers as professed religious in the Holy Land</i> : by Anthony Luttrell   | 156 |
| BARROW (ed.), <i>English Episcopal Acta, XXXV: Hereford, 1234–1275</i> : by Katherine Harvey  | 157 |
| COOPER-ROMPATO, <i>The gift of tongues. Women's xenoglossia in the later Middle Ages</i> : by Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski  | 158 |
| BLYTHE, <i>The worldview and thought of Tolomeo Fiadoni (Ptolomey of Lucca)</i> ; BLYTHE, <i>The life and works of Tolomeo Fiadoni (Ptolomey of Lucca)</i> : by Mary Elizabeth Sullivan | 158 |
| OPAČIĆ (ed.), <i>Prague and Bohemia. Medieval art, architecture and cultural exchange in central Europe</i> : by Gervase Rosser   | 159 |
| MILLET, <i>L'Église du Grand Schisme, 1378–1417</i> : by P. N. R. Zutshi  | 160 |
| BLUM, <i>Philosophy of religion in the Renaissance</i> : by Paul Helm   | 161 |
| DOMPNIER and VISMARA (eds), <i>Confréries et dévotions dans la catholicité moderne (mi-XVe–début XIXe siècle)</i> : by Anne-Laure Van Bruaene   | 162 |
| FITCH, <i>The search for salvation. Lay faith in Scotland, 1480–1560</i> : by Steven John Reid  | 164 |
| GRIBBEN and MULLAN (eds), <i>Literature and the Scottish Reformation</i> : by Jane Dawson   | 165 |
| FRANÇOIS and DEN HOLLANDER (eds), <i>Infant milk or hardy nourishment? The Bible for lay people and theologians in the early modern period</i> : by Alastair Hamilton                   | 166 |
| GREEN, <i>Humanism and Protestantism in early modern English education</i> : by Jonathan Woolfson   | 167 |
| WHITFORD, <i>The curse of Ham in the early modern era. The Bible and the justifications for slavery</i> : by Colin Kidd   | 168 |
| PAK, <i>The Judaizing Calvin. Sixteenth-century debates over the Messianic Psalms</i> : by Jon Balsarak   | 169 |
| ARNOLD (ed.), <i>Johannes Sturm (1507–1589)</i> : by Karin Maag   | 169 |
| QUITSLUND, <i>The Reformation in rhyme. Sternhold, Hopkins and the English metrical psalter, 1547–1603</i> : by Christopher Marsh   | 170 |
| KASL (ed.), <i>Sacred Spain. Art and belief in the Spanish world</i> : by J. H. Elliott   | 171 |
| ARNOLD, <i>Die römische Zensur der Werke Cajetans und Contarinis (1558–1601). Grenzen der theologischen Konfessionalisierung</i> : by Patrick Preston                                   | 172 |
| VALENTE, <i>Contro l'inquisizione. Il dibattito europeo sec. XVI–XVIII</i> : by Christopher F. Black  | 174 |
| KOLB (ed.), <i>Lutheran ecclesiastical culture, 1550–1675</i> : by Andrew Pettegree   | 175 |
| KESS, <i>Johann Sleidan and the Protestant vision of history</i> : by Howard Louthan  | 177 |
| BARRATT, <i>Anne Bulkeley and her book. Fashioning female piety in early Tudor England. A study of London, British Library, MS Harley 494</i> : by Susan Wabuda                         | 178 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| MARSHALL and SCOTT (eds), <i>Catholic gentry in English society. The Throckmorton of Coughton from Reformation to emancipation</i> : by Joy Rowe   | 178 |
| COFFEY and LIM (eds), <i>The Cambridge companion to Puritanism</i> : by Nicholas Tyacke  | 179 |
| BERGIN, <i>Church, society and religious change in France, 1580–1730</i> : by Mack P. Holt   | 181 |
| PARKER, <i>Faith on the margins. Catholics and Catholicism in the Dutch Golden Age</i> : by Judith Pollmann  | 183 |
| CORNS, HUGHES and LOEWENSTEIN (eds), <i>The complete works of Gerrard Winstanley</i> : by William Lamont   | 184 |
| ROSS (ed.), <i>The works of Thomas Traherne, II: Commentaries of heaven, 1: Abhorrence to alone; III: Commentaries of heaven, II: Al-sufficient to bastard; IV: Church's year-book. A serious and pathetic contemplation of the mercies of God. (Meditations on the creation)</i> : by Denise Inge | 186 |
| HUNTER, <i>Boyle. Between God and science</i> : by Margaret J. Osler   | 188 |
| GILLET, <i>Étienne Baluze and l'histoire du Limousin. Desseins et pratiques d'un érudit du XVIIe siècle</i> : by Robert Somerville   | 188 |
| CORNWALL and GIBSON (eds), <i>Religion, politics and dissent, 1660–1832. Essays in honour of James E. Bradley</i> : by Alan P. F. Sell   | 189 |
| DUNCAN (ed.), <i>Religion in the age of reason. A transatlantic study of the long eighteenth century</i> : by Sarah Apetrei  | 191 |
| BALMER, <i>The making of Evangelicalism. From revivalism to politics and beyond</i> : by Douglas A. Sweeney  | 192 |
| DE NIET, PAUL and WALLET (eds), <i>Sober, strict, and scriptural. Collective memories of John Calvin, 1800–2000</i> : by John W. de Gruchy   | 192 |
| BLAUFUSS (ed.), <i>Wilhelm Löhe. Erbe und Vision. Loehe theological conference II. Neuendettelsau 22. Bis 26. Juli 2008</i> : by Mark Mattes   | 193 |
| KNIGHT, <i>The Church in the nineteenth century</i> : by John Wolffé   | 194 |
| GREENE, <i>Bodies like bright stars. Saints and relics in Orthodox Russia</i> : by Xenia Dennen  | 195 |
| SCHOLÉS, <i>The Church of Ireland and the Third Home Rule bill</i> : by T. C. Barnard  | 196 |
| HEATH, <i>A war with a silver lining. Canadian Protestant Churches and the South African war, 1899–1902</i> : by Sandra Beardsall  | 196 |
| MAIDEN, <i>National religion and the Prayer Book controversy, 1927–1928</i> : by Donald Gray   | 197 |
| NOEL, <i>Pius XII. The hound of Hitler</i> : by Martin Bull  | 198 |
| FIMISTER, <i>Robert Schuman. Neo-scholastic humanism and the reunification of Europe</i> : by James Chappel  | 199 |
| LEUSTEAN (ed.), <i>Eastern Christianity and the Cold War, 1945–9</i> : by R. J. Crampton   | 200 |
| MOLNAR, <i>Thomas F. Torrance. Theologian of the Trinity</i> : by Stephen Hampton  | 201 |
| KUHN, <i>Prophetic Christianity in western Kenya. Political, cultural and theological aspects of African independent Churches</i> : by J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu  | 202 |
| VOKES, <i>Ghosts of Kanungu. Fertility, secrecy and exchange in the great lakes of East Africa</i> : by J. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu   | 203 |
| BOOKS RECEIVED   | 205 |

## AUTHORS' ADDRESSES

- Dr Paul Brand, School of Social, Historical and Literary Studies, University of Portsmouth, Milldam, Burnaby Road, Portsmouth PO1 3AS; e-mail: paul.brand@port.ac.uk
- Dr James Carleton Paget, Peterhouse, Cambridge CB2 1RD; e-mail: jncp1@cam.ac.uk
- Dr Dominic Erdozain, Department of Theology and Religious Studies, King's College, London, Strand, London WC2R 2LS; e-mail: dominic.erdozain@kcl.ac.uk

- Dr Ariel Hessayon, Department of History, Goldsmiths College, University of London, New Cross, London SE14 6NW; e-mail: a.hessayon@gold.ac.uk
- Dr Nicholas Keene, 1 Upper Cottages, Southstoke, Bath BA2 7DR; e-mail: nicholas.keene@btinternet.com
- Dr M. P. McCabe, Hertford College, Oxford, OX1 3BW; e-mail: Michael.mccabe@hertford.oxon.org
- Professor Constant J. Mews, School of Historical Studies, Monash University, Bldg 11, Clayton Campus, Wellington Road, Clayton, VIC 3800, Australia; e-mail: constant.mews@arts.monash.edu.au
- Dr Micha J. Perry, The Program for Judaic Studies, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA; e-mail: micha.perry@yale.edu